

# New York State Bar Association

One Elk Street, Albany, New York 12207 • 518/463-3200 • http://www.nysba.org

#### **TAX SECTION**

2007-2008 Executive Committee

PATRICK C. GALLAGHER Chair Kirkland & Ellis LLP 153 East 53rd Street New York, NY 10022

212/446-4998 **DAVID S. MILLER** First Vice-Chair 212/504-6318

CHARLES MORGAN Second Vice-Chair 212/735-2470

ERIKA W. NIJENHUIS Secretary 212/225-2980

COMMITTEE CHAIRS: Bankruptcy and Operating Losses Kathleen L. Ferrell Stuart J. Goldring

Stuart J. Goldring

Compliance, Practice & Procedure

Elliot Pisem

Bryan C. Skarlatos
Consolidated Returns
Lawrence M. Garrett
David H. Schnabel
Corporations

Corporations
David R. Sicular
Karen Gilbreath Sowell
Employee Benefits
Andrew L. Oringer

Max J. Schwartz
Estates and Trusts
Carlyn S. McCaffrey
Jeffrey N. Schwartz
Financial Instruments
Michael S. Farber

Michael S. Farber Stephen B. Land "Inbound" U.S. Activities of Foreign

Taxpayers William B. Brannan David R. Hardy

Individuals
Elizabeth T. Kessenides
Sherry S. Kraus
Multistate Tax Issues

Robert E. Brown
Paul R. Comeau

New York City Taxes

Robert J. Levinsohn Invin M. Slomka New York State Franchise and Income Taxes

Maria T. Jones Arthur R. Rosen "Outbound" Foreign Activities of

U.S. Taxpayers
Peter H. Blessing
Deborah L. Paul
Partnerships
Andrew W. Needham
Joel Scharfstein
Pass-Through Entities
James R. Brown

James R. Brown Marc L. Silberberg Real Property Robert Cassanos Jeffrey Hochberg

Reorganizations
Jodi J. Schwartz
Linda Z. Swartz

Securitizations and Structured Finance

Jiyeon Lee-Lim W, Kirk Wallace Tax Accounting Gary B. Mandel Yaron Z. Reich Tax Exempt Bonds Bruce M. Serchuk Patti T. Wu

Patti T. Wu

Tax Exempt Entities

Michelle P. Scott

Richard R. Upton

Tax Policy
David W. Mayo
Diana L. Wollman

### MEMBERS-AT-LARGE OF EXECUTIVE COMMITTEE

Andrew H. Braiterman Peter J. Connors Edward E. Gonzalez Mary L. Harmon Charles I. Kingson Douglas R. McFadyen William L. McRae David M. Schizer Andrew P. Solomon Andrew Walker Gordon Warnke Victor Zonana

April 11, 2007

The Honorable Eric Solomon Assistant Secretary (Tax Policy) Department of the Treasury Room 3120 MT 1500 Pennsylvania Avenue, N.W. Washington, DC 20220

The Honorable Mark W. Everson Commissioner Internal Revenue Service Room 3000 IR 1111 Constitution Avenue, N.W. Washington, DC 20224

NYSBA Tax Section Report on the Model Income Tax Convention Released by the Treasury on November 15, 2006

Dear Assistant Secretary Solomon and Commissioner Everson:

We are pleased to submit our Report on the Model Income Tax Convention Released by the Treasury in November 2006.

The Report begins with a recommendation that the Treasury consider significantly expanding the Technical Explanation of the Model to include, in addition to what is there now, an explanation of the changes to U.S. tax treaty policy reflected in the Model, the reasons for those changes and the relationship between the provisions of the Model and current U.S. tax law. We believe that this would be consistent with the best purpose for a model treaty, which (as stated in 1996) is "to provide a basic explanation of U.S. tax treaty policy for all interested parties, regardless of whether they are prospective treaty partners".

