

ATTORNEY GRIEVANCE COMMITTEES

2024

ANNUAL REPORT

2024 ANNUAL REPORT



**Attorney Grievance Committee
Supreme Court, Appellate Division
First Judicial Department**

2024 ANNUAL REPORT

**Attorney Grievance Committee
Supreme Court, Appellate Division
First Judicial Department**

**Robert J. Anello
Abigail T. Reardon
Chairs**

**Jorge Dopico
Chief Attorney**

CONTENTS

Introduction	1
Committee Members	1
Chairs	1
Vice-Chairs	3
Members.....	3
The Disciplinary Process	21
Complaints, Investigations, And Dismissals	21
Letters Of Advisement [22 NYCRR 1240.2(i)].....	22
Letters Of Admonition [22 NYCRR 1240.2(b)].....	22
Applications To the Appellate Division	23
Formal Disciplinary Proceedings [22 NYCRR 1240.7(d)(2)(vi)]	23
Collateral Estoppel.....	24
Interim Suspensions [22 NYCRR 1240.9].....	25
Resignations [22 NYCRR 1240.10]	25
Diversion [22 NYCRR 1240.11]	25
Convictions [22 NYCRR 1240.12].....	25
Reciprocal Discipline [22 NYCRR 1240.13]	26
Incapacity [22 NYCRR 1240.14]	26
Reinstatements [22 NYCRR 1240.16, 1240.17].....	27
Representative Cases	28
Interim Suspensions	28
Disbarments	28
Disciplinary Resignations	29
Suspensions As Discipline	29
Suspensions For Medical Disability	30
Public Censures.....	30

Reinstatements	30
Dishonored Check Investigations	30
Immigration Complaints	31
Public Discipline Cases	32
Appendix A: Committee Composition	50
Committee Members from January 1, 2024 through September 30, 2024.....	50
Committee Members from October 1, 2024 through December 31, 2024.....	51
Appendix B: Office of the Chief Attorney: Attorneys	52
Appendix C: Office of the Chief Attorney: Administrative Staff.....	53
Appendix D: Professional Matters Caseload Report.....	54
Appendix E: Budget For Fiscal Year 2022-2023	55
Appendix F: Complaint Form	56

INTRODUCTION

Complaints against attorneys, registered at an address in Manhattan or the Bronx, are investigated and resolved by the Attorney Grievance Committee for the Supreme Court, Appellate Division, First Judicial Department (AGC). The Chief Attorney of the AGC manages a staff of over 40 salaried lawyers and non-lawyers (staff). Together with a volunteer group of lawyers and non-lawyers (collectively referred to as Committee members or the Committee), the Chief Attorney's Office processed 6463 matters in 2024, including 5408 new complaints.

Committee members are volunteers appointed by the Court who fulfill both adjudicative and executive functions. Most significantly, they decide, after appropriate investigation by the Chief Attorney's Office, whether a disciplinary proceeding should be brought against an attorney, whether a private admonition or letter of advisement should be issued, or whether a complaint should be dismissed. If a disciplinary proceeding is approved, the Court may appoint a referee to conduct a hearing and prepare a written report, stating the referee's findings of fact, conclusions of law and recommended sanction. Thereafter, the Court makes the final determination on both liability and sanction based on its review of the record.

In 2024, two separate volunteer Committees, each with a Chair, Vice-Chair, and 19 other members, reviewed and approved staff's recommendations to dismiss, advise, admonish, or formally charge respondents. Each volunteer Committee operates independently and meets six times annually.

Below are brief biographies which highlight the diverse accomplishments of our volunteer Committee members.

COMMITTEE MEMBERS

CHAIRS

Robert J. Anello

Mr. Anello has litigated in the federal and state courts for almost forty years. He focuses his practice on white collar criminal defense, securities and regulatory enforcement matters, complex civil litigation, internal investigations and reviews, and employment discrimination and sexual harassment. Mr. Anello is widely recognized for his skills as a

criminal and civil trial and appellate attorney, his ability to negotiate effectively on behalf of his clients, and his efficiency and discretion in conducting investigations and reviews on behalf of a wide variety of institutions. Mr. Anello has acted as independent, outside counsel and consultant in a number of matters including to a Big Four accounting firm and a major global financial institution in connection with those firms' participation in SEC Look-Back Programs, which have included reviews of the firms' internal compliance programs. Mr. Anello is President Emeritus of the Federal Bar Council and is a Fellow of the American College of Trial Lawyers, the American Bar Foundation, and the New York State Bar Foundation. He is widely known for his dedication to organizations serving the legal community. He was recently appointed by the Supreme Court, Appellate Division, First Department, as Chairperson of the Attorney Grievance Committee. He is the former Chairman of the Audit Committee for the New York City Bar Association (NYCBA) and was a member of the Association's Nominating Committee. He also is the former Chairman of the Association's Committee on Professional Responsibility and was a member of many of its committees, including the Professional Ethics, Criminal Courts, and Judicial Committees. Mr. Anello also was named as a member of the Association's Ad Hoc Committee on Multi-disciplinary Practice and the Ad Hoc Committee Task Force on the Role of Lawyers in Corporate Governance. In addition to these roles, he is a member of numerous other bar associations, including the Association of Professional Responsibility Lawyers, New York Council of Defense Lawyers, the American Bar Association (ABA), the New York State Bar Association (NYSBA), where he was a member of the Association's House of Delegates, and the International Bar Association. Mr. Anello also serves on the Board of Trustees of The Supreme Court Historical Society and is a member and secretary of the Foundation of the New York Organ Donor Network and former Chairman of the organization's Audit Committee.

Abigail T. Reardon

Ms. Reardon is a partner in the firm of DLA Piper, LLP, and a member of the Litigation Group and the Technology Sector. She is a graduate of Duke University School of Law and College of the Holy Cross. Ms. Reardon is admitted to practice law in New York and Massachusetts, the US Court of Appeals, Second Circuit, and other federal courts. Ms. Reardon is a member of the NYCBA, and the Duke University Law School Board of Visitors. She is a former trustee of Windward School, White Plains, New York, and a former governor of the Nantucket Yacht Club. Ms. Reardon served as a Vice-Chair of the Committee for two terms before her appointment as a Chair.

VICE-CHAIRS

Tina M. Wells

Ms. Wells is a partner in the firm of Trolman Glaser Corley & Lichtman, PC. She is a graduate of Western New England School of Law and Syracuse University, and she is admitted to practice law in New York and Massachusetts. She is a member and past president of The Bronx County Bar Association, co-chair of the Civil Courts Committee, member of New York State Trial Lawyers Association and serves on the 1st Department Character and Fitness Committee. Ms. Wells has served on the Grievance Committee since 2019 and was appointed Vice-Chair of the Committee in 2022.

Milton L. Williams, Jr.

Mr. Williams is a former federal prosecutor and a deputy general counsel with deep experience in white collar criminal and regulatory matters, employment law, litigation, and advisory work representing corporations, in addition to complex commercial litigation. During his distinguished career, he has tried more than 56 cases – both civil and criminal – to verdict. Prior to joining Walden Macht Haran & Williams, Mr. Williams was a partner at a nationally recognized law firm where he handled white collar matters. He also litigated discrimination claims, restrictive covenant, Dodd-Frank, and Sarbanes-Oxley retaliation claims, as well as Securities and Exchange Commission and Internal Revenue Service whistleblower claims on behalf of employees. Previously, he served as Deputy General Counsel and Chief Compliance Officer at Time Inc., where his responsibilities included internal investigations, compliance, the Foreign Corrupt Practices Act (FCPA), the Office of Foreign Assets Control (OFAC), and Sarbanes-Oxley, as well as intellectual property, privacy, data security, and other cutting-edge areas. He also litigated a variety of employment law matters on behalf of the company concerning race, age, disability, and gender discrimination; restrictive covenants; and independent contractor litigation. Earlier in his career, Mr. Williams was an Assistant United States Attorney in the US Attorney's Office (USAO) for the SDNY. His last assigned unit in the USAO was the Securities and Commodities Fraud Force. Mr. Williams also served as an Assistant District Attorney (ADA) in the Manhattan DA's office.

MEMBERS

Marijo C. Adimey

Ms. Adimey is a partner with the law firm of Gair Gair Conason Rubinowitz Bloom Hershenhorn Steigman & Mackauf (GGCRBHS&M). She has devoted her entire legal

career to litigating on behalf of those who have suffered immeasurable loss from a catastrophic injury or death of a loved one. Her empathetic approach toward her clients, remarkable trial skills, and relentless pursuit of justice have made her a prominent attorney in the areas of personal injury, wrongful death, and medical malpractice. Recently named one of the “Top Women’s Litigators” in New York by Super Lawyers, Ms. Adimey quickly became a formidable force of the GGCRBHS&M team after joining in 2014, obtaining several multi-million-dollar verdicts and settlements on behalf of her clients. Her career began as an ADA in Bronx County, where she prosecuted cases on behalf of victims of horrific crimes. There, she became an experienced trial attorney, trying dozens of felony and misdemeanor trials to verdict. Prior to joining GGCRBHS&M, Ms. Adimey had the privilege of representing individuals who have had the unfortunate experience of being the victim of medical malpractice or who have suffered serious physical injury or death in an accident. She continued her zealous representation in 2014 when she joined GGCRBHS&M, whereat her exceptional advocacy and litigation skills paid off in 2017, when she became a partner of the firm. Since 2015, Ms. Adimey has been consistently recognized by her peers each year for inclusion in The Best Lawyers in America and New York Magazine’s “Best Lawyers” in New York in the specialties of medical malpractice and personal injury. She holds an “AV” rating (highest rating) from the Martindale-Hubbell Law Directory, one of the oldest and best-known peer review ratings in the US for both legal and ethical standards. Her advocacy skills and dedication to her clients were recognized early in her career, when she was selected by her peers for inclusion in the Super Lawyers 2013: Rising Stars, an honor reserved for those lawyers who exhibit excellence in practice and published in The New York Times. She has since been selected as a “Super Lawyer” every year. She has been awarded the “Client Distinction Award” issued by Martindale-Hubbell, an honor made possible by the clients she served and awarded to less than 1% of the 900,000+ attorneys listed in Martindale-Hubbell. Ms. Adimey was appointed by the Administrative Judge for Civil Matters, First Judicial Department, as an attorney member of the Medical Malpractice Advisory Committee for the Supreme Court, New York County. She was also selected to serve a two-year term on the Judiciary Committee of the NYCBA, a committee which evaluates judges for appointment, reappointment, election, or reelection to the bench on the city, state, and federal level, and makes recommendations for approval. For the past three years, Ms. Adimey has served as a board member of the New York State Trial Lawyers Association, where she also sits on the Medical Malpractice and Labor Law Committees. She is a lecturer for the NYSBA, and is admitted to the New York and New Jersey Bar, as well as the SDNY, EDNY, NDNY, and the District of New Jersey.

Erica Barrow

Ms. Barrow is a litigation partner at the firm of Baker & Hostetler LLP and a member of the commercial litigation and securities litigation groups. She is a graduate of Fordham Law School and Fordham College at Lincoln Center. She is admitted to practice law in New York and New Jersey, the U.S. Court of Appeals, Second Circuit, and other federal courts. Ms. Barrow is a member of the New York State Supreme Court, Appellate Division, Character and Fitness Committee and an active member of the NYSBA, Commercial and Federal Litigation Section and the National Asian Pacific American Bar Association. Ms. Barrow regularly takes a leadership role in the Diversity and Inclusion and Women's Committee groups at Baker & Hostetler LLP.

Martin S. Bell

Mr. Bell is a partner at Simpson Thacher & Bartlett LLP, where he is a member of its Litigation Department and Government and Internal Investigations Group and leads its Equity and Civil Rights Reviews team. He is a graduate of Harvard Law School and Harvard College. He is admitted to practice law in New York, the U.S. Court of Appeals for the Second Circuit, the Eastern District of New York (EDNY) and the Southern District of New York (SDNY). Mr. Bell served as an Assistant U.S. Attorney in the SDNY from 2010 to 2021. An accomplished trial lawyer, Mr. Bell has been appointed to the Criminal Justice Act Panel for the SDNY, where he represents indigent criminal defendants. Mr. Bell is a member of the Boards of the Harvard Law School Association of New York City, the Office of the Appellate Defender, the Brooklyn Botanic Garden, and the Brooklyn Debate League, and a former trustee of Regis High School.

