

# **Impasse Resolution Under the Taylor Law**

## **Second Edition**

Philip L. Maier, Esq.

Edited by:

Michael Krauthamer, Esq.

Alyson Mathews, Esq.

## **PREFACE**

This second edition of *Impasse Resolution Under the Taylor Law* provides both an overview and an in-depth discussion of the impasse resolution procedures under the Public Employees' Fair Employment Act, commonly known as the Taylor Law. It incorporates and reviews recent statutory developments such as the property tax cap and amendments to the Act's interest arbitration provisions, as well as recent decisions of interest. It will assist practitioners of all levels of experience by promoting a greater understanding of this important aspect of public sector labor relations. The detailed discussion of the Act's statutory framework and relevant case law provides a useful resource for those active in the field. It will also assist union officers, public employees, governmental officials and interested members of the public in gaining greater insight into this aspect of labor relations.

Philip L. Maier, Esq.

## DETAILED TABLE OF CONTENTS

About the Authors.....	vii
Preface .....	ix
[1.0] I. Introduction .....	1
[1.1] A. Public Employment Relations Board .....	3
[1.2] B. Structure of the Act—Impasse Resolution Procedures .....	4
[1.3] C. Local Options .....	5
[1.4] 1. Mini-PERBs .....	5
[1.5] 2. The New York City Office of Collective Bargaining .....	6
[1.6] D. Section 209-a(1)(e)—Triborough Amendment.....	7
[1.7] E. The Duty to Bargain in Good Faith.....	7
[1.8] 1. Authority of Negotiator.....	12
[1.9] 2. Delay and Evasion.....	13
[1.10] 3. Counterproposals.....	14
[1.11] 4. Conditions to Bargaining .....	15
[1.12] 5. Withdrawal of Agreement.....	15
[1.13] F. Subjects of Bargaining .....	16
[1.14] 1. Mandatory/Nonmandatory/Prohibited .....	17
[1.15] 2. Balancing Approach—Employer Versus Employee Interests .....	17
[1.16] 3. Mandatory Subjects of Bargaining.....	19
[1.17] 4. Nonmandatory Subjects of Bargaining .....	20
[1.18] 5. Prohibited Subjects of Bargaining .....	21
[1.19] 6. The Conversion Theory of Negotiability— Cohoes.....	22
[1.20] G. Role of the Chief Executive Officer and the Legislative Body .....	24
[1.21] H. Ratification.....	30
[1.22] II. Impasse Resolution Procedures Under the Taylor Law .....	30
[1.23] A. Impasse.....	31
[1.24] 1. Premature Impasse Declaration.....	34
[1.25] 2. Introduction of New Subjects to Bargaining After Impasse .....	35
[1.26] 3. Failure to Meet With Mediator .....	36
[1.27] 4. The Mediation Process.....	37
[1.28] a. Appointment of Mediator .....	37
[1.29] b. Role of Mediator.....	38
[1.30] B. Fact-Finding .....	41
[1.31] 1. The Statutory Framework.....	41

[1.32] 2. Nature of the Proceeding.....	42
[1.33] 3. Procedure.....	44
[1.34] 4. Scope of Fact-Finding .....	44
[1.35] a. Improper Practice Charges .....	44
[1.36] b. Declaratory Ruling Petitions .....	47
[1.37] 5. Objections to the Submission of Demands to Fact-Finding .....	48
[1.38] a. Submission of Nonmandatory Subjects of Bargaining to Fact-Finding .....	48
[1.39] b. Point of Insistence .....	49
[1.40] c. Submission of New Matters .....	52
[1.41] d. Matters Previously Agreed .....	53
[1.42] 6. The Fact-Finding Process.....	53
[1.43] 7. Post-Fact-Finding Issues .....	55
[1.44] C. Legislative Imposition.....	56
[1.45] 1. Nature of Proceeding.....	56
[1.46] 2. Legislative Imposition—During Life of the CBA.....	57
[1.47] 3. Statutory Framework.....	58
[1.48] a. Section 209(3)(e) .....	59
[1.49] b. Waiver of Union Rights.....	66
[1.50] c. Duration of Legislative Imposition.....	68
[1.51] 4. Issues After Hearing and Legislative Imposition.....	69
[1.52] D. Interest Arbitration .....	71
[1.53] 1. Nature of the Proceeding.....	71
[1.54] 2. Constitutionality .....	72
[1.55] 3. Interest Arbitration—City of New York Context .....	73
[1.56] 4. Voluntary and Compulsory Interest Arbitration .....	75
[1.57] a. Voluntary Interest Arbitration .....	76
[1.58] b. Compulsory Interest Arbitration.....	77
[1.59] (1) Eligibility for Compulsory Interest Arbitration.....	77
[1.60] (2) Special Interest Arbitration Provisions .....	80
[1.61] c. Metropolitan Transportation Authority and Its Subsidiaries.....	83
[1.62] 5. Rules—Contents of the Petition.....	84
[1.63] E. Processing the Petition .....	86
[1.64] F. Challenging the Submission of Demands to the Panel.....	88
[1.65] 1. Objections to Arbitrability .....	90

