

New York State Bar Association

One Elk Street, Albany, New York 12207 • 518/463-3200 • http://www.nysba.org

TAX SECTION

2003-2004 Executive Committee

ANDREW N. BERG

Chair Debevoise & Plimpton 919 Third Avenue New York, NY 10022 212909-6288

LEWIS R. STEINBERG First Vice-Chair 212/474-1656

DAVID P. HARITON Second Vice-Chair 212/558-4248

KIMBERLY S. BLANCHARD Secretary 212/310-8799

COMMITTEE CHAIRS:

Bankruptcy and Operating Losses Lawrence M. Garrett Stuart J. Goldring

Compliance, Practice & Procedure

Ellis W. Reemer Bryan G. Skarlates Consolidated Returns Karen Gilbreath Jonathan Kushner

Corporations
Kathleen L. Ferreil
Jod J. Schwartz

Employee Benefits Karen G. Krueger Max J. Schwartz

Estates and Trusts
T. Randolph Harris
Jeffrey N. Schwartz
Financial Instruments
Michael S. Farber

Erika W. Nijenhuis Financial Intermediaries David M. Schizer

Andrew P. Solomon Foreign Activities of U.S.

Taxpayers
Peter H. Blessing
David R. Sicular
Multistate Tax lesues

Robert E. Brown Paul R. Comeau New York City Taxes

Robert J. Levinschn Irwin M. Slomka

New York State Franchise and Income Taxes

Maria T. Jones Arthur R. Rosen

Partnerships William B. Brannan David H. Schnabel

Pass-Through Entities Patrick C. Gallagher Gary B. Mandel

Real Property
David E. Kahen
Elliot Pisem
Reorganizations

Andrew R. Walker Diana L. Wolfman Securitizations and Structured Finance

David S. Milier Paul R. Wysocki Tax Accounting David W. Mayo Marc L. Silberberg

Tax Exempt Bonds
Stuart L. Rosow
John T. Lutz
Tax Exempt Entities

Dickson G. Brown Michelle P. Scott U.S. Activities of Foreign Taxpavers

Taxpayers Gary M. Friedman Yaron Z. Reich MEMBERS-AT-LARGE OF EXECUTIVE COMMITTEE

Edward E. Gonzalez Alysse Grossman Sherwin Kamin Amold Y. Kapiloff Barbara T. Kaplan Charles I. Kingson Janet B. Korins Sherry S. Kraus Jiyeon Lee-Lim Charles Morgan Andrew W. Needham Deborah L. Paul

Matthew A. Rosen Seth L. Rosen Joel Scharfstein Linda Z. Swartz

Gordon Warnke David E. Watts Victor Zonana

March 18, 2003

The Honorable Charles E. Grassley Chair Senate Finance Committee United States Senate 135 Hart Washington, DC 20510

The Honorable Max Baucus Ranking Minority Member Senate Finance Committee United States Senate 511 Hart Washington, DC 20510

Gentlemen:

I am pleased to submit the New York State Bar Association Tax Section's Preliminary Report (the "Report") on the Administration's Dividend Exclusion proposal. The essential features of the Treasury Department's Dividend Exclusion proposal were set forth in the "Green Book" language released on February 3, 2003. In addition, on February 27, 2003, legislation was introduced in the House of Representatives (H.R. 2) and the Senate (S. 2)

FORMER CHAIRS OF SECTION:

Samuel Brodsky Edwin M. Jones Peter Miller John E. Morrissey, Jr. Charles E. Heming Raiph O. Winger Martin D. Ginsburg Peter L. Faber Hon. Renato Beghe Alfred D. Youngwood Gordon D. Henderson David Sachs J. Roger Mentz Willard B. Taylor Richard J. Hiegel Dale S. Collinson Richard G. Cohen Donald Schapiro Herbert L. Camp William L. Burke Arthur A. Feder James M. Peaslee John A. Corry Peter C. Canellos Michael L. Schler Carolyn Joy Lee Richard L. Reinhold Richard O. Loengard Steven C. Todrys Harold R. Handler Robert H. Scarborough Robert A. Jacobs Samuel J. Dimon

¹ General Explanations of the Administrations Fiscal Year 2004 Revenue Proposals, Department of the Treasury, February 3, 2003, pages 11-22.

(the "Bills") to implement the proposal. We recognize the Dividend Exclusion proposal may undergo further changes and refinements over time. We look forward to providing ongoing comments and suggestions.

The New York State Bar Association Tax Section is not taking a position as to whether, from a tax policy perspective, the Dividend Exclusion proposal is desirable. The Report assumes that a dividend exclusion proposal will be enacted and provides technical comments to assist in the proper functioning of the Dividend Exclusion within the context of our existing tax laws.

At the Treasury Department's request, we have focused our attention in the Report primarily on a limited number of issues we believe should be addressed to facilitate administrability of the Dividend Exclusion proposal and to safeguard its application -- to ensure that the rules designed to eliminate the double taxation of corporate income are not in turn used to reduce or eliminate even a single level of taxation of corporate income.

The central feature of the Dividend Exclusion proposal is that, to the extent tax has been imposed at the corporate level (after-tax earnings will make up the excludable dividend amount ("EDA")), corporations will be permitted to pay excludable dividends to shareholders to the extent of EDA. Gains on shares of stock, however, although reduced by adjustments for undistributed EDA, will remain subject to taxation, and shareholders will continue to be composed of a mixture of both taxpayers and tax exempt entities. This combination of factors: (i) the introduction of a new category of exempt income for taxpayers (i.e., excludable corporate dividends); (ii) the significant tax distinction between income derived as excludable dividends and income derived as taxable capital gains; and (iii) the fact that tax exempt

² H.R. 2 (introduced by Chairman Thomas) and S. 2 (introduced by Senators Nickles and Miller).

investors will continue to represent a sizable portion of the shareholding public and generally will not pay tax on dividends or capital gains, could, if left unattended, be responsible for the design of a number of transactions that could undermine the tax policy objectives associated with the Dividend Exclusion proposal.

We recognize the Treasury Department is fully aware of these possibilities and has incorporated into its proposal, and the Bills so reflect, a number of defensive measures designed to address them. The Report, through examples and discussion, further highlights the need for Treasury, as part of this process, to implement practical and administrable rules designed to prevent or mitigate the undesirable tax consequences that otherwise might arise from various types of transactions.

As indicated above, we look forward to providing ongoing comments and suggestions as the Dividend Exclusion proposal proceeds through the legislative process. In this regard, please feel free to contact me if you would like to discuss any of the issues addressed in the Report.

Respectfully submitted,

Andrew N. Berg Chair

cc: Mark Prater Russell W. Sullivan Mary M. Schmitt