

New York State Bar Association

One Elk Street, Albany, New York 12207 • 518/463-3200 • http://www.nysba.org

TAX SECTION

2003-2004 Executive Committee

ANDREW N. BERG

Chair Debevoise & Plimpton 919 Third Avenue New York, NY 10022 212/900-8288 LEWIS R. STEINBERG

212/474-1856 DAVID P. HARITON

Second Vice-Chair 212/558-4248 KIMBERLY S. BLANCHARD

Secretary 212/310-8799

COMMITTEE CHAIRS: Bankruptcy and Operating Losses Lawrence M. Garrett Stuart J. Goldring

Compliance, Practice & Procedure

Ellis W. Reemer Bryan G. Skarlatos Consolidated Returns Karen Gilbreath Jonathan Kushner

Corporations Kathleen L. Ferreil Jod J. Schwartz **Employee Benefits**

Karen G. Krueger Max J. Schwartz **Estates and Trusts**

T. Randolph Harris Jeffrey N. Schwartz Financial Instruments Michael S. Farber Erika W. Nijenhuis

Financial Intermediaries David M. Schizer Andrew P. Solomon Foreign Activities of U.S.

Taxpayers

Peter H. Blessing David R. Sicular Multistate Tax Issues Robert E. Brown Paul R. Comeau

New York City Taxes Robert J. Levinschn Irwin M. Slomka

New York State Franchise and

Income Taxes

Maria T. Jones Arthur R. Rosen Partnerships William B. Brannan

David H. Schnabel Pass-Through Entitles Patrick C. Gallagher

Gary B. Mandel Real Property David E. Kahen Elliot Pisem

Reorganizations Andrew R. Walker Diana L. Wolfman

Securitizations and Structured Finance

David S. Millier Paul R. Wysocki Tax Accounting David W. Mayo Marc L. Silberberg Tax Exempt Bonds Stuart L. Rosow John T. Lutz Tax Exempt Entitles

Dickson G. Brown Michelle P. Scott U.S. Activities of Foreign

Taxpayers Gary M. Friedman Yaron Z. Reich

MEMBERS-AT-LARGE OF EXECUTIVE COMMITTEE

Edward E. Gonzalez Alvese Grossman Sherwin Kamin Amold Y. Kapiloff

Barbara T. Kaplan Charles I. Kingson Janet B. Korins Sherry S. Kraus

Jiyeon Lee-Lim Charles Morgan Andrew W. Needham Deborah L. Paul

Matthew A. Rosen Soth I. Rosen Joel Scharfstein Linda Z. Swartz

Gordon Warnke David F. Watts Victor Zonana

October 23, 2003

The Honorable Pamela F. Olson Assistant Secretary (Tax Policy) Department of the Treasury Room 3120 MT 1500 Pennsylvania Avenue, N.W. Washington, D.C. 20220

Mark W. Everson Commissioner Internal Revenue Service Room 3000 IR 1111 Constitution Avenue, N.W. Washington, D.C. 20224

Dear Assistant Secretary Olson and Commissioner Everson:

I am pleased to submit the New York State Bar Association Tax Section's Report No. 1042, providing recommendations for analyzing the issuance and exchange of stock subject to restriction under Section 83 in corporate reorganization transactions. We address principally the basic question of how such stock should count for purposes of determining whether a transaction qualifies as a reorganization.

The principal source of confusion in the area results from the provision of Section 83 that treats restricted stock as not having been issued to the employee/shareholder for compensation purposes, notwithstanding that such stock has in fact been issued and is treated as owned by the employee/shareholder for state law purposes. Because restricted stock is often present in corporate combinations and it is important to have certainty as to the tax characterization of transactions, we believe it is in the best interest of

FORMER CHAIRS OF SECTION:

Samuel Brodsky Edwin M. Jones Peter Miller John E. Morrissey, Jr. Charles E. Heming Ralph O. Winger Martin D. Ginsburg

Peter L. Faber Hon. Renato Beghe Alfred D. Youngwood Gordon D. Henderson David Sachs J. Roger Mentz Willard B. Taylor

Richard J. Hiegel Dale S. Collinson Richard G. Cohen Donald Schapiro Herbert L. Camp William L. Burke Arthur A. Feder

James M. Peasiee John A. Corry Peter C. Canellos Michael L. Schler Carolyn Joy Lee Richard L. Reinhold Richard O. Loengard

Steven C. Todrys Harold R. Handler Robert H. Scarborough Robert A. Jacobs Samuel J. Dimon

tax administration to issue guidance regarding the scope of the open transaction model of Section 83. At the same time, however, we recognize the difficulties in issuing guidance that could have collateral effects on other areas of tax law, and, therefore, as a first step, our proposals are limited to the issues relevant to corporate reorganizations.

Because the owners of restricted stock enjoy the indicia of ownership of such stock, we believe that holders of restricted stock should be viewed as shareholders and owners of the corporation for purposes of characterizing a corporate transaction as a reorganization. Therefore, we recommend that restricted stock that has been transferred within the meaning of Section 83 (i.e., the employee has the beneficial ownership of the stock) should be treated as outstanding and owned by the employee for purposes of characterizing a transaction as a reorganization described in Section 368. If our proposal is adopted, this means that restricted stock would be treated as outstanding for purposes of the continuity of interest rules, application of the Section 368(c) control test, the solely for voting stock requirement, and the treatment of restricted stock as qualifying property and not "boot".

The Tax Section would be pleased to comment further about how restricted stock should be treated as outstanding for purposes of the tax laws more generally. If you find this valuable, or if you would like to discuss the proposals in the Report, please do not hesitate to contact the undersigned.

Respectfully submitted,

Anhe U. By

Andrew N. Berg Chair cc: Eric Solomon, Deputy Assistant Secretary, Regulatory Affairs, Department of Treasury

Helen M. Hubbard, Tax Legislative Counsel, Department of Treasury

William F. Sweetnam, Jr., Benefits Tax Counsel, Department of Treasury

Emily A. Parker, Acting Chief Counsel, Internal Revenue Service

Gary Wilcox, Deputy Chief Counsel (Technical), Internal Revenue Service

William D. Alexander, Associate Chief Counsel (Corporate), Internal Revenue Service