Peter A. Bellacosa

Mr. Bellacosa joined Phillips Lytle as a litigation partner resident in its NYC and Albany offices in June 2018. Prior to that, he was a partner in the litigation department of Kirkland & Ellis for over 21 years and began his career as an associate in the litigation department of Milbank Tweed Hadley & McCloy. He concentrates his practice in the areas of product liability, mass torts, class action defense, ERISA, securities, and commercial disputes. He also has extensive experience with criminal and regulatory investigations, as well as handling matters in state and federal trial and appellate courts, and in arbitrations. He has represented a diverse group of leading US and international companies in complex, high stakes disputes. Mr. Bellacosa has complemented his private law practice with significant *pro bono publico* service, including serving by appointment to highly sensitive public boards with wide-ranging duties and responsibilities by Governors Pataki and Patterson and the New York Court of Appeals. He has served on the Board of Trustees of the New

York State Lawyers' Fund for Client Protection since 2009 and also serves as its Treasurer. He served as a Member of the Appellate Division, First Department Disciplinary Committee from 2008-2014 and was re-appointed to the Committee in 2020. He is a graduate of Georgetown University (1985) and St. John's University School of Law (1988) and is a member of the NYSBA, and the ABA.

Steven Benathen

Mr. Benathen is a court attorney in Bronx Supreme Court, Criminal Term. He has previously served as a law clerk at the Appellate Division, First Department and as a public defender at the trial and appellate levels. He is co-chair of the Appellate Courts Committee of the New York County Lawyers' Association, a member of the LGBTQ Rights Committee and Rule of Law Taskforce of the New York City Bar Association, and a member of the LGBT Bar Association of Greater New York (LeGal). He received his bachelor's degree from New York University and his law degree *magna cum laude* from the University of Illinois College of Law.

Eleazar F. Bueno

Mr. Bueno is currently the Chair of the Public Safety Community Board 12 Manhattan of The Chamber of Commerce of Washington Heights and Director of Public Engagement of the DOT Commissioner. He is a graduate of The University of Central Florida and CUNY on Liberal Arts and Public Administration. Mr. Bueno is a business owner and a seasoned results-driven professional with exceptional skills in problem-solving, project management, constituent services, intergovernmental affairs, regulatory compliance, and oversight with extensive experience leading complex organizations and large-scale initiatives in fast paced environments. In addition, he has a proven record of developing cross-sectoral strategic partnerships to improve service delivery and impact using practical, bilingual oral and written communication skills, stakeholder engagement, community networks, and a public service ethos.

John P. Buza

Mr. Buza is a partner at Konta Georges and Buza, PC. Upon graduating from law school, Mr. Buza served as a prosecutor in the New York County DA's Office from 2008 through March of 2014 when he entered private practice. Mr. Buza specializes in defending those accused of crimes on the state and federal level as well as representing individuals and corporations being investigated by the government.

Rev. Reyn Cabinte

Rev. Cabinte is the Senior Pastor of Uptown Community Church in Washington Heights. He planted Uptown in 2008, previously serving Emmanuel Presbyterian Church (Morningside Heights) and Church planting Fellow at Redeemer Presbyterian Church. Rev. Cabinte is a founding board member of Viva Uptown, a church-based collaborative non-profit working for the renewal of northern Manhattan. He is also the Manhattan Catalyst for Redeemer City to City, a global urban missions organization. Prior to the ministry, he worked at CBS News' 60 Minutes, served as a writer for economic development NGO World Vision, and was once captain of the men's swim team at Columbia University. He has two boys with his wife, Esther.

Miguelina M. Camilo

Ms. Camilo is currently Counsel to Speaker Carl E. Heastie of the New York State Assembly. Prior to joining the Assembly, she served as Associate Counsel to the NYC Board of Elections. She currently serves as the President of the Bronx Chapter of the 100 Hispanic Women. She previously served as chapter President of the Bronx Women's Bar Association and President of the Dominican Bar Association. She earned a juris doctorate from New York Law School and a bachelor's degree from New York University.

Russell Capone

Mr. Capone, a partner at Cooley, LLP, is a former federal prosecutor with significant experience handling complex criminal cases, particularly those involving corruption, financial fraud, and other white collar crimes. Mr. Capone served for more than 10 years at the US Attorney's Office for the Southern District of New York, most recently as chief counsel to the US Attorney. In that role, he helped oversee SDNY's most significant and sensitive investigations and prosecutions involving, among other crimes, white collar and cybercrime, securities fraud, public corruption, terrorism, gang violence, organized crime, sex trafficking and international narcotics trafficking. Mr. Capone also helped supervise matters arising in SDNY's Civil Division, including those involving civil rights violations, as well as violations of the False Claims Act and Anti-Kickback Statute.

Hon. James M. Catterson

Judge Catterson is a partner at Pillsbury Winthrop Shaw Pittman LLP, specializing in commercial litigation and appellate practice. Prior to Joining Pillsbury, Judge Catterson was a partner at Arnold & Porter and Kaye Scholer. He previously served as a Justice of the Supreme Court, first on the trial bench in Riverhead, Suffolk County, and then a decade

on the Appellate Division, First Department. He is a graduate of St. John's Law School and Colgate University.

Susan M. Cofield

Prior to her retirement, Ms. Cofield was employed with the New York Department of Education for over 35 years. Over the course of her career with the department, she served in a number of positions including School Social Worker, District Director of Student Support Services, Citywide Director of Guidance, Executive Director of Manhattan Enrollment, and Deputy Chief Executive of the Office of Enrollment. Ms. Cofield graduated from New York University (BA cum laude) and Columbia University School of Social Work (MS with Distinction). She also received an Educational Administration and Supervision Certificate from The City College of New York.

Robert Stephan Cohen

Mr. Cohen is a Senior Partner at Cohen Clair Lans Greifer & Simpson LLP. His area of concentration is in complex family law matters. Prior to his present affiliation, he was a partner at Morrison Cohen LLP where he was also the Managing Partner and Chair of the firm's Executive Committee. He has been the lead lawyer in some of the most important equitable distribution and custody matters in New York and represents individuals in significant matters outside New York including in California, Connecticut, Florida, Georgia, Illinois, Kentucky, Missouri, New Jersey, Virginia and jurisdictions as well outside the United States. He has lectured in the United States, Europe and Asia and has been, for the past 20 years, an Adjunct Professor at the University of Pennsylvania School of Law. He is the author of *Reconcilable Differences* published by Simon & Schuster and has been recognized by The New York Times as one of the most important divorce lawyers in the United States. He has been profiled by The New York Times and the Wall Street Journal, Business Insider and The Financial Times. In 2016, the former Governor Andrew Cuomo named Mr. Cohen Chairperson of the Judicial Screening Committee of the First Judicial Department, which committee he has served on since 2012, and also designated him as a member of the State Judicial Screening Committee. In 2016, he was also appointed as Chairperson of the Supreme Court's Matrimonial Committee, a position he currently holds. Mr. Cohen is a member of The American College of Family Trial Lawyers and a Fellow of the American Academy of Matrimonial Lawyers. His biography appears annually in The Best Lawyers in America, Who's Who in the World, Who's Who in America, Who's Who in American Law, Best Lawyers in New York and Super Lawyers. He attended Alfred University where he is presently a trustee and Fordham University

where he was an editor of the Law Review. He was an officer in the Judge Advocate General's Corp and has completed marathons in both the United States and Europe.

William F. Dahill

Mr. Dahill is a founding partner at Coviello Weber & Dahill LLP, where he focuses his practice on employment litigation and counselling, and complex commercial litigation. Areas of focus include employment counseling, securities industry litigation, payment processing disputes, post-sale transaction disputes, secured lending disputes, partnership disputes and shareholder disputes. Mr. Dahill appears regularly in Federal and State Courts as well as arbitral fora. Mr. Dahill is admitted to the bar in the States of New York and Connecticut, as well as to the bars of the SDNY, EDNY, and the Courts of Appeals for the Second and Fifth Circuits. He is an active member of the Fordham Law Alumni Association, the Network of Bar Leaders, Federal Bar Association – SDNY Chapter, and sits on the Board of Directors for Notre Dame High School, West Haven Connecticut, of which he is an alum. Mr. Dahill received his JD from Fordham University School of Law, cum laude, in 1991, where he served as Managing Editor of the Moot Court Board. Mr. Dahill received his BA in Architecture from Columbia University in 1984.

Lissette A. Duran

Ms. Duran is Counsel at Paul, Weiss, Rifkind, Wharton & Garrison LLC in New York in the Sustainability & Environmental, Social and Governance (“ESG”) Advisory Practice. Ms. Duran has extensive experience advising clients on their ESG efforts, with a focus on diversity, equity, and inclusion (“DEI”) initiatives and disclosures, racial equity audits and assessments, and internal investigations. Prior to joining the ESG practice, she was a litigation associate specializing in complex litigation and regulatory defense, representing leading companies in finance, oil and energy, and technology. Ms. Duran is also very active outside of work. She is a Deputy Regional President for HNBA Region II, a member of the Lideres Board of Latino Justice PRLDEF, and a member of the Board of the Dominican Women’s Development Center. Ms. Duran earned her B.A. from the University of Pennsylvania and her J.D. from Columbia Law School. After graduation, she clerked for Judge Edgardo Ramos at the U.S. District Court for the SDNY.

Virginia Goodman Futterman

Ms. Futterman, a graduate of St. John’s University School of Law, is a senior equity partner at London Fischer LLP, heading a litigation team dedicated to defending complex and high-profile labor law/construction and premises liability matters. Other firm activities include acting chair of London Fischer’s diversity initiative, which she founded. Ms. Futterman

continues, now in the second decade, to serve as an appointed Federal Court mediator in the SDNY and EDNY with primary focus on employment/discrimination cases. Outside the legal arena, continuing a long history of community commitment, Ms. Futterman has acted as President of her co-op board, and has 20 years as an active volunteer at the New York Junior League.

Julie Goldscheid

Ms. Goldscheid is a Professor of Law Emeritus at CUNY School of Law, where she also served as Senior Associate Dean for Academic Affairs, and currently teaches Gender Violence at NYU School of Law. She has held positions including senior staff attorney and acting legal director at Legal Momentum (formerly NOW Legal Defense and Education Fund) and as general counsel at Safe Horizon, a leading victim services organization. She is a graduate of New York University Law School and has taught at Yale, Columbia, Penn State and Brooklyn law schools. She serves on the Board of Directors of the Center for Survivor Agency and Justice (CSAJ) and has served on the Board of Directors of the Stonewall Community Foundation and other NGO's and has been active in bar association committees and task forces.

Phillip C. Hamilton

Mr. Hamilton, a managing partner at Hamilton Clarke, LLP, manages a caseload primarily consisting of serious, complex felony matters, civil rights actions, and contractual litigation in both state and federal court.

C. Willem Houck

Mr. Houck is a proven innovator in blue chip companies as well as a successful investor and operator in early and growth stage healthcare and technology businesses. Known for his passionate and encouraging leadership approach to building high performance teams, Mr. Houck enjoys an international reputation for finding and extracting value from new products and business models. Most recently, he was appointed CEO of an early-stage biotech that is developing a highly promising cure for HIV as well as several oncological diseases. Before that, he was the CEO of DEARhealth, a UCLA spin-out of doctors and scientists that supports decision making with the help of AI. Earlier, he identified the market opportunity in the U.S. for automated and personalized consumer healthcare fulfillment services and founded Daklapack US. He co-founded the Health Care Financial Exchange, a market-driven healthcare payment system, creating competition through transparency in the opaque Healthcare market. Founder of Girasol NY, a forward looking and pioneering early-stage technology company specializing in medical devices, healthcare

business innovation and database technology, he was involved with NICO-lab, an AI assisted acute care diagnostic company; iValue UAB, developer of a biological pacemaker based on groundbreaking research by Columbia University Medical Center; and iDx Ventures, maker of ClariFlow, an affordable DIY early stage enlarged prostate detection kit. As the Chairman and CEO of Philips' global B2B board, he refocused the company to a customer driven organization, and he was an early leader of its activities in energy management and led its global technology incubators. At iFortress, he was recruited by a high-profile board to turn the business around in 18 months by renegotiating debt and signing significant new business. A lawyer by training with a bilingual MBA focused on strategic marketing from Hautes Etudes Commerciales (HEC) in Paris and several senior executive degrees from IMD and INSEAD, he's a proud dual citizen of the USA and the Netherlands, spending his time in New York as well as The Hague. For almost 10 years he was the volunteer chairman of The Netherland Club of New York, founded in 1903.

