



SCOTT M. KARSON

President
Lamb & Barnosky LLP
534 Broadhollow Road
Suite 210, P.O. Box 9034
Melville, New York 11747
skarson@nysba.org
631.694.2300

April 22, 2021

Honorable Andrew M. Cuomo
Governor of the State of New York
State Capitol
Albany, New York 12224

Dear Governor Cuomo:

The New York State Bar Association has considered the qualifications of the seven individuals whose names were submitted by the Commission on Judicial Nomination for possible appointment as Associate Judge of the Court of Appeals in connection with the impending retirement of Hon. Leslie E. Stein.

We reviewed each candidate's background, studied their decisions and/or writings and interviewed those who know them. Personal interviews were conducted with each candidate. While the specific matters discussed with each nominee varied, they generally included background, experience and temperament to serve as Associate Judge.

Based on these evaluations, the candidates have been rated by the New York State Bar Association as follows:

Hon. Ellen Nachtigall Biben:	“Qualified”
Kathy Hirata Chin, Esq.:	“Well Qualified”
Caitlin J. Halligan, Esq.:	“Well Qualified”
Hon. Valerie Brathwaite Nelson:	“Well Qualified”
Hon. Erin M. Peradotto:	“Well Qualified”
Hon. Madeline Singas:	“Qualified”
Hon. Shirley Troutman:	“Well Qualified”

I am enclosing a copy of the “Guidelines for Evaluating Qualifications of Judicial Candidates.” We hope you will find this information helpful in making an appointment to the office of Associate Judge of the Court of Appeals.

Please let me know if you would like any further information.

Respectfully,

A handwritten signature in black ink, appearing to read "Scott M. Karson", with a long horizontal flourish extending to the right.

Scott M. Karson