FORMER CHAIRS OF SECTION:

Samuel Brodsky Edwin M. Jones Peter Miller John E. Morrissey, Jr. Martin D. Ginsburg Peter L. Faber Hon. Renato Beghe Alfred D. Youngwood Gordon D. Henderson David Sachs J. Roger Mentz Willard B. Taylor Richard J. Hiegel Dale S. Collinson

Richard G. Cohen Donald Schapiro Herbert L. Camp William L. Burke Arthur A. Feder James M. Peaslee John A. Corry Peter C. Canellos Michael L. Schler Carolyn Joy Lee Richard L. Reinhold Richard O. Loengard Steven C. Todrys Harold R. Handler Robert H. Scarborough Robert A. Jacobs Samuel J. Dimon Andrew N. Berg Lewis R. Steinberg David P. Hariton Kimberty S. Blanchard We also recommend that the Treasury state its view on the relevance of the Technical Explanation of the Model and of treaty-specific technical explanations, including the effect of subsequent changes in those explanations on existing U.S. treaties, and its views on the relevance of the OECD Model Treaty and related OECD documents to the interpretation of U.S. tax treaties.

In making these initial recommendations, which are set out in Part A of the Report, we recognize that, if accepted, they would require a significant effort by the Treasury Department. We think the importance of the Model and of its apparent incorporation of OECD rules into U.S. tax treaty law would justify the effort. Understanding U.S. tax treaty policy is of far greater importance today than it was in 1977 when the Treasury first issued a model treaty.

The Report also comments, in Parts B, C and D, on what is omitted from and on what is included in the Model and makes a number of specific observations. Our main purpose is to identify and raise issues. At this point, we have not taken a position, one way or the other, on many of the items we have commented on.

If it would be helpful, we would be pleased to meet with the Treasury to discuss our comments further and also, since our comments in Parts B, C and D are not exhaustive, to comment on provisions of the Model that are not covered by our Report.

Respectfully submitted,

Patrick C. Gallagher

Chair

cc: John L. Harrington, Acting International Tax Counsel,
Department of the Treasury
Benedetta Kissel, Deputy International Tax Counsel,
Department of the Treasury
Michael J. Desmond, Tax Legislative Counsel,
Department of the Treasury
Donald L. Korb, Chief Counsel,
Internal Revenue Service
Steven A. Musher, Associate Chief Counsel (International),
Internal Revenue Service



# New York State Bar Association

One Elk Street, Albany, New York 12207 • 518/463-3200 • http://www.nysba.org

### TAX SECTION

2007-2008 Executive Committee

PATRICK C. GALLAGHER

Chair Kirkland & Ellis LLP 153 East 53rd Street New York, NY 10022

DAVID S. MILLER First Vice-Chair 212/504-6318

**CHARLES MORGAN** Second Vice-Chair 212/735-2470 **ERIKA W. NIJENHUIS** 

Secretary 212/225-2980

**COMMITTEE CHAIRS:** Bankruptcy and Operating Losses
Kathleen L. Ferrell

Stuart J. Goldring
Compliance, Practice & Procedure

Elliot Pisem

Bryan C. Skarlatos Consolidated Returns Lawrence M. Garrett David H. Schnabel Corporations

David R. Sicular Karen Gilbreath Sowell **Employee Benefits** 

Andrew L. Oringer Max J. Schwartz Estates and Trusts Carlyn S. McCaffrey Jeffrey N. Schwartz Financial Instruments

Michael S. Farber Stephen B. Land

"Inbound" U.S. Activities of Foreign

Taxpayers William B. Brannan David R. Hardy Individuals

Elizabeth T. Kessenides Sherry S. Kraus Multistate Tax Issues

Robert E. Brown Paul R. Comeau

New York City Taxes Robert J. Levinsohn Irwin M. Slomka New York State Franchise and

Income Taxes Maria T. Jones Arthur R. Rosen

"Outbound" Foreign Activities of U.S. Taxpayers
Peter H. Blessing

Deborah L. Paul Partnerships Andrew W. Needham

Joel Scharfstein
Pass-Through Entities

James R. Brown Marc L. Silberberg Real Property

Robert Cassanos Jeffrey Hochberg Reorganizations

Jodi J. Schwartz Linda Z. Swartz Securitizations and Structured

Finance Jiyeon Lee-Lim W. Kirk Wallace

Tax Accounting
Gary B. Mandel
Yaron Z. Reich **Tax Exempt Bonds** Bruce M. Serchuk