Jaipat S. Jain

Mr. Jain represents domestic and international technology and other clients in transactional matters, principally private mergers and acquisitions, private securities transactions and corporate finance, and choice, organization and governance of business entities. His clients regularly also seek his counsel in matters relating to data transfer and privacy, licensing and development of technology (particularly software as a service), employment, distribution and supply, asset-based lending, commercial mortgage lending, leasing and conveyance of commercial real estate, and international trade and financing. His clients include fintech and telepathology companies, manufacturers of specialty chemicals, global conglomerates engaged in mining and manufacturing, private equity funds, among others. Mr. Jain came to the United States as an international business executive, first as a manager and then as the Country Head of the U.S. branch of one of South Asia's largest global trading company. As an international business executive, he traveled to and did business in various countries. He brings to practice of law rich first-hand experience of a successful global businessman. As a lawyer, he sees his role as helping clients create wealth and make sound business decisions. He is often the lawyer of choice for private transactions (below about \$150 m) between India and the United States. Mr. Jain's clients also lean on him for help in resolving business disputes. In that role, he works with the firm's litigation teams and makes sure that clients priorities drive the outcome in a personalized setting. Mr. Jain is a member of the New York State Attorney Grievance Committee (First Department) (2021-26). He has held and continues to hold various leadership positions in local and national bar associations. Notably, with the New York City Bar Association (Board of Directors, 2020-24), and the American Bar Association (Presidential Appointment to

Editorial Board of the ABA/ Bloomberg Law Lawyers' Manual on Professional Conduct, 2022-25; Presidential Appointment to the Standing Committee on International Trade in Legal Services (2024-27); Member to ABA Council, Section of Science and Technology (2024-27); Chair, India Committee (2019-2022); Chair, Legal Practice, Ethics & Delivery of Legal Services Division (2022); Vice Chair, EPrivacy Committee (2020-25) and Cloud Computing Committee (2022-25). Mr. Jain has also been elected as a Life Fellow of the American Bar Foundation. On a private level, Mr. Jain was instrumental in replicating Shikharji, Jainism's most important place of pilgrimage, over 120-acres of land at Siddhachalam, New Jersey, and is currently engaged in founding Siddhachal Bahubali Tirth pilgrimage there. He is an Honorary Trustee of Siddhachalam and has in the past served as its President. Mr. Jain is a frequent speaker at business and law conferences in the U.S. and abroad and has chaired several continuing legal education and other programs.

Barbara Kairson, PhD

Dr. Kairson is the former Administrator of District Council 37, AFSCME, AFL-CIO Education Fund Trust which provides education benefits to New York City municipal workers and she currently serves as Chair of the Board of Trustees of the Urban Home Ownership Corporation and the Cendevco Corporation. She is a graduate of the City College of New York, the New School, and Capella University and holds a Certificate in Labor Studies from the Cornell University School of Industrial and Labor Relations. She was re-elected in 2022 to a second term as President of the New York Coalition of One Hundred Black Women, Inc., where she works with many community-based charitable and civic organizations. Appointed in 2023, she is serving in her first term with the Committee.

J. Andrew Kent

Prof. Kent is the Joseph M. McLaughlin Professor of Law at Fordham University School of Law, where he has taught since 2007. He is a graduate of Yale Law School and Harvard College. After law school, he clerked for judges on the U.S. Court of Appeals for the Second Circuit and the U.S. District Court for the Eastern District of New York, then practiced law in the litigation departments of Sullivan & Cromwell and Wilmer Hale. While on leave from Fordham, Mr. Kent served as Senior Counsel to the Solicitor General of New York, in the Office of the Attorney General. He is admitted to practice law in New York and in a number of federal courts.

Devika Kewalramani

Ms. Kewalramani is a partner and global general counsel at FisherBroyles LLP. She is a graduate of CUNY School of Law and St. Xavier's College, Calcutta University, India. Ms.

Kewalramani is admitted to practice law in New York and the U.S. District Court, SDNY, and is a Registered Foreign Lawyer in England & Wales. She is a member of the New York State Bar Association's Committee on Standards of Attorney Conduct (COSAC). Ms. Kewalramani is a former vice president of the New York City Bar, former chair of its Board of Directors and its former secretary, a former co-chair of the City Bar's Council on the Profession, and a former chair of the City Bar's Committee on Professional Discipline. She is a member of the International Board of Advisors of Jindal Global Law School, India, a former member of the Foundation Board of CUNY School of Law, and a former member of the Editorial Board of The Practical Lawyer. Ms. Kewalramani is a former member of the NYSBA's 2020 Restarting the Economy Work Group, and a former member of the New York Commission on Statewide Attorney Discipline and she served as a co-chair of its Subcommittee on Transparency and Access. She is a member of the Attorney Grievance Committee for the First Judicial Department.

Amy L. Legow

Ms. Legow graduated with honors from Tufts University in 1980 with a BA in Social Psychology. After graduating from Cardozo Law School in 1983, she spent two years as an associate at the O'Melveny & Myers Law Firm in Los Angeles. Upon returning to New York in 1985, Ms. Legow joined the Manhattan DA's Office, where she was assigned to the Special Narcotics Prosecutor's Office. There, Ms. Legow specialized in long term investigations, rising to the position of Senior Investigative Counsel. Ms. Legow left the DA's Office in 1994, after which she served as a real estate manager from 1996-1997. In 1997, she became the Principal Court Attorney to the Honorable Leslie Crocker Snyder, where she remained until 1999, at which point Ms. Legow joined the New York State Organized Crime Task Force as Investigative Counsel. As an expert in long term investigations and electronic surveillance, she spent 12 years at the Organized Crime Task Force, from 2008-2011 as its counsel. In 2011, Ms. Legow was appointed to the position of Chief of the Investigations Bureau at the Richmond County DA's Office, where she remained until retiring in 2016. Currently, Ms. Legow serves on the New York Board of the American Jewish Committee, and on the Board of the Tri-State Maxed Out Women's PAC.

Arthur M. Luxenberg

Mr. Luxenberg is a member of the Law Firm of Weitz & Luxenberg, PC. He is a graduate of The Cardozo School of Law and Yeshiva University. Mr. Luxenberg is admitted to practice law in New York, The US Court of Appeals, Second Circuit, and other federal courts. Mr. Luxenberg is the Former first Vice President & Executive Committee Member

and Member of the Board of Directors of the New York State Trial Lawyers Association. He is also a Member of the Board of Directors and Executive Committee of Yeshiva College, former President of the North Shore Hebrew Academy of Great Neck, New York, and Chairman of the United Soup Kitchens in Israel.

Scott E. Mollen

Mr. Mollen is a highly experienced commercial litigation partner at Herrick, Feinstein, LLP. He regularly advises prominent corporations, financial institutions, public officials and real estate investors and lenders in litigation, mediation, arbitration, and negotiations. Mr. Mollen has also been a court-appointed receiver for properties in and outside of NYC and has served as a Special Master in the NYS Supreme Court. He was appointed by the Chief Judge of the NY Court of Appeals to the NYS Supreme Court Commercial Division Advisory Council. He has also served on the Mayor's Advisory Committee on the Judiciary and currently serves on the NYC Bar Association Judiciary Committee. Mr. Mollen has helped lead the Anti-Defamation League's lobbying effort to get New York State's Hate Crimes Law enacted. For more than three decades, he has authored Realty Law Digest, a weekly column in the New York Law Journal that analyzes real estate case law. Over that span, Mr. Mollen has authored more than 1,500 articles on issues such as development, construction, finance, joint ventures, condominiums, cooperatives, brokerage, zoning, foreclosure, condemnation, environmental issues, and landlord/tenant law.

Christopher Morel

Mr. Morel is a senior associate at Hecker Fink LLP. He was previously a litigation associate at Cravath, Swaine & Moore LLP. He received his BA degree magna cum laude in 2015 from Fordham University, where he majored in Political Science and was elected to Phi Beta Kappa. At Columbia, from which he received his JD in 2018, he was a Stone Scholar, an articles editor of the Law Review, and President of the Latino/a Law Students Association. Following his graduation, from August 2018 to August 2019, he served as a law clerk to the Honorable Margo K. Brodie, US District Court for the EDNY (Brooklyn, NY). From September 2019 to September 2020, he served as a law clerk to the Honorable Julio M. Fuentes, US Court of Appeals for the Third Circuit (Newark, NJ). Mr. Morel is admitted to practice law in New York and in the SDNY, EDNY, Third Circuit Court of Appeals, and Tenth Circuit Court of Appeals.

Vianny M. Paulino-Pichardo

Ms. Paulino-Pichardo is an experienced commercial litigator with over 15 years' experience litigating claims in federal and state courts as well as mediation and arbitration.

She is a former New York litigation shareholder and former corporate associate of a large international law firm. She is currently a member of Beazley's Cyber and Executive Risk Group providing insurance coverage for Tech E&O, IP, media, advertising, cyber and privacy liabilities. Ms. Paulino-Pichardo has been recognized by Super Lawyers as a New York Metro Rising Star since 2015. She received the Hispanic National Bar Association's Top Lawyers under 40 award and Fordham LALSA's Andrew A. Rivera Alumni Achievement Award. Ms. Paulino-Pichardo has held various high-profile leadership roles including serving as President of The Dominican Bar Association representing the interests of Latino lawyers, judges, and law students in the US and as founder of The DBA's Women's Committee, Las Mariposas. She is also a past member of the Latino Justice PRLDEF's Líderes Board. She is currently a member of the Mayor's Advisory Committee on the Judiciary.

Virginia A. Reilly

A life-long New Yorker, Ms. Reilly is currently Of Counsel to the Law Offices of Neal Brickman, PC, focusing primarily on real estate transactional work and litigation support. Ms. Reilly received a BA from Fordham University (1976) and her JD from Washington and Lee University (1981). From 1981 to 1986, Ms. Reilly was an ADA for New York County under DA Robert Morgenthau. During her tenure as an ADA, Ms. Reilly was part of the Sex Crimes Unit under ADA Linda Fairstein. Since moving to private practice, Ms. Reilly has also served as an Arbitrator (Small Claims Court), a Guardian Ad Litem (Surrogate's Court), and has served on various local municipal and educational committees in northern Westchester County. Ms. Reilly is admitted to practice in New York State and the SDNY.

Joanna Rotgers

Ms. Rotgers is the Chief Regulatory Counsel for Marsh Mercer US, which is part of global professional services firm Marsh & McLennan Companies, Inc. She works in the Company's New York headquarters handling a variety of compliance, regulatory and legal matters. Previously, she handled complex litigation matters for the Company, with a focus on defending against professional liability/errors and omissions claims in the US, Canada, and other geographies globally. Before joining Marsh & McLennan, she worked in private practice as a commercial litigator. She holds a JD from the University of Iowa and a BA from Loyola University Chicago.

Deborah Schein

Ms. Schein retired from the United Nations in December 2020 after serving on six peacekeeping missions; Angola, Mozambique, Timor Leste, Bosnia and Herzegovina, Liberia and the Republic of South Sudan, and on a United Nations Political Mission in Guinea Bissau. In August 2015 she worked with the United Nations Special Envoy to Sudan and South Sudan in Addis Ababa during the final phase of the peace talks on the Agreement for the Resolution of the Conflict in South Sudan. Ms. Schein has worked with the Organization for Security and Cooperation in Europe (OSCE) and the Office of the High Representative in Bosnia and Herzegovina. Most recently, she served as an Adjunct Professor for a Columbia University, School of International Affairs, Capstone Project during the fall 2021 semester. She has been a short-term electoral observer with OSCE/ODHIR in North Macedonia, Uzbekistan, and Kazakhstan. She has been working as a consultant with the UN investigating abuse of authority and sexual harassment. She holds a Masters Degree in International Affairs from Columbia University, School of International and Public Affairs.

Beatrice Seravello

Ms. Seravello is a co-head and partner of the NewLaw practice at Baretz + Brunelle, a legal advisory firm. She has spent the greater part of her career serving AmLaw 100 firms in senior executive roles. Prior to that she was the Managing Director for International at the New York Stock Exchange. She is a graduate of Queens College.

Joshua Silber

Mr. Silber is a founding partner of Abend & Silber, PLLC, in Manhattan specializing in civil litigation with a focus on personal injury, medical malpractice and child sexual abuse cases. He has obtained many substantial verdicts and settlements for his clients in nearly 30 years representing the injured in civil cases. Mr. Silber has been named to the NY “Super Lawyers” list as one of the top attorneys in New York in each year from 2011 through the current year and is currently ranked in their “Top 100” in Metro New York. He is a dean of the New York State Trial Lawyer’s Institute and a board member of the New York State Trial Lawyers Association where he has served as co-chair of the Judiciary Committee for many years and has thereby served as chair of the screening panel for candidates to the New York Court of Appeals for the eleven most recent vacancies at that Court. In addition, he is a member of the Bronx County Bar Association and has been elected as a Life Fellow of the American Bar Foundation, an honorary organization of attorneys, judges, law faculty, and legal scholars who have been selected by their peers for outstanding achievements and dedication to the welfare of their communities and to the highest

principles of the legal profession. Mr. Silber has frequently lectured on legal ethics, personal injury, and trial practice in New York and across the country. He received a bachelor's degree from the State University of New York College at Brockport in 1993 and served for many years as a member of the Brockport Foundation Board of Directors, including several years as National Chair of the Annual Fund. He received his law degree, with honors, from the University of Miami in 1996. He is admitted to practice law in New York, New Jersey, and Florida.

