



NEW YORK STATE BAR ASSOCIATION

One Elk Street, Albany, New York 12207 • 518.463.3200 • www.nysba.org

TAX SECTION

2010-2011 Executive Committee

PETER H. BLESSING

Chair
Shearman & Sterling LLP
599 Lexington Avenue
11th Floor
New York, NY 10022
212/848-4106

JODI J. SCHWARTZ

First Vice-Chair
212/403-1212

ANDREW W. NEEDHAM

Second Vice-Chair
212/474-1440

DIANA L. WOLLMAN

Secretary
212/558-4055

COMMITTEE CHAIRS:

Bankruptcy and Operating Losses

Stuart J. Goldring
Russell J. Kestenbaum

Compliance, Practice & Procedure

Elliot Pisem
Bryan C. Skarlatos

Consolidated Returns

Lawrence M. Garrett
Edward E. Gonzalez

Corporations

David R. Sicular
Karen Gilbreath Sowell

Cross-Border Capital Markets

Andrew Walker
Gordon Warnke

Employee Benefits

Regina Olshan
Andrew L. Oringer

Estates and Trusts

Amy Heller
Jeffrey N. Schwartz

Financial Instruments

Michael S. Farber
William L. McRae

"Inbound" U.S. Activities of Foreign

Taxpayers

Peter J. Connors
David R. Hardy

Individuals

Paul R. Comeau
Sherry S. Kraus

Investment Funds

David H. Schnabel
Marc L. Silberberg

New York City Taxes

Maria T. Jones
Irwin M. Stomka

New York State Taxes

Robert E. Brown
Arthur R. Rosen

"Outbound" Foreign Activities of

U.S. Taxpayers

Andrew H. Brailerman
Yaron Z. Reich

Partnerships

David W. Mayo
Joel Scharfstein

Pass-Through Entities

James R. Brown
John Lutz

Real Property

Robert Cassanos
Jeffrey Hochberg

Reorganizations

Deborah L. Paul
Linda Z. Swartz

Securitized and Structured

Finance

Jiyeon Lee-Lim
W. Kirk Wallace

Tax Exempt Entities

Elizabeth T. Kessenides
Richard R. Upton

S. Douglas Borisky

Kathleen L. Ferrell
Marcy G. Geller
Charles I. Kingson
Stephen Land

MEMBERS-AT-LARGE OF EXECUTIVE COMMITTEE

Robert J. Levinsohn

Lisa A. Levy
Vadim Mahmoudov
Gary B. Mandel
Douglas McFadyen

Charles M. Morgan

David M. Schizer
Peter F. G. Schuur
Ansgar Simon
Eric Sloan

Andrew P. Solomon

Eric Solomon

January 28, 2011

The Honorable Michael Mundaca
Assistant Secretary (Tax Policy)
Department of the Treasury
1500 Pennsylvania Avenue, NW
Washington, DC 20220

The Honorable Douglas H. Shulman
Commissioner
Internal Revenue Service
1111 Constitution Avenue, NW
Washington, DC 20224

The Honorable William J. Wilkins
Chief Counsel
Internal Revenue Service
1111 Constitution Avenue, NW
Washington, DC 20224

Re: Claiming Worthlessness for a Failed Subsidiary within a Consolidated Group

Gentlemen:

I am pleased to submit the New York State Bar Association Tax Section's Report No. 1230 on Claiming Worthlessness for a Failed Subsidiary within a Consolidated Group. The report analyzes the current treatment of failed subsidiaries in consolidated groups, renews our recommendations from our 2003 report on this subject, and offers a possible intermediate alternative.

The report focuses on the timing and availability of a worthless stock deduction. Current law generally applies subchapter C rules applicable to separate entities, although adjustments are made as necessary to coordinate with the consolidated return regulations (i.e., the approach taken under current law). The 2003 report generally took a single entity approach where the consolidated group continues the insolvent subsidiary's business, thereby generally denying a worthless stock deduction upon an upstream or sideways restructuring of the subsidiary. The intermediate alternative is a hybrid approach that defers the worthless stock deduction that would otherwise result under current law until a later appropriate triggering event.

FORMER CHAIRS OF SECTION:

Edwin M. Jones
John E. Morrissey, Jr.
Martin D. Ginsburg
Peter L. Faber
Hon. Renato Beghe
Alfred D. Youngwood
Gordon D. Henderson
David Sachs

J. Roger Mentz
Willard B. Taylor
Richard J. Hiegel
Dale S. Collinson
Richard G. Cohen
Donald Schapiro
Herbert L. Camp
William L. Burke

Arthur A. Feder
James M. Peaslee
John A. Corry
Peter C. Canellos
Michael L. Schler
Carolyn Joy Lee
Richard L. Reinhold
Richard O. Loengard

Steven C. Todrys
Harold R. Handler
Robert H. Scarborough
Robert A. Jacobs
Samuel J. Dimon
Andrew N. Berg
Lewis R. Steinberg
David P. Hariton

Kimberly S. Blanchard
Patrick C. Gallagher
David S. Miller
Erika W. Nijenhuis

We believe that the government should provide specific rules in a consolidated return regulation to determine whether a worthless stock deduction can be recognized as a result of an upstream or sideways restructuring of an insolvent subsidiary. The interactions between the consolidated return regulations and Code-based rules for worthless stock deductions have increased and become more complex since our 2003 report. The pervasive influence of single-entity oriented rules under the consolidated return regulations with respect to worthless stock deductions for insolvent subsidiaries, as well as the complexity of the interaction between single entity and separate company rules, argue persuasively, in our view, for a single entity determination of whether an upstream or sideways restructuring can generate a worthless stock deduction.

We continue to believe that the proposals made in the 2003 report are appropriate because they represent a unified approach to the treatment of stock of an insolvent subsidiary (or subsidiary whose asset value is not in excess of the liquidation preference on its outstanding preferred stock) by generally eliminating the worthless stock deduction where the subsidiary's business remains in the group. We therefore suggest that the proposals described in the 2003 report be considered anew.

Should the government still determine not to issue a consolidated return regulation modifying the application of the tax-free reorganization provisions of section 368 to upstream and sideways restructurings of insolvent subsidiaries, we recommend that consideration be given to our intermediate alternative, which integrates single entity and separate company treatment.

We appreciate your consideration of our recommendations. If you have any questions regarding this report, please feel free to contact us and we will be glad to discuss or assist in any way.

Respectfully yours,



Peter H. Blessing
Chair

cc: William D. Alexander
Associate Chief Counsel (Corporate)
Internal Revenue Service

Lee A. Kelley
Deputy Associate Chief Counsel (Corporate)
Internal Revenue Service

Hon. Michael Mundaca, Hon. Douglas H. Shulman, Hon. William J. Wilkins
January 28, 2011
Page 3

Emily S. McMahon
Deputy Assistant Secretary (Tax Policy)
Department of the Treasury

Clarissa C. Potter
Deputy Chief Counsel (Technical)
Internal Revenue Service

Lon B. Smith
National Counselor to the Chief Counsel for Special Projects
Internal Revenue Service

Jeffrey Van Hove
Tax Legislative Counsel
Department of the Treasury