



NEW YORK STATE BAR ASSOCIATION

One Elk Street, Albany, New York 12207 • PH 518.463.3200 • www.nysba.org

TAX SECTION

2011-2012 Executive Committee

JODI J. SCHWARTZ

Chair
Wachtell Lipton Rosen & Katz
51 West 52nd Street
New York, NY 10019-6150
212/403-1212

ANDREW W. NEEDHAM

First Vice-Chair
212/474-1440

DIANA L. WOLLMAN

Second Vice-Chair
212/558-4055

DAVID H. SCHNABEL

Secretary
212/909-6336

COMMITTEE CHAIRS:

Bankruptcy and Operating Losses

Stuart J. Goldring
Russell J. Kestenbaum

Compliance, Practice & Procedure

Elliot Pisem
Bryan C. Skarlatos

Consolidated Returns

Lawrence M. Garrett
Edward E. Gonzalez

Corporations

David R. Sicular
Karen Gilbreath Sowell

Cross-Border Capital Markets

Andrew Walker
Gordon Warnke

Employee Benefits

Eric Hilfers
Andrew L. Oringer

Estates and Trusts

Laura M. Twomey

Financial Instruments

Michael S. Farber
William L. McRae

"Inbound" U.S. Activities of Foreign

Taxpayers

Peter J. Connors
David R. Hardy

Individuals

Robert E. Brown
Sherry S. Kraus

Investment Funds

Marc L. Silberberg
Eric Sloan

New York City Taxes

Maria T. Jones
Irwin M. Slomka

New York State Taxes

Paul R. Comeau
Arthur R. Rosen

"Outbound" Foreign Activities of

U.S. Taxpayers

Andrew H. Braiterman
Yaron Z. Reich

Partnerships

David W. Mayo
Joel Scharfstein

Pass-Through Entities

James R. Brown
John T. Lutz

Real Property

Robert Cassanos
Jeffrey Hochberg

Reorganizations

Deborah L. Paul
Linda Z. Swartz

Securitizations and Structured

Finance

Jiyeon Lee-Lim
W. Kirk Wallace

Tax Exempt Entities

Elizabeth T. Kessenides
Richard R. Upton

MEMBERS-AT-LARGE OF EXECUTIVE COMMITTEE

S. Douglas Borisky

Steven Dean

Kathleen L. Ferrell

Marcy G. Geller

Charles I. Kingson

Stephen B. Land

Matthew Lay

Robert J. Levinsohn

Lisa A. Levy

Vadim Mahmoudov

Gary B. Mandel

Charles M. Morgan

David M. Schizer

Peter F. G. Schuur

Ansgar A. Simon

Andrew P. Solomon

Eric Solomon

Philip Wagman

November 14, 2011

The Honorable Emily S. McMahon

Deputy Assistant Secretary

(Tax Policy)

Department of the Treasury

1500 Pennsylvania Avenue, NW

Washington, DC 20220

The Honorable William J. Wilkins

Chief Counsel

Internal Revenue Service

1111 Constitution Avenue, NW

Washington, DC 20224

The Honorable Douglas H. Shulman

Commissioner

Internal Revenue Service

1111 Constitution Avenue, NW

Washington, D.C. 20224

Dear Ms. McMahon, Mr. Wilkins and Mr. Schulman:

We are pleased to submit the New York State Bar Association's Report No. 1247 relating to the application of the self-employment tax imposed under Section 1401¹ and the related exclusion from such tax set forth in Section 1402(a)(13) for certain members of entities classified as partnerships for U.S. federal income tax purposes. Specifically, the report

¹ All section references in this letter are to the Internal Revenue Code of 1986, as amended, or the Treasury regulations promulgated thereunder.

FORMER CHAIRS OF SECTION:

John E. Morrissey, Jr.

Peter L. Faber

Hon. Renato Beghe

Alfred D. Youngwood

Gordon D. Henderson

David Sachs

J. Roger Mentz

Willard B. Taylor

Richard J. Hiegel

Dale S. Collinson

Richard G. Cohen

Donald Schapiro

Herbert L. Camp

William L. Burke

Arthur A. Feder

James M. Peaslee

John A. Corry

Peter C. Canellos

Michael L. Schler

Carolyn Joy Lee

Richard L. Reinhold

Richard O. Loengard

Steven C. Todrys

Harold R. Handler

Robert H. Scarborough

Robert A. Jacobs

Samuel J. Dimon

Andrew N. Berg

Lewis R. Steinberg

David P. Hariton

Kimberly S. Blanchard

Patrick C. Gallagher

David S. Miller

Erika W. Nijenhuis

Peter H. Blessing

requests guidance regarding the meaning of the term “limited partner” for purposes of Section 1402(a)(13) and sets forth our recommendations on this subject. The attached report also comments on the application of the 3.8% tax imposed under Section 1411 on an individual fund manager’s distributive share of capital gain or other investment income attributable to a “carried interest” in a private equity fund, hedge fund, or other investment partnership.