S. Yan Sin

Ms. Sin is an attorney at Schwartz Sladkus Reich Greenberg Atlas LLP, where she is an associate in the Matrimonial & Family Law Group. Ms. Sin was the associate law clerk for the Hon. Ellen F. Gesmer, Associate Justice, Appellate Division of the Supreme Court of New York, First Department, when Justice Gesmer was a judge in the Matrimonial Part of the Supreme Court of the State of New York, New York County. Subsequent to her clerkship, Ms. Sin practiced family law in a boutique matrimonial law firm. She has experience litigating divorce, custody, and support matters in Family Court and Supreme Court. She also has a background in immigration law with experience in family-based petitions and the naturalization process. Ms. Sin is an active member of the Asian American Bar Association of New York (AABANY) where she is co-chair of the Pro Bono and Community Service Committee and coordinator of the Manhattan Pro Bono Clinic. She is also a member of the New York State Bar Association's Family Law Section. She enjoys volunteering her time at AABANY's pro bono clinics and Immigration Law and Justice's immigration legal clinics. A graduate of the University of Virginia and New York Law School, Ms. Sin lives in Manhattan and is active in the Chinatown community. She is conversant in Cantonese and loves yoga. Ms. Sin is admitted to practice law in New York and New Jersey.

Jeffrey S. Stillman

Mr. Stillman is founding partner of the Law Firm of Stillman & Stillman, PC in Bronx County which was established in 1998 and for the past 35 years has exclusively represented victims of accidents and has handled related insurance matters. He is a graduate of New York Law School and SUNY Albany. He is admitted to practice in New York and in the Federal courts and was recently admitted to the Bar of the United States Supreme Court. Mr. Stillman is a Director of the New York State Trial Lawyers Association where he is former co-chair of the Automobile/Insurance committee and is current co-chair of the Privacy Protection/Runners committee and assists in the preparation of their yearly CLE

on Legal Ethics. Additionally, he is a long-time member and former Director of the Bronx County Bar Association.

Hon. Milton A. Tingling

Justice Tingling is the New York County Clerk, Commissioner of Jurors and Clerk of Supreme Court. He is a retired New York State Supreme Court Justice. He is the first former jurist to hold these three positions in the history of New York State, and he is the first and only African American to be a County Clerk and Clerk of Supreme Court. He is a graduate of North Carolina Central University School of Law and Brown University. He sits on the First Department Character and Fitness Committee and is a member of the NYCBA, New York County Lawyers' Association, and the Metropolitan Black Bar Association. He is Chairperson of the Board of West Harlem Development Corporation and Community League of The Heights. In addition, he sits on the Executive Board of the Greater Harlem Chamber of Commerce and the City College President's Advisory Board.

Elisabeth Lisa Vicens

Ms. Vicens is a partner in the firm Cleary Gottlieb Steen & Hamilton LLP. Based in the New York office, Ms. Vicens represents clients in internal and governmental investigations, and in complex litigation matters arising from cross-border disputes. Ms. Vicens received her J.D. from the New York University School of Law and a B.S. from Georgetown University. She is admitted to practice law in New York, the U.S. Court of Appeals for the Second Circuit, and the U.S. Supreme Court. Ms. Vicens is a board member of the Office of the Appellate Defender, board member of Her Justice, a member of the Vance Center Committee for Cyrus R. Vance Center for International Justice, and a member of the Committee on Civic Education for the U.S. Court of Appeals for the Second Circuit.

Terel R. Watson

Mr. Watson currently serves as an ADA and Deputy Director of the Legal Training Unit with the New York County DA's Office. He also briefly worked as an associate with a civil litigation firm on Wall Street. Mr. Watson has investigated and tried numerous serious violent and white-collar felonies in New York State Supreme Court. He is licensed to practice law in New York State, SDNY, and EDNY and serves as an Adjunct Professor at the NYC College of Technology-CUNY, where he teaches numerous legal studies courses, including Ethics and Civil Procedure. Mr. Watson has also served as an Adjunct Professor and Co-Director of the Criminal Prosecution Clinic at New York Law School. Mr. Watson is a graduate of the Benjamin N. Cardozo School of Law, where he focused his studies on areas of constitutional law, litigation, and civil rights. While in law school, Mr. Watson was

a member of the Moot Court Honor Society and interned for now-retired SDNY Judge Ronald L. Ellis. Currently, he sits on numerous boards at the New York City College of Technology-CUNY and advises their Law and Paralegal Studies Program. He is also an active member of the NYCBA, where he sits on their Education and the Law Committee, and the NYCLA, where he sits on their Law Related Education and Criminal Justice Committees.

Judith E. White

Before becoming a partner at Lee Anav Chung White Kim Ruger & Richter, LLP, where she founded the Matrimonial Department, Ms. White was a founding Member of Garr & White, PC. Ms. White also worked as the Principal Court Attorney to one of the Justices of the New York State Supreme Court, Matrimonial Part, for nine years. As a court attorney she had the unique opportunity to learn the practice of matrimonial law from the inside. Ms. White assisted in keeping abreast of all developments in the law, drafting decisions, and negotiating settlements. Following her tenure in the courts it was a natural progression for Ms. White to include mediation in her practice. She has successfully mediated countless divorce and separation agreements. She is listed as one of the Best Lawyers of America since 2010 and has been recognized as one of the Top Lawyers in the New York, New Jersey, and Connecticut areas for 2010 to the present, one of the top ten women lawyers in the New York Metro Area since 2018, and Top 50 Women Attorneys in NY since 2014- 18 by both The New York Times and New York Magazine. She has received an AV Rating for Legal Abilities and Ethical Standards in the Martindale Hubbell Listing. She has also served as a moot court judge for New York Law School. While Ms. White enjoys her work with private clients, she has maintained a strong commitment to public service. In 2007, under the auspices of the NY CO Women's Bar Association, she co-founded "The Matrimonial Project," the only completely pro bono matrimonial legal service in New York State. She and co-chair were awarded the Hannah Cohen award for pro bono work in 2016. Before attending law school, she interned as a legislative assistant to a US Congressman and worked for the Environmental Protection Agency. While in law school Ms. White continued her dedication to public service by working pro bono with the Vietnam Veterans of America Legal Services, representing former servicemen and women in Administrative Hearings. Following law school, she worked as a staff attorney for the NYC Legal Aid Society in the Criminal Defense Division where she tried over fifty felony and misdemeanor cases.

Mark C. Zauderer

Mr. Zauderer is a prominent trial lawyer and partner in Dorf Nelson & Zauderer LLP in New York City. He served by appointment of Chief Judge Judith S. Kaye as Chair of New York's Commission on the Jury; as a member of the Chief Judge's Task Force that established New York's Commercial Division; and currently as a member of the Chief Judge's Commercial Division Advisory Council. He is currently serving as a referee with all the powers of a Supreme Court judge, to oversee litigation and the wind-up of a major law firm. Mr. Zauderer is a member of the Appellate Division, First Department Grievance Committee. He is a past President of the Federal Bar Council and is a former Chair of the Commercial and Federal Litigation Section of the New York State Bar Association. He is a member of the Governor's Judicial Screening Committee for Supreme Court judges applying for appointment to the Appellate Division, First Department and since 1992 has been a member of the Advisory Committee on Civil Practice to the Chief Administrative Judge, which drafts the CPLR. In 1995, Mr. Zauderer presented to the House of Delegates of the New York State Bar Association the civility rules that are essentially those that are now in effect in New York State. In 2016, he delivered the commencement address at Touro Law School and was awarded the degree of Doctor of Laws Honoris Causa. Zauderer is a frequent lecturer on legal issues and frequently comments on legal issues both in print and on television.

THE DISCIPLINARY PROCESS

Complaints, Investigations, and Dismissals

The disciplinary process usually commences with the filing of a complaint with the AGC against an attorney, who is referred to as a “respondent.” Complaints typically come from clients but may also come from other attorneys and members of the public at large. Investigations may also be authorized by a Committee acting *sua sponte*. All disciplinary investigations and proceedings are confidential, pursuant to Judiciary Law 90(10), until the Court publicly disciplines a respondent or issues an unsealing order, upon “good cause being shown.”

When a complaint is entered into the AGC’s database, the system generates a report of the respondent’s disciplinary history, and a staff attorney receives the matter for screening. The screening attorney makes a preliminary recommendation regarding jurisdiction to determine if the complaint should be referred to another public agency or grievance committee. If it appears that there is no misconduct, but there has been a breakdown in communication between the lawyer and the client, the AGC may refer the matter to be mediated by the New York City Bar Association. The screening attorney may also recommend rejection of a complaint for any one of several reasons, e.g., the complaint lacks merit, seeks legal advice, is an attempt to collect a debt, or involves a fee dispute. A mandatory mediation/arbitration program exists to deal with fee disputes in civil and matrimonial matters, where the amount in dispute is between \$1,000 and \$50,000. If the complaint involves the same substantial and material allegations that will be decided in pending litigation, the AGC may defer the matter pending resolution of the litigation, which may result in a judgment binding on the respondent. If the complaint alleges serious misconduct by an attorney, such as conversion of client funds, the AGC will immediately pursue an investigation.

If it appears from the complaint that a respondent may have engaged in serious professional misconduct, the screening attorney brings the matter to the attention of the Chief Attorney for direct assignment to a staff attorney. If the misconduct appears to be very serious, e.g., conversion of escrow funds, investigation of the matter is expedited.

The Chief Attorney approves all “first screening” dismissal recommendations made by the screening attorney. If a matter is not dismissed following the initial screening, a paralegal sends the complaint to the respondent for an answer to the allegations. Thereafter, the paralegal may forward the answer to the complainant for a reply. The paralegal may then

prepare a summary of the allegations and defenses and refer the file to the initial screening attorney who performs a “second screening,” or further evaluation of the complaint, answer, and reply. On second screening, the screening attorney may recommend dismissal of the complaint for a variety of reasons.

A matter that warrants additional investigation is forwarded by the screening attorney to the Chief Attorney for review and assignment to a staff attorney. The assigned staff attorney may obtain further documentation using subpoenas when necessary, may interview witnesses including the complainant, and may question the respondent on the record and under oath (examination under oath/deposition).

When the investigation is complete, the staff attorney makes a recommendation to the Committee members for dismissal, or the imposition of a Letter of Advisement (non-disciplinary), Letter of Admonition (private discipline), or formal disciplinary proceedings against the respondent which could result in public discipline. The staff attorney’s supervisor (a Deputy Chief Attorney) and the Chief Attorney review all recommendations before they are submitted to the Committee members. One of the volunteer Committees must approve all post-investigation recommendations by a majority vote of those present at a monthly meeting (a quorum of two-thirds of the members is required to conduct business). When matters are dismissed on the merits, the closing letter to the complainant includes a brief explanation of the reason for the dismissal and indicates the complainant’s right to request reconsideration of the dismissal within 30 days.

Letters of Advisement [22 NYCRR 1240.2(i)]

The AGC issues a Letter of Advisement (Advisement) when an investigation reveals that a respondent has engaged in conduct requiring comment that, under the facts of the case, does not warrant the imposition of discipline. An Advisement is confidential, and does not in itself constitute discipline, but may be considered by the Committee or the Court in determining the action to be taken or the discipline to be imposed upon a subsequent finding of misconduct.

Letters of Admonition [22 NYCRR 1240.2(b)]

The AGC issues a Letter of Admonition (Admonition) when an investigation reveals that a respondent has violated New York’s Rules of Professional Conduct¹ (Rules), but not

¹ The Rules, which became effective April 1, 2009, were promulgated by a Joint Order of the Appellate Divisions of the State of New York, dated December 30, 2008, and signed by the Presiding Justice of each of the four departments. These Rules replaced the Lawyer’s Code of Professional Responsibility, previously referred to as the “Disciplinary Rules.”

seriously enough to warrant a formal disciplinary proceeding, pursuant to 22 NYCRR 1240.7(d)(2)(v). For example, an Admonition may be issued if a respondent neglected only one legal matter and there were mitigating factors, whereas formal disciplinary proceedings would likely be commenced if multiple incidents of neglect are alleged.