Patti T. Wu Tax Exempt Entities Michelle P. Scott Richard R. Upton Tax Policy David W. Mayo

Diana L. Wollman

MEMBERS-AT-LARGE OF EXECUTIVE COMMITTEE

Andrew H. Braiterman Mary L. Harmon Peter J. Connors Charles I. Kingson Edward E. Gonzalez Douglas R. McFadyen

William I McRae David M. Schizer Andrew P. Solomon Andrew Walker Gordon Warnke Victor Zonana

April 11, 2007

Senator Joseph R. Biden, Jr. 201 Russell Senate Office Building Washington, DC 20510

Senator Chuck Hagel 248 Russell Senate Office Building Washington, DC 20510

Senator Robert Menendez 317 Hart Senate Office Building Washington, DC 20510

Senator Richard G. Lugar 306 Hart Senate Office Building Washington, DC 20510

> NYSBA Tax Section Report on the Model Income Tax Convention Released by the Treasury on November 15, 2006

Dear Senators Biden, Hagel, Menendez and Lugar:

We are pleased to submit our Report on the Model Income Tax Convention Released by the Treasury in November 2006.

The Report begins with a recommendation that the Treasury consider significantly expanding the Technical Explanation of the Model to include, in addition to what is there now, an explanation of the changes to U.S. tax treaty policy reflected in the Model, the reasons for those changes and the relationship between the provisions of the Model and current U.S. tax law. We believe that this would be consistent with the best purpose for a model treaty, which (as stated in 1996) is "to provide a basic explanation of U.S. tax treaty policy for all interested parties, regardless of whether they are prospective treaty partners".

FORMER CHAIRS OF SECTION:

Samuel Brodsky Edwin M. Jones Peter Miller John E. Morrissey, Jr. Martin D. Ginsburg Peter L. Faber Hon, Renato Beohe

Alfred D. Youngwood Gordon D. Henderson **David Sachs** J. Roger Mentz Willard B. Taylor Richard J. Hiegel Date S. Collinson

Richard G. Cohen Donald Schapiro Herbert L. Camp William L. Burke Arthur A. Feder James M. Peaslee John A. Corry

Peter C. Canellos Michael L. Schler Carolyn Joy Lee Richard L. Reinhold Richard O. Loengard Steven C. Todrys Harold R. Handler

Robert H. Scarborough Robert A. Jacobs Samuel J. Dimon Andrew N. Berg Lewis R. Steinberg David P. Hariton Kimberly S. Blanchard

We also recommend that the Treasury state its view on the relevance of the Technical Explanation of the Model and of treaty-specific technical explanations, including the effect of subsequent changes in those explanations on existing U.S. treaties, and its views on the relevance of the OECD Model Treaty and related OECD documents to the interpretation of U.S. tax treaties.

In making these initial recommendations, which are set out in Part A of the Report, we recognize that, if accepted, they would require a significant effort by the Treasury Department. We think the importance of the Model and of its apparent incorporation of OECD rules into U.S. tax treaty law would justify the effort. Understanding U.S. tax treaty policy is of far greater importance today than it was in 1977 when the Treasury first issued a model treaty.

The Report also comments, in Parts B, C and D, on what is omitted from and on what is included in the Model and makes a number of specific observations. Our main purpose is to identify and raise issues. At this point, we have not taken a position, one way or the other, on many of the items we have commented on.

If it would be helpful, we would be pleased to meet with the Treasury to discuss our comments further and also, since our comments in Parts B, C and D are not exhaustive, to comment on provisions of the Model that are not covered by our Report.

Respectfully submitted,

il ( Pully)

Patrick C. Gallagher

Chair

cc: Thomas Barthold, Acting Chief of Staff
Joint Committee on Taxation
Avril D. Haines, Deputy Chief Counsel,
Foreign Relations Committee
Manisha Singh, Deputy Counsel,
Foreign Relations Committee
Jessica Lewis, Legislative Assistant,
Foreign Relations Committee
Rexon Ryu, Foreign Policy Advisor,
Foreign Relations Committee