[1.66] 2. Nonmandatory Subjects .....	92
[1.67] 3. Introduction of New Demands.....	92
[1.68] 4. Resolved During the Course of Negotiations .....	93
[1.69] G. Conduct Before the Arbitration Panel.....	94
[1.70] 1. Composition of the Panel—Section 209(4)(c)(ii) of the Act.....	94
[1.71] 2. Authority of, and Procedure Before, the Panel—Section 209(4)(c)(iii) of the Act.....	95
[1.72] H. Contents of Awards.....	97
[1.73] 1. Form of the Award .....	97
[1.74] 2. Substance and Criteria of Awards.....	98
[1.75] 3. Executive Sessions .....	102
[1.76] I. Interest Arbitration—City of New York .....	102
[1.77] J. Issuance of Awards—Awards and CBAs .....	103
[1.78] 1. Duration of Awards.....	103
[1.79] 2. Incorporation of Awards .....	103
[1.80] K. Post-Award Issues.....	104
[1.81] 1. Status Quo After Expiration of Award.....	104
[1.82] 2. Review of Interest Arbitration Awards .....	106
Table of Authorities.....	109

## **ABOUT THE AUTHOR**

### **PHILIP L. MAIER, ESQ.**

Philip Maier has been the General Counsel and Director of the New York City Office of Collective Bargaining since October 2012. His responsibilities include supervising a staff of Trial Examiners, holding hearings, providing legal counsel to the Board, and supervising litigation involving the Office of Collective Bargaining. He was the Regional Director of the New York State Public Employment Relations Board's New York City office from 1993 until 2012, having joined the Board as an Administrative Law Judge in 1991. As an Administrative Law Judge, he presided over hundreds of cases alleging retaliatory discharges, refusals to bargain, and representation issues. He also served as a mediator pursuant to PERB's impasse resolution procedures, and mediated hundreds of collective bargaining disputes involving all aspects of public sector bargaining, including police, firefighter, and school district units. He graduated from Clark University and Vermont Law School, has written numerous articles on labor law issues, and is the author of *The Taylor Law and the Duty of Fair Representation*. He has also been an adjunct professor teaching Business Ethics and Business Law at New York University since 2003.

## **ABOUT THE EDITORS**

### **MICHAEL KRAUTHAMER, ESQ.**

Michael Krauthamer has worked primarily in the area of public sector labor relations since 1995, and is currently employed by the New York State United Teachers (NYSUT) as a Labor Relations Specialist. He represents both public and private sector unions in collective bargaining, grievance arbitration, disciplinary matters, civil service issues and matters before PERB and the NLRB. He was previously a partner in the Melville law firm Lamb & Barnosky where he represented municipalities including school districts, counties, towns and villages in all types of labor and employment matters. He has served as a labor arbitrator, mediator and hearing officer in the public and private sectors, counsel to the Suffolk County Public Employment Relations Board and a Labor Relations Specialist for the Civil Service Employees Association, and lectures extensively in the area of public sector employment law. He received his law degree, cum laude, from Suffolk University Law School in Boston, Massachusetts, and his undergraduate degree, cum laude, from the University of Massachusetts, Amherst.

### **ALYSON MATHEWS, ESQ.**

Alyson Mathews is a partner at Lamb & Barnosky, LLP and practices education, labor and employment law. She has assisted municipalities with grievance arbitrations, improper practice charges before PERB, disciplinary charges, contract negotiations, fact finding, and compulsory and voluntary interest arbitration proceedings. She is an expert on the Affordable Care Act and has frequently lectured on the topic. She is actively involved in the New York State Bar Association and currently serves on the Executive Committee of the Labor and Employment Law Section as the Co-Chair of the Membership Committee and as a member of the Electronic Communications Committee. Ms. Mathews is also a member of the American Bar Association and the Suffolk County Bar Association. She received her law degree from Brooklyn Law School and her undergraduate degree, cum laude, from Boston College. While at Brooklyn Law School,

she was a member of the Moot Court Honor Society and the Journal of Law and Policy. She participated in the 2003 National First Amendment Moot Court Competition where she placed as a semifinalist. She also served as the coach of the 2004 First Amendment Moot Court team, Notes and Comments Editor for the Journal of Law and Policy, and editor of the Brooklyn Law School News.