Although it is private and remains confidential, an Admonition is a finding of professional misconduct and becomes a part of the respondent's permanent disciplinary record. The Admonition may be considered in determining the action to be taken or the discipline to be imposed upon a subsequent finding of misconduct against a respondent. When the AGC proposes to issue an Admonition, the respondent is afforded an opportunity to appear before the Committee to seek reconsideration. After an Admonition is issued, the respondent may file a motion with the Court to vacate it.

Applications to the Appellate Division

Public discipline requires an order of the Court. The AGC applies to the Court by motion or petition which includes the record of the disciplinary proceedings and the Court action requested. When the Court imposes a public sanction, it issues an order and a written opinion which is almost always published in the New York Law Journal and is otherwise public.² The order imposes a public sanction ranging from a public censure (no suspension) or short suspension to disbarment (seven-year bar from practicing). The Court may also impose a private sanction, dismiss a matter, or remand it back to the AGC for further proceedings.

Formal Disciplinary Proceedings [22 NYCRR 1240.7(d)(2)(vi)]

The Committee members authorize a formal disciplinary proceeding when there is credible evidence that a respondent engaged in professional misconduct warranting the imposition of public discipline, and that such discipline is appropriate to protect the public, maintain the integrity and honor of the profession, or deter others from committing similar misconduct.

A staff attorney's recommendation that formal proceedings be filed against a respondent must be based on a showing of professional misconduct reviewed by a Deputy Chief Attorney and approved by the Chief Attorney and the Committee members. Upon approval, the AGC serves the respondent with a petition in which it requests that the Court sustain

² If the Court imposes public discipline, the record of proceedings is available for public inspection at the First Department Committee on Character and Fitness located at 41 Madison Avenue, 26th Floor, New York, New York 10010.

the charges or, if there are factual or legal issues in dispute, to appoint a referee to hear the charges.³ Within 20 days after service of the respondent's answer or, if applicable, a reply, the AGC must file with the Court a "Statement of Disputed and Undisputed Facts." The respondent has 20 days to respond. In the alternative, within 30 days after service of the answer or, if applicable, a reply, the parties may file a Joint Stipulation of Disputed and Undisputed Facts or a statement that the pleadings raise no issue of fact requiring a hearing, pursuant to 22 NYCRR 1240.8(a)(2). At any time after the filing of the petition, the parties may file a joint motion with the Court requesting the imposition of "Discipline by Consent," to avoid a hearing, pursuant to 22 NYCRR 1240.8(a)(5). The motion must outline the agreed upon discipline to be imposed, which may include monetary restitution authorized by Judiciary Law 90(6-a), and the respondent's affidavit conditionally admitting the acts of professional misconduct.

Under the Court's rules, respondents have the right to appear, to be represented by counsel, to cross-examine staff witnesses, and to present their own witnesses and exhibits. The proceedings before the referee are transcribed, and are conducted in two separate parts, liability hearing and sanction (mitigation and aggravation evidence) hearing. A referee cannot proceed with a sanction hearing until the referee sustains at least one charge. A referee makes a finding on the charges shortly after the end of the liability hearing. The referee usually asks the parties to submit memoranda regarding liability and sanction. When the hearing (liability and sanction) is concluded, the referee is required to file with the Court a written "Report and Recommendation" containing findings of facts, conclusions of law, charges sustained or dismissed, and a recommendation as to sanction (referee's Report). The AGC or the respondent may file a motion with the Court to confirm or disaffirm the referee's Report. See NYCRR 1240.8(b).

Collateral Estoppel

Rather than pursue formal charges, in an appropriate case, the AGC may file a motion with the Court applying the doctrine of collateral estoppel, seeking an order finding a lawyer guilty of violating the Rules solely on the basis of prior civil or criminal court decisions without a further hearing. The Court may grant such a motion where the findings and issues in the prior action are identical to the disciplinary issues against the respondent and where a respondent has had a full and fair opportunity to litigate in the prior proceeding. In such

³ Hearings before referees are normally closed to the public, except in rare cases when a respondent waives confidentiality. The referees conduct hearings like trials, taking testimony and receiving exhibits in accordance with the rules of evidence. The referees have broad discretion as to what is considered relevant and admissible evidence. A transcript is made of the entire proceeding.

cases, a hearing is held before a referee on the issue of sanction only and the AGC or the respondent files a motion with the Court to confirm or disaffirm the referee's Report.

Interim Suspensions [22 NYCRR 1240.9]

Under certain circumstances, the Court may suspend a respondent from practice on an interim basis upon the AGC's motion. Such a finding may be based upon the respondent's default in responding to a petition or subpoena to appear for a formal interview, the respondent's admissions under oath of professional misconduct, the respondent's failure to comply with a lawful demand of the Court or the AGC, the respondent's willful failure to pay money owed to a client (which debt is demonstrated by an admission, judgment, or other clear and convincing evidence), or other uncontested evidence of professional misconduct.

Resignations [22 NYCRR 1240.10]

A respondent may apply to resign from the practice of law, while an investigation or proceeding is pending, by submitting to the Court an application admitting the nature of the charges or the allegations under investigation. When the matter includes allegations that the respondent has willfully misappropriated or misapplied money or property in the practice of law, the respondent must consent to the entry of an order to make monetary restitution pursuant to Judiciary Law 90(6-a). If the Court accepts the resignation, the respondent is disbarred from practicing law for seven years, pursuant to Judiciary Law 90(2).

Diversion [22 NYCRR 1240.11]

When in defense or as a mitigating factor in an investigation or formal disciplinary charges, the respondent raises a claim of impairment based on alcohol or substance abuse, or other mental or physical health issues, the Court, upon application of any person or on its own motion, may stay the investigation or proceeding and direct the respondent to complete an appropriate treatment and monitoring program approved by the Court. When the Court considers diversion to a monitoring program, it takes into account the nature of the alleged misconduct; whether the alleged misconduct occurred during a time period when the respondent suffered from the claimed impairment; and, whether diverting the respondent to a program is in the public interest.

Convictions [22 NYCRR 1240.12]

If an attorney is found guilty of any crime, the attorney must notify the grievance committee having jurisdiction within 30 days, pursuant to 22 NYCRR 1240.7(a)(2). The AGC must

file a motion directly with the Court when an attorney has been convicted of a felony or “serious crime.” An attorney who is convicted of a felony in New York, or an analogous felony in another state or federal jurisdiction, ceases to be an attorney by operation of law, pursuant to Judiciary Law 90(4-a), and the AGC must apply to the Court to have the attorney’s name stricken from the roll of attorneys in New York. In cases where the Court, on the AGC’s motion, has determined that a lawyer has been convicted of a crime which is not analogous to a New York felony, but is a serious crime under New York’s Judiciary Law 90(4)(d), the Court assigns the case to a referee to hear the matter. Thereafter, the AGC or the respondent files a motion with the Court to confirm or disaffirm the referee’s Report. Serious crime cases result in the same range of sanctions imposed in other formal disciplinary proceedings.

Reciprocal Discipline [22 NYCRR 1240.13]

The AGC is required to file an application with the Court if an attorney has been found guilty of an ethical violation in another jurisdiction and “reciprocal discipline” is warranted. An attorney that is subject to the jurisdiction of the First Department, pursuant to 22 NYCRR 1240.7(a)(2), is required to notify the Court and the AGC if discipline is imposed on the attorney by a foreign jurisdiction. The Court may discipline the attorney for the misconduct committed in the other jurisdiction unless it finds that the procedure in the foreign jurisdiction deprived the respondent of due process, that there was insufficient proof that the respondent committed the misconduct, or that the imposition of discipline would be unjust.

Incapacity [22 NYCRR 1240.14]

If an attorney suffers from a mental disability or condition, alcohol or substance abuse, or any other condition that renders him/her incapacitated from practicing law, the AGC or the attorney may apply to the Court for a determination that the attorney is incapacitated from practicing law. Applications by the attorney must include medical proof demonstrating the incapacity. In such cases, the Court may appoint a medical expert to examine the attorney and render a report. When the Court finds that an attorney is incapacitated, it enters an order immediately suspending the attorney from practicing and may stay the pending disciplinary proceeding or investigation.

Upon application by the AGC that includes a judicial determination that an attorney needs involuntary care or treatment in a facility for the mentally disabled, or is the subject of an order of incapacity, retention, commitment, or treatment pursuant to the Mental Hygiene

Law, the Court may enter an order immediately suspending the attorney from the practice of law.

Reinstatements [22 NYCRR 1240.16, 1240.17]

Upon motion of a respondent who has been disbarred or suspended, the Court may issue an order reinstating such respondent upon the respondent's showing, by clear and convincing evidence, that the respondent has complied with the disbarment order, the suspension order, or the order which removed the respondent from the roll of attorneys; the respondent has complied with the rules of the Court, and has the requisite character and fitness to practice law; and that it would be in the public interest to reinstate the respondent to the practice of law. A suspended respondent may apply for reinstatement after the expiration of the period of suspension or as otherwise directed by the Court, except that respondents suspended for a fixed term of six months or less may apply for reinstatement 30 days prior to the expiration of the term of suspension. A disbarred respondent may apply for reinstatement to practice after the expiration of seven years from the entry of the order of disbarment.

REPRESENTATIVE CASES

Although the AGC, in conjunction with the Committee, engages in multiple functions in a confidential manner that do not result in public discipline, many matters become public when the Court acts on motions made by the AGC. In 2024, the Court publicly disciplined 60 lawyers as follows: 12 interim suspensions, 16 disbarments, 9 disciplinary resignations by an attorney facing charges (equivalent to disbarment), 18 suspensions as discipline, and 5 public censures.

Interim Suspensions

The Court's rules provide that an attorney may be suspended from the practice of law pending consideration of charges against the attorney for: (1) a default in responding to pending charges of professional misconduct or failure to comply with lawful demands made in connection with an investigation; (2) a substantial admission under oath that the attorney has committed an act or acts of professional misconduct; (3) other uncontested evidence of professional misconduct; or (4) willful failure to pay money owed to a client evidenced by a judgment, or other clear and convincing evidence.

The most serious misconduct involves the theft or misappropriation of money belonging to clients. The Court has repeatedly stated that the intentional conversion of money that an attorney holds as a fiduciary or for a client requires disbarment, except in rare cases where there are exceptional mitigating circumstances. In such cases, the AGC will seek an immediate suspension of an attorney if there is sufficient evidence to justify the motion because such misconduct immediately threatens the public interest. In addition, the AGC will seek the suspension of an attorney who fails to cooperate in answering a complaint or does not comply with lawful demands for information or records. In 2024, the Court suspended 12 attorneys on an interim basis pending resolution of the charges against them in the following cases: *Matter of Ghenya B. Grant*, 224 AD3d 1; *Matter of Allison G. Kort*, 224 AD3d 15; *Matter of Michael J. Little*, 225 AD3d 19; *Matter of Chadwick L. Hooker*, 229 AD3d 22; *Matter of Michael O. King, Jr.*, 229 AD3d 185; *Matter of Daphna Zekaria*, 230 AD3d 19; *Matter of Sally M. Gard*, 230 AD3d 96; *Matter of Matthew C. Browndorf*, 231 AD3d 28; *Matter of Stefan M. Miller*, 231 AD3d 100; *Matter of John S. Jenkins*, 232 AD3d 7; *Matter of Jose X. Orochena*, 232 AD3d 228; *Matter of Allen Yusufov*, 234 AD3d 71.

Disbarments

In 2024, the Court disbarred 16 attorneys. Three attorneys were disbarred after formal charges: *Matter of Rudolph William Giuliani*, 230 AD3d 101; *Matter of Derek R. Etheridge*,

231 AD3d 125; and *Matter of Rahul D. Manchanda*, 233 AD3d 169. Three attorneys were disbarred after petitions for reciprocal discipline: *Matter of Lisa A. Wellman*, 227 AD3d 96; *Matter of Alexander R. Cane*, 228 AD3d 104; and *Matter of Stephen M. Bander*, 232 AD3d 1. Three attorneys were disbarred pursuant to 22 NYCRR 1240.9(b), when they failed to write to the AGC or Court to request a hearing or reinstatement within six months of their interim suspension: *Matter of David A. Tessler*, 223 AD3d 102; *Matter of Kofi O. Amankwaah*, 232 AD3d 82; and *Matter of John Naccarato*, 233 AD3d 35. Finally, the Court struck the names of seven attorneys after felony convictions: *Matter of Arthur G. Cohen*, 227 AD3d 18; *Matter of Telesforo Del Valle, Jr.*, 227 AD3d 22; *Matter of Fausto Simoes*, 229 AD3d 147; *Matter of Lawrence A. Cline*, 230 AD3d 79; *Matter of Allen A. Gessen*, 232 AD3d 164; *Matter of Brian J. Smith*, 233 AD3d 1; and *Matter of George Royle*, 234 AD3d 97.