The subject of “payroll” taxes in relation to members of entities classified as tax partnerships drew much attention this year, mostly in reaction to the Tax Court’s decision in Renkemeyer, Campbell & Weaver LLP v. Commissioner.² As discussed in the attached report, however, this issue is not new. Many years have passed since regulations were first proposed under Section 1402(a)(13) (the “Proposed Regulations”)—those Proposed Regulations were never finalized and were the subject of a temporary moratorium. Though the moratorium expired over fourteen years ago, the Proposed Regulations have not been finalized, or withdrawn, and open questions remain under Section 1402(a)(13) in terms of the scope of the exclusion from self-employment taxes for “limited partners”. At the same time, limited liability companies and limited liability partnerships have proliferated -- allowing members to retain a limited liability shield while participating in a very active way in the operation, and often in the management, of an enterprise formed as a tax partnership.

The recently-enacted provisions of Section 1411 will impose a 3.8% tax on income that represents a “return on invested capital” for individuals who meet a certain income threshold. This statutory provision was designed to parallel the Medicare tax imposed on “earned” income. We believe that the need for guidance in respect of Section 1402(a)(13) has been heightened, given the adoption of Section 1411.

As reflected in the attached report, in our view the term “limited partner” for purposes of Section 1402 should be divorced from state law classifications. We recommend that in order to best reflect the Congressional intent underlying the Section 1402(a)(13) exclusion, the term “limited partner” should be defined by reference to the level of participation of an individual in relevant partnership activities. A test that is analogous to the material participation test that applies under Section 469 of the Code would in our view further the intent of the self-employment tax provisions of the Code, and would be consistent with Congress’ goal in enacting the statutory provisions contained in Section 1411. The attached report takes the Proposed Regulations as a starting point and makes a number of specific recommendations in respect of a “material participation” standard, special rules for service partnerships, the manner in which “service partnership” should be defined, and the extent to which a partner who holds interests denominated (under state law) as both “general” and “limited” partner interests should be allowed to bifurcate

² Renkemeyer, Campbell & Weaver LLP v. Commissioner, 136 T.C. No. 7 (Feb. 9, 2011)

The Honorable Emily S. McMahon
The Honorable William J. Wilkins
The Honorable Douglas H. Shulman
November 14, 2011
Page 3

their interest in the relevant partnership for purposes of the self-employment tax provisions of Section 1401.

In relation to Section 1411, we ask that consideration be given to the issuance of some form of guidance that will address the application of the new statutory provision in the context of investment partnerships, especially where there an individual derives income through more than one partnership tier. We make this observation because we have noted certain ambiguities that could arguably be read into the statutory provisions, particularly in relation to investment partnerships and the carried interest.

We appreciate your consideration of our recommendations. If you have any questions or comments regarding this report, please feel free to contact us and we will be glad to discuss or assist in any way.

Respectfully submitted,

A handwritten signature in black ink, appearing to read "Jodi Schwartz", written over a light blue horizontal line.

Jodi Schwartz
Chair

cc:

Jeffrey Van Hove
Tax Legislative Counsel
Department of the Treasury

J. Mark Iwry
Senior Advisor to the Secretary and Deputy Assistant Secretary
For Retirement and Health Policy
Department of Treasury

George H. Bostick
Benefits Tax Counsel
Department of the Treasury

The Honorable Emily S. McMahon
The Honorable William J. Wilkins
The Honorable Douglas H. Shulman
November 14, 2011
Page 4

Jennifer Alexander
Attorney-Advisor
Office of Tax Legislative Counsel
Department of the Treasury

Curtis G. Wilson
Associate Chief Counsel (Passthroughs and Special Industries)
Office of Chief Counsel
Internal Revenue Service

Kevin Knopf
Attorney-Advisor
Office of the Benefits Tax Counsel
Department of Treasury

Erik Corwin
Deputy Chief Counsel (Technical)
Internal Revenue Service

Victoria A. Judson
Division Counsel/Associate Chief Counsel, Tax Exempt & Government Entities
Office of the Chief Counsel
Internal Revenue Service

Janine Cook
Deputy Division Counsel/Associate Chief Counsel, Tax Exempt & Government Entities
Office of the Chief Counsel
Internal Revenue Service

Paul Carlino
Branch Chief (Employment Tax Branch 1) Tax Exempt & Government Entities
Office of the Chief Counsel
Internal Revenue Service

Thomas A. Barthold
Chief of Staff
Joint Committee on Taxation