Disciplinary Resignations

An attorney is permitted to resign from the bar during an investigation by the AGC, or after the filing of charges, if the attorney submits an affidavit, pursuant to 22 NYCRR 1240.10, acknowledging that the attorney knows the nature of the potential charges and cannot defend against them. A resignation is the equivalent of disbarment. In 2024, the Court accepted nine resignations under 22 NYCRR 1240.10, and ordered their names stricken from the roll of attorneys: *Matter of Pamela D. Hayes*, 225 AD3d 1; *Matter of Bryan A. McKenna*, 226 AD3d 149; *Matter of Luke D. Lynch, Jr.*, 229 AD3d 37; *Matter of Marvin Srulowitz*, 229 AD3d 40; *Matter of Michael Markovitch*, 229 AD3d 191; *Matter of Jack H. Nguyen*, 231 AD3d 219; *Matter of John N. Iannuzzi*, 233 AD3d 159; *Matter of Roderic D. Boyd*, 233 AD3d 190; and *Matter of Afia Sengupta*, 233 AD3d 199.

Suspensions as Discipline

A suspension can be ordered by the Court as discipline and to protect the public. The Court imposes suspension for conviction of “serious crimes,” as defined in Judiciary Law 90(4)(d), for reciprocal discipline, and for misconduct. In 2024, the Court suspended 18 attorneys for periods ranging from one month to two years: *Matter of Markis M. Abraham*, 215 NYS3d 95; *Matter of Matthew A. Melville*, 223 AD3d 48; *Matter of Joseph H. Lilly, III*, 223 AD3d 105; *Matter of Howard L. Margulis*, 225 AD3d 23; *Matter of Steven J. Kwestel*, 228 AD3d 36; *Matter of Mustafa D. Sayid*, 228 AD3d 41; *Matter of Andrew J. Dancy*, 229 AD3d 8; *Matter of Timothy J. McIlwain*, 229 AD3d 15; *Matter of Daniel C. Feldman*, 230 AD3d 13; *Matter of Mark E. Heimendinger*, 230 AD3d 35; *Matter of Karamvir Dahiya*, 230 AD3d 72; *Matter of Douglas B. Levy*, 231 AD3d 62; *Matter of Richard Adam*, 232 AD3d 105; *Matter of Ethan Ruby*, 232 AD3d 179; *Matter of Colin C.*

McNary, 232 AD3d 221; *Matter of Jeffrey L. Liddle*, 233 AD3d 127; *Matter of John T. Wynn*, 233 AD3d 162; and *Matter of William J. Miller*, 233 AD3d 195.

Suspensions for Medical Disability

The Court's rules provide that an attorney may be suspended if judicially declared incompetent or if the Court concludes that the attorney is incapacitated from continuing to practice law. Pursuant to 22 NYCRR 1240.14(b), any pending disciplinary proceedings against the attorney shall be held in abeyance after the Court decides that the attorney is incapacitated to practice of law. In 2024, the Court suspended zero attorneys on these grounds.

Public Censures

The least severe form of public discipline that the Court may impose is a censure (see 22 NYCRR 1240.2[c]). In 2024, the Court issued public censures in five cases: *Matter of Jeffrey M. Rosin*, 229 AD3d 195; *Matter of Christopher D. Parker*, 231 AD3d 55; *Matter of Jeffrey C. Neiman*, 232 AD3d 86; *Matter of Davion S.E. Chism*, 232 AD3d 141; and *Matter of John R. Melogy*, 233 AD3d 135.

Reinstatements

Judiciary Law 90 and rule 22 NYCRR 1240.16 permit attorneys to apply for reinstatement to the practice of law after a period of suspension, or seven years after disbarment. Attorneys who are suspended for six months or less may file an application for reinstatement pursuant to 22 NYCRR 1240.16(d). An attorney who has been suspended for a period of more than six months may apply to the Court for reinstatement upon the expiration of the period of suspension. An attorney who has been disbarred, or stricken from the roll of attorneys, may not apply for reinstatement until the expiration of seven years from the effective date of disbarment. In 2024, the Court granted five petitions for reinstatement after discipline.

Dishonored Check Investigations

Deputy Chief Attorney Kevin P. Culley screens all complaints which the AGC receives, pursuant to the dishonored check reporting rule 22 NYCRR 1300; he also investigates and prosecutes other matters involving allegations of professional misconduct. Mr. Culley coordinates all necessary contacts with banking institutions and the Lawyers' Fund for Client Protection, supervises staff investigators in obtaining required banking and bookkeeping records, and recommends the disposition of the dishonored check matters. He has also delivered several presentations about proper escrow management at Continuing

Legal Education courses and has testified as an expert witness for the District Attorney of New York County and has testified as an expert witness for the District Attorney of New York County.

Immigration Complaints

Staff attorney Jun Hwa Lee screens all immigration matters; she also investigates and prosecutes other matters involving allegations of professional misconduct. She coordinates the AGC's efforts with other agencies that target immigration fraud, and she supervises the AGC's use of immigration "Special Counsels" appointed by the Court to assist in our investigations. Ms. Lee participates in a task force called Protecting Immigrants New York (PINY) and speaks at various Continuing Learning Education courses regarding immigration matters.

PUBLIC DISCIPLINE CASES

Several of the cases prosecuted by staff attorneys which became a matter of public discipline in 2024 are reviewed below:

Matter of Markis M. Abraham, 215 NYS3d 95 (1st Dept 2024)

(Three-month suspension.) Abraham was admitted to practice in New Jersey. Over the course of the representation of a client, Abraham and his client discussed investing in real estate together. To that end, Abraham received a \$140,000 loan from a client that was intended to be used to invest in real estate. There was neither a loan agreement in place, nor did Abraham explain the inherent conflict to his client. Abraham deposited the money into his attorney trust account and then transferred it into his personal account. Subsequently, his client became incapacitated and was found ineligible for Medicaid due to the \$140,000 recently depleted from his account. Separately, Abraham neglected two of the same client's matters resulting in default judgments. Abraham filed a disciplinary stipulation in New Jersey where he admitted to the foregoing. The New Jersey Supreme Court imposed a three-month suspension. Upon the AGC's motion for reciprocal discipline, the Court ordered a three-month suspension. (Staff Attorney Louis J. Bara)

Matter of Andrew J. Dancy, 229 AD3d 8 (1st Dept 2024)

(Three-month suspension.) Dancy was admitted to practice in Tennessee. Dancy was investigated upon a complaint that he failed to perform work that he was retained to do. The investigation revealed that Dancy failed to supervise his employee and as a result, his client's house was foreclosed. Dancy then offered to attempt to remedy the situation for an additional fee from his client. Based on the foregoing, the AGC moved for a reciprocal public censure. The Court, after considering the gravity of the Dancy's misconduct and the affect that it had on his client, departed from the discipline issued in Tennessee and ordered a three-month suspension. (Staff Attorney Louis J. Bara)

Matter of Allison G. Kort, 224 AD3d 15 (1st Dept 2024)

(Interim suspension.) Kort was admitted to practice in Missouri. The Missouri disciplinary authorities received three separate complaints that Kort missed various court deadlines and otherwise neglected client matters. After Kort failed to respond to their investigatory inquiries, Missouri moved for her immediate suspension. In June 2023, the Supreme Court of Missouri interimly suspended Kort. Only then did Kort file papers to vacate the suspension, arguing that she did not have proper notice. That motion was denied. Kort self-reported the above to the AGC, as required. As such, the AGC moved to interimly suspend Kort. Kort opposed the motion, again arguing that she did not have proper notice and also

cited her own mental health struggles. The Court rejected her arguments and ordered that Kort be interimly suspended. (Staff Attorney Louis J. Bara)

Matter of John R. Melogy, 233 AD3d 135 (1st Dept 2024)

(Public censure.) Melogy was a former merchant marine who later became an attorney focusing on claims of maritime sexual harassment. On multiple occasions, Melogy sent abusive, vulgar and threatening emails to various people in the maritime community who he perceived as having engaged in wrongdoing. In aggravation, Melogy's actions represented an extrajudicial attempt to seek a desired result when he was not otherwise satisfied with the outcome of a situation. Ultimately, the Court accepted a discipline by consent and imposed a public censure. (Staff Attorney Louis J. Bara)

Matter of John Naccarato, 233 AD3d 35 (1st Dept 2024)

(Disbarment.) In November 2023, Naccarato was interimly suspended after failing to answer a complaint of case neglect. Before moving for suspension, the AGC attempted to solicit an answer from Naccarato no less than five times. Finally, after he failed to appear for a deposition for which he was served with a subpoena in-hand, the AGC moved for his interim suspension. By July 2024, more than six months had elapsed and Naccarato had still failed to cooperate. As such, the AGC moved for him to be disbarred. The Court granted the motion without opposition being filed by Naccarato. (Staff Attorney Louis J. Bara)

Matter of Marvin Srulowitz, 229 AD3d 40 (1st Dept 2024)

(Disciplinary Resignation.) In 2013, as part of a mass suspension, Srulowitz was administratively suspended for failure to pay his biennial registration fees and for failure to file attorney registration statements. In December 2022, the AGC received a “dishonored check” notification from the Lawyers’ Fund for Client Protection. As part of its investigation, the AGC conducted an Examination Under Oath (EUO) of Srulowitz. During the EUO, Srulowitz explained the dishonored check as a bookkeeping error. At the same time, he admitted that he was engaged in the unauthorized practice of law while aware of his suspension. Subsequently, Srulowitz moved the Court to accept his resignation, admitting that he could not defend the allegations of unauthorized practice of law. The AGC did not oppose. Accordingly, the Court accepted Srulowitz’s resignation. (Staff Attorney Louis J. Bara)

Matter of David Alan Tessler, 223 AD3d 102 (1st Dept 2024)

(Disbarment.) In April 2023, Tessler was interimly suspended after failing to answer two complaints of attorney misconduct. Before moving for suspension, the AGC attempted to solicit an answer from Tessler no less than nine times. Finally, after Tessler failed to appear for a deposition for which he was served with a subpoena in-hand, the AGC moved for his interim suspension. By October 2023, six months had elapsed and Tessler had still failed to cooperate. As such, the AGC moved for him to be disbarred. The Court granted the motion without opposition being filed by Tessler. (Staff Attorney Louis J. Bara)

Matter of John Thomas Wynn, 233 AD3d 162 (1st Dept 2024)

(Three-month suspension.) Wynn was admitted to practice in New Jersey. While working as in-house counsel at a New Jersey corporation, Wynn maintained a private practice. In one instance, Wynn comingled his personal funds with client funds and negligently overdraw from the account. In two other instances, Wynn negligently failed to probate estates of which he was executor and overpaid himself attorneys' fees. Based on these facts, the New Jersey Supreme Court ordered a three-month suspension. Upon the AGC's motion for reciprocal discipline, the Court ordered a three-month suspension. (Staff Attorney Louis J. Bara)

Matter of Jeffrey Charles Neiman, 232 AD3d 86 (1st Dept 2024)

(Public censure.) On August 29, 2024, the Court granted the parties' joint motion for discipline by consent and censured Neiman based on his conditional admissions that he engaged in misconduct by filing frivolous lawsuits, failing to add an arbitration clause to a retainer agreement, and failing to make sure that withdrawals from his escrow account were made to a named payee and not to cash. (Staff Attorney Sean A. Brandveen)

Matter of Daphna Zekaria, 230 AD3d 19 (1st Dept 2024)

(Interim Suspension.) The Court immediately suspended Zekaria until further order of the Court due to her failure to cooperate and provide answers to multiple complaints which alleged that she refused to disburse funds from her escrow account. The Court also found that, although she was personally served with a subpoena requiring her to appear, Zekaria failed to comply. (Staff Attorney Andrea Carter)

Matter of Richard Adam, 232 AD3d 105 (1st Dept 2024)

(Three-month suspension.) Adam neglected two client matters which led to their dismissal with prejudice and a loss of the clients' rights. He also initially failed to cooperate with the AGC's investigation. The first matter, which had been previously marked final for trial after several adjournments at Adam's request, was marked-off calendar after Adam sought

yet another adjournment due to his admitted lack of preparedness. The Court directed him to move to restore the case within one year but he failed to do so, resulting in its dismissal for failure to prosecute. Adam gave false assurances to his client that the matter was active, and that a trial was scheduled when he knew it had been dismissed. He also falsely stated to the AGC that he had requested the last adjournment because the client was undergoing surgery. In the second matter, the defendant in an action commenced by Adam defaulted in answering his client's complaint. Respondent, however, took no steps to obtain a default judgment or any further action. Adam not only failed to inform the client of the default but also misled the client to believe that the matter was pending, and a deposition had been scheduled. In addition to the misrepresentations, he failed to respond to the clients' reasonable requests for information in both matters. In mitigation, during the relevant time frame, Adam's endured personal hardships: his marriage had collapsed, he lost seven close family members due to sudden illnesses and he himself suffered from a medical condition that was potentially life threatening. While the Court credited these mitigating factors, it nevertheless disaffirmed the referee's recommendation of a censure, and suspended Adams for three months based on respondent's efforts to conceal his misconduct through misrepresentations to his clients and the AGC and the prejudice he caused to his clients through his neglect and lack of competence. (Deputy Chief Attorney Kevin P. Culley)

Matter of Derek R. Etheridge, 231 AD3d 125 (1st Dept 2024)

(Disbarment.) Etheridge, who had been interimly suspended for uncontroverted evidence that he misappropriated, converted and commingled more than \$48,000 in client and third-party funds held incident to a real estate transaction in his attorney escrow account, was disbarred. In addition to the theft of escrow funds, Etheridge provided the AGC and complainant with false excuses for the delay in promptly returning complainant's funds, including that he was required to wait for certain tax documents to be received and/or filed in connection with a real estate matter. In disbarring Etheridge, the Court rejected his claim that his mother's tragic illness and death, his failed marriage and resulting financial hardships which he incurred after leaving the marital home, was sufficiently extreme and unusual to warrant a sanction less than disbarment. (Deputy Chief Attorney Kevin P. Culley)

Matter of Pamela D. Hayes, 225 AD3d 1 (1st Dept 2024)

(Disciplinary Resignation.) Hayes, who had been interimly suspended for uncontroverted evidence of professional misconduct, was charged with ten counts of professional misconduct for her conversion and misappropriation of client/third party escrow funds and failure to maintain required bookkeeping records. As she could not successfully defend against allegations, she submitted an affidavit of resignation, which the Court accepted. (Deputy Chief Attorney Kevin P. Culley)

Matter of Jeffrey L. Liddle, 233 AD3d 127 (1st Dept 2024)

(Two-year suspension.) Liddle deliberately misused an attorney escrow account to shield his and his law firm's funds after a judgment creditor levied upon his firm's business accounts in an attempt to enforce a \$646,000 judgment. He also made improper ATM cash withdrawals from the escrow account, issued a check to "cash", and failed to maintain required bank records and a ledger. The AGC requested a two-year suspension. Respondent urged no greater than a public censure. The referee sustained all charges, except Charge Three, which alleged that by making multiple ATM withdrawals and issuing a check to "cash", respondent violated rule 1.15(e), and recommended a one-year suspension. The referee rejected Liddle's claims that no evidence was presented that he intended to defraud or deceive a creditor, and that he only used the escrow account to prevent his law practice from shutting down and his clients' matters from being jeopardized. Liddle showed no remorse or acknowledgement of his wrongdoing. The Court denied Liddle's cross-motion to disaffirm and impose a censure and granted the AGC's motion to disaffirm, sustaining Charge Three and suspending him for two years. (Deputy Chief Attorney Kevin P. Culley)

Matter of Howard L. Margulis, 225 AD3d 23 (1st Dept 2024)

(Six-month suspension.) In 2015, Margulis' ex-wife submitted a complaint to the AGC which alleged that he failed to make any family support payments since 2011 and calculated \$232,000 in total arrears pursuant to a New Jersey support order, which also adjudged Margulis in contempt. The New Jersey support order was registered as enforceable in New York except for the contempt ruling, which the Family Court directed a hearing on whether Margulis's failure to pay was willful. Margulis maintained that he lacked an ability to pay due to financial hardship but failed to submit proof of his income and assets despite being repeatedly directed to do so by the Court. As a result, the New York Family Court found Margulis to be in contempt and committed him to a six-month jail term of weekend confinement. The AGC charged Margulis with three counts of misconduct. The Court appointed a referee to conduct a hearing, which was postponed several times due to the serious medical issues of Margulis, then later, his counsel. Meanwhile, Margulis satisfied his child support obligations and commenced new litigation in New Jersey seeking to set aside the spousal support award and negotiate a resolution. The parties thereafter filed a joint motion for discipline by consent based upon conditional admissions by Margulis that he prejudiced the administration of justice for violating the New Jersey order as it pertained to the child support and his multiple missed court appearances and engaged in conduct that adversely reflected on his fitness as a lawyer for failing to file tax returns for multiple periods. The Court granted the parties' joint-motion and suspended Margulis for six months. (Deputy Chief Attorney Kevin P. Culley)

Matter of Bryan A. McKenna, 226 AD3d 149 (1st Dept 2024)

(Disciplinary Resignation.) The AGC investigated McKenna regarding allegations that he misappropriated and converted to his own benefit \$184,600 in client funds held in his IOLA Account in connection with a real estate matter on behalf of a client. McKenna submitted an affidavit of resignation attesting that he cannot successfully defend against allegations of misconduct which the Court accepted. (Deputy Chief Attorney Kevin P. Culley)

Matter of Afia Sengupta, 233 AD3d 199 (1st Dept 2024)

(Disciplinary Resignation.) Sengupta, an Indian attorney registered in New York as In-House Counsel in 2021, was employed by a not-for-profit corporation she owned and controlled. The organization – which employed one New York admitted attorney – purported to engage in investigative journalism on social justice issues while providing *pro bono* legal representation to the indigent. Rule 522 prohibits In-House Counsel from offering legal services or advice to anyone other than their employer and bars the employer from operating as a law firm. Sengupta engaged in multiple acts of professional misconduct, including mishandling client funds and providing misleading testimony about it, neglecting a personal injury case she was not authorized to handle, misrepresenting her limited In-House Counsel status in a custody/visitation case and neglecting that matter, failing to provide adequate notice of her limited status to the Court in a criminal case, and charging and collecting unauthorized legal fees from a client without disclosing her limited representation status. As she could not successfully defend against the allegations of professional misconduct, she tendered her resignation which the court accepted. (Deputy Chief Attorney Kevin P. Culley)

Matter of Rudolph W. Giuliani, 230 AD3d 101 (1st Dept 2024)

(Disbarment.) Respondent Rudolph Giuliani was disbarred primarily for engaging in widespread deceit regarding the 2020 Presidential Election while acting as Donald Trump's personal attorney, but also for dissembling in the course of the AGC's investigation into the former mayor's conduct. Following a lengthy and, at times, heatedly contentious, hearing, a referee appointed by the Court found that: Giuliani knowingly promulgated false claims related to supposed election fraud in Pennsylvania, Georgia, Arizona, and Michigan. Giuliani advanced his falsehoods before legislators in various states, to a federal court, and to the general public. Both when appearing before one legislative body and during Committee investigation, he imparted untruths while under oath. These findings occurred after he overwhelmingly conceded the inaccuracy of the challenged statements but insisted that he had made them in good faith. The Court, which imposed an interim suspension on Giuliani in June 2021, concurred with the referee in rejecting his protestations of good faith. Despite his lack of disciplinary history and distinguished record of public service, the Court deemed disbarment appropriate for the "entirely unrepentant" respondent. For

the “seriousness of respondent’s misconduct [could not] be overstated” and “respondent’s disruptive and disrespectful behavior during the hearing only add[ed] to the case for [respondent’s] disbarment.” (Staff Attorney Kevin M. Doyle)

Matter of Lawrence Albert Cline, 230 AD3d 79 (1st Dept 2024)

(Stricken.) Cline was convicted in the United States District Court for the Eastern District of New York, upon guilty plea, of conspiracy to commit wire fraud. He admitted that he and two business partners, unhappy with their revenues from their company’s investments, transferred approximately \$30 million out of a business account and into accounts that they personally controlled. Respondent concealed the transfer of these funds by sending false and misleading financial reports across state lines. The Court found that Cline’s conviction was analogous to the New York felony of scheme to defraud in the first degree, warranting automatic disbarment. (Staff Attorney Gillian C. Gamberdell)

Matter of Lisa A. Wellman, 227 AD3d 96 (1st Dept 2024)

(Disbarment.) Wellman was disbarred in New Hampshire and Vermont pursuant to a Stipulation to Disbarment wherein she admitted to knowingly misappropriating client funds and comingling client funds and personal funds. Based on the foregoing, the AGC moved for reciprocal discipline in the form of a disbarment. Wellman did not oppose, and the Court granted the AGC’s motion. (Staff Attorney Gillian C. Gamberdell)

Matter of Karamvir Dahiya, 230 AD3d 72 (1st Dept 2024)

(Three-month suspension.) Dahiya’s disregard for the rulings of a tribunal, engagement in conduct prejudicial to the administration of justice, and failure to provide competent representation adversely reflected on his fitness to practice law. His disrespectful conduct was part of a 13-year pattern of persistent misbehavior which included repeated failures to comply with court orders and frivolous litigation for which the court imposed sanctions. In view of the repeated nature of his misconduct and his lack of remorse and evasiveness in his hearing testimony, the Court imposed a 3-month suspension on Dahiya. (Deputy Chief Attorney Naomi F. Goldstein)

Matter of Sally M. Gard, 230 AD3d 96 (1st Dept 2024)

(Interim suspension.) Gard failed to comply with the AGC’s lawful investigative demands that she submit written answers to three client complaints, as well as a Supreme Court transcript which sanctioned her for repeatedly disregarding court rules. She also failed to appear for an examination under oath and did not respond to the AGC’s motion to seek her immediate suspension. The Court determined that Gard’s misconduct constituted an

immediate threat to public interest, and imposed an interim suspension upon her, effective July 2, 2024. (Deputy Chief Attorney Naomi F. Goldstein)

Chadwick L. Hooker, 229 AD3d 22 (1st Dept 2024)

(Interim suspension.) In December 2022, the AGC received a complaint wherein Hooker's client alleged that he neglected her landlord-tenant matter and did not return her \$2,000 retainer. Hooker failed to respond to the AGC's repeated requests that he submit an answer to the complaint and produce a copy of his client file and any records related to his representation of his client. The Court found that Hooker's noncompliance posed an immediate threat to public interest and imposed an interim suspension upon him, effective May 23, 2024. (Deputy Chief Attorney Naomi F. Goldstein)

Douglas B. Levy, 231 AD3d 62 (1st Dept 2024)

(Seven-month suspension.) In 2007, the Supreme Court of Arizona suspended Levy for 30 days based on his behavior during a case wherein two former employees sued him for unpaid wages and vacation time. In 2022, the Supreme Court of Arizona suspended Levy for six months and one day followed by two years' probation for, *inter alia*, altering the language used by opposing counsel in a request for admissions, and lambasting the judge and opposing counsel in emails with the State Bar of Arizona. He also received a reprimand for failure to notify his clients of his suspension and briefly practicing law while suspended. Levy never reported the discipline to the AGC, who received notification of his discipline from the State Bar of Arizona in 2023. The AGC moved to impose reciprocal discipline, and on July 18, 2024, the Court imposed a seven-month suspension upon Levy. (Deputy Chief Attorney Naomi F. Goldstein)

Christopher D. Parker, 231 AD3d 55 (1st Dept 2024)

(Reciprocal public censure.) Parker, the attorney of record for his daughter, a DV victim, did not appear at any of the proceedings related to her case, which took place in Connecticut. The judge agreed with the prosecution's recommendation that it would enter a *nolle prosequi* if the defendant successfully completed diversion. Parker's daughter requested to be heard so she could ask for an increase in the protective order against the defendant, which the judge denied. Parker then filed a complaint against the judge with the State of Connecticut Judicial Review Council (JRC) which claimed that the defendant had been sentenced, and the judge had violated his daughter's constitutional rights by refusing to allow her to be heard before the defendant's sentencing. The judge replied that Parker, a criminal defense attorney, knew or should have known that this was not a sentencing proceeding and that his daughter therefore did not have the right to make a statement, and

that no one had the power to object to a prosecutor's decision to *nolle* charges, so Parker's claim was materially false. Connecticut's Office of Chief Disciplinary Counsel sought to suspend Parker for the misstatements in his JRC complaint, but the Reviewing Committee sought fit only to impose a reprimand. The AGC thereafter sought reciprocal discipline in the form of a public censure, which the Court granted on July 18, 2024. (Deputy Chief Attorney Naomi F. Goldstein)

Mustafa D. Sayid, 228 AD3d 41 (1st Dept 2024)

(One-year suspension.) In 2017, the Securities and Exchange Commission (SEC) filed a complaint against Sayid in the SDNY alleging that he engaged in a fraudulent scheme to effect illegal, unregistered sales of corporation shares. In 2020, the SDNY permanently barred Sayid from appearing before the SEC and ordered him to pay a \$160,000 civil penalty plus disgorgement and interest. The United States Court of Appeals for the Second Circuit affirmed the judgment of the SDNY. In 2023, Sayid joined the AGC in requesting the imposition of a six-month suspension, which the Court denied. Sayid and the AGC thereafter requested discipline by consent in the form of a one-year suspension, which the Court granted, effective April 30, 2024. (Deputy Chief Attorney Naomi F. Goldstein)

Brian J. Smith, 233 AD3d 1 (1st Dept 2024)

(Stricken.) In 2021, Nevada authorities arrested Smith for operating a motor vehicle while under the influence, colliding with another vehicle, and causing significant injury to the person in the vehicle with which he collided. On February 15, 2023, in Nevada District Court, Smith pleaded guilty to the felony of reckless driving causing substantial bodily harm. The AGC's motion to the Court stated that Smith's felony conviction is a proper predicate for automatic disbarment pursuant to Judiciary Law 90(4)(a). On September 26, 2024, the Court Granted the AGC's motion and struck Smith's name from the roll of attorneys effective *nunc pro tunc* to February 15, 2023. (Deputy Chief Attorney Naomi F. Goldstein)

Matter of Kofi O. Amankwaa, 232 AD3d 82 (1st Dept 2024)

(Disbarment.) In 2023, the Court immediately suspended Amankwaa for his repeated failure to answer complaints and produce client files pursuant to the AGC's requests. Amankwaa did not respond or appear for further investigatory or disciplinary proceedings within six months from the date of his suspension order. The Court therefore disbarred him pursuant to 22 NYCRR 1240.9(b). (Staff Attorney Jun H. Lee)

Matter of Alexander R. Cane, 228 AD3d 104 (1st Dept 2024)

(Disbarment.) In 2022, the U.S. Department of Justice Executive Office of Immigration Review (EOIR) disbarred Cane from the practice of law before the Immigration Courts, the Board of Immigration Appeals (BIA), and the Department of Homeland Security (DHS) for obnoxious and contumelious conduct directed at two judges and the staff of the Elizabeth, New Jersey, Immigration Court. He behaved belligerently during the proceedings, and he disparaged the Immigration Court staff in his emails. Therefore, in May 2024, this Court imposed reciprocal discipline upon Cane and disbarred him pursuant to 22 NYCRR 1240.13. (Staff Attorney Jun H. Lee)

Michael O. King, Jr., 229 AD3d 185 (1st Dept 2024)

(Interim suspension.) Despite the AGC's repeated requests, King failed to answer 8 of the 10 complaints against him. He answered two of the complaints but failed to provide the AGC with the additional information it requested. Additionally, King did not oppose the AGC's motion to interimly suspend him pursuant to 22 NYCRR 1240.9(a)(3). Thus, the Court granted the motion and immediately suspended King, effective June 11, 2024. (Staff Attorney Jun H. Lee)

Matter of Jose X. Orochena, 232 AD3d 228 (1st Dept 2024)

(Interim suspension.) Orochena refused to comply with the AGC's requests that he produce two client files, as ordered by judicial subpoena. He argued that the files were privileged and that he could not produce the files without client authorization. In reply, the AGC maintained that the Rules of Professional Conduct (22 NYCRR 1200.0) 1.6(b)(5)(i) and 1.6(b)(6) allow disclosure of confidential information in compliance with Court order. The AGC also argued that Orochena's noncompliance with repeated official requests and a judicial subpoena supported its contention that his conduct threatened the public interest. The Court agreed and immediately suspended Orochena, effective September 26, 2024. (Staff Attorney Jun H. Lee)

Matter of Ethan Ruby, 232 AD3d 179 (1st Dept 2024)

(Nine-month suspension.) Ruby, who was convicted of third-degree assault, joined the AGC in requesting the imposition of discipline by consent. In aggravation, Ruby had previous incidents of domestic violence toward his former girlfriend. In mitigation, he completed a six-month Abusive Partner Intervention Program and has consistently seen a therapist. The Court granted the motion and suspended Ruby for nine months, with supervision by the New York Lawyer Assistance Program for one year. (Staff Attorney Jun H. Lee)

Matter of Joseph Henry Lilly, III, 223 AD3d 105 (1st Dept 2024)

(Two-month suspension.) Lilly twice falsely certified that he had met the CLE credits required of an experienced attorney for two consecutive renewal cycles and made the second false certification while he was under investigation for the same issue in the 2019-2020 cycle. In mitigation, Lilly expressed considerable remorse, acknowledged his misconduct, and cooperated fully with Internal Audit Services of the Office of Court Administration and the AGC. He also completed the required CLEs. He then joined the AGC in requesting a two-month suspension, which the Court granted. (Deputy Chief Attorney Vitaly Lipkansky)

Matter of Luke D. Lynch, Jr., 229 AD3d 37 (1st Dept 2024)

(Disciplinary resignation.) By order entered May 31, 2022, in accordance with Rules for Attorney Disciplinary Matters (22 NYCRR) § 1240.9(a)(2) and (5), the Court immediately suspended Lynch from the practice of law for his failure to supervise his law firm's operating and escrow accounts. His lack of oversight resulted in the commingling of approximately \$2.8 million in client funds and the misappropriation of \$1 million in settlement funds. Lynch, who noted that the investigation does not include allegations that he willfully misappropriated or misapplied money or property, nevertheless acknowledged that his oversight of his law firm's finances was inadequate. As he could not successfully defend against the charges, he submitted an affidavit of resignation, which the court accepted. (Deputy Chief Attorney Vitaly Lipkansky)

Matter of Allen Yusufov, 234 AD3d 71 (1st Dept 2024)

(Interim suspension.) Yusufov served as Buyer's Counsel in the purchase of an apartment. The buyer gave Seller's Counsel a \$75,000 downpayment, but the application was rejected, and a refund check was issued to Yusufov. The buyer complained to the AGC that Yusufov never returned her money. Seller's Counsel provided the AGC with a copy of the check and a bank statement which indicated the withdrawal of the \$75,000. Yusufov did not cooperate with the AGC's attempts to investigate the complaint, and did not respond to a judicial subpoena directing him to appear for an examination under oath. The AGC then submitted a motion for his immediate suspension, which the Court granted, effective December 17, 2024. (Staff Attorney Norma I. Lopez)

Matter of Fausto Simoes, 229 AD3d 147 (1st Dept 2024)

(Stricken.) The Supreme Court of New Jersey disbarred Simoes by consent for his federal conviction of conspiracy to commit bank fraud in connection with a fraudulent mortgage scheme. Simoes had been suspended in New York since 2010 for his failure to file attorney

registration statements and pay biennial registration fees in violation of Judiciary Law 468a. The AGC moved to disbar Simoes, which he did not oppose. The Court accepted the AGC's arguments and, finding that his federal felony conviction was essentially similar to specified New York felony offenses and was a proper predicate for automatic disbarment pursuant to Judiciary Law 90(4)(b), struck Simoes' name from the roll of attorneys in New York. (Staff Attorney Gina M. Patterson)

Matter of John N. Iannuzzi, 233 AD3d 159 (1st Dept 2024)

(Disciplinary resignation.) In this matter involving Iannuzzi, whom the Court had immediately suspended until further order, the Court granted Iannuzzi's motion to resign based on his admissions that he could not successfully defend himself against allegations that he, *inter alia*, intentionally converted and/or intentionally misappropriated client and/or third-party funds. (Staff Attorney Orlando Reyes)

Matter of Steven J. Kwestel, 228 AD3d 36 (1st Dept 2024)

(Two-year suspension.) In this matter involving Kwestel, whom the Court previously deemed had committed a “serious crime” and immediately suspended until further order, the Court granted the parties’ joint motion for discipline by consent and suspended Kwestel for two years based on his conditional admissions that his criminal failure to collect/pay over federal taxes constituted misconduct including: illegal conduct that adversely reflects on his honesty, trustworthiness or fitness; conduct involving dishonesty, fraud, deceit or misrepresentation; and conduct that adversely reflects on his fitness as a lawyer. (Staff Attorney Orlando Reyes)

Matter of Timothy J. McIlwain, 229 AD3d 15 (1st Dept 2024)

(One-month suspension.) McIlwain was suspended, after a hearing, for one month in New Jersey for misconduct in connection with child custody litigation involving his daughter, in which he filed an amended complaint and subpoenas under a dismissed New Jersey custody proceeding and entered into a mediation agreement requiring his adversary to withdraw her disciplinary complaints against him. The New Jersey Supreme Court found that these acts constituted frivolous conduct; conduct involving dishonesty, fraud, deceit or misrepresentation; and conduct prejudicial to the administration of justice in violation of New Jersey Rules of Professional Conduct rules 3.1 and 8.4 (c) and (d), and it suspended McIlwain for one month. Upon learning of the suspension, the AGC moved for reciprocal discipline in the form of a suspension consistent with the New Jersey suspension. The Court granted the motion over McIlwain’s opposition and suspended him for one month. (Staff Attorney Christopher S. Ronk).

Matter of Jeffrey M. Rosin, 229 AD3d 195 (1st Dept 2024)

(Public censure.) Rosin entered into a stipulation in which he admitted to deposition-related misconduct in the US District Court for the District of Massachusetts and accepted a public reprimand. Upon learning of the reprimand, the AGC moved for reciprocal discipline in the form of a public censure. Rosin did not oppose the AGC's motion. Based on the foregoing, the Court granted the motion for reciprocal discipline and publicly censured Rosin. (Staff Attorney Christopher S. Ronk)

Matter of Roderic D. Boyd, 233 AD3d 190 (1st Dept 2024)

(Disciplinary Resignation.) Boyd misappropriated client funds from his attorney escrow account for personal use due to a methamphetamine addiction during the COVID-19 pandemic. Boyd repaid the client in full and the Court accepted his resignation, effective September 7, 2024. (Staff Attorney Yvette A. Rosario)

Matter of John S. Jenkins, 232 AD3d 7 (1st Dept 2024)

(Interim suspension.) By motion dated May 15, 2024, the AGC sought an order, pursuant to rules 22 NYCRR 1240.9(a)(3) and (5), to immediately suspend Jenkins from the practice of law until further order of the Court. The motion was partially based on his failure to submit an answer to the AGC regarding a client's allegations that he neglected their estate matter, his failure to communicate with them, and a failure to refund their \$4,500 retainer. The motion was also based on Jenkins' 2013 Florida suspension, for, *inter alia*, conversion or misappropriation of client funds. The AGC met its burden, and Jenkins received an immediate suspension until further order of the Court. (Staff Attorney Yvette A. Rosario)

Matter of Colin C. McNary, 232 AD3d 221 (1st Dept 2024)

(18-month suspension.) In January 2017, the Court suspended McNary as part of a mass suspension proceeding for failure to file attorney registration statements and to pay biennial registration fees in violation of Judiciary Law 468-a. McNary's reinstatement motion, filed in June 2023, averred that he became aware of his suspension on May 30, 2023. The AGC opposed his reinstatement and argued that McNary engaged in the unauthorized practice of law for six years and four months. In July 2024, the AGC and McNary jointly moved for discipline by consent and requested the imposition of an 18-month suspension, *nunc pro tunc*, to the date on which he learned of his suspension and ceased practicing. By order dated September 26, 2024, the Court granted the joint motion, suspending McNary for 18 months and also directed him to participate in the New York Lawyer Assistance Program for one year. (Staff Attorney Yvette A. Rosario)

Matter of Daniel C. Feldman, 230 AD3d 13 (1st Dept 2024)

(One-year suspension.) Feldman was guilty of professional misconduct based on adverse findings against him in a federal civil action in the United States District Court, wherein the jury determined that during his employment as the corporate secretary of an oil company, he breached his fiduciary duty to his employer with respect to two separate matters. The Court found that his breach of duty was not motivated by an intent to harm his employer or to enrich himself, and he did not convert any funds, act with evil motive or intent or with reckless disregard or callous indifference to the company's rights and was not a disloyal faithless servant. In mitigation, Feldman presented evidence that he had no prior disciplinary history, a favorable reputation in the community for honesty, integrity, and willingness to help others, and that he was under financial hardship. In aggravation, Feldman was relatively uncooperative in turning over his tax returns. The Court imposed a one-year suspension. (Staff Attorney Remi E. Shea)

Matter of Ghenya B. Grant, 224 AD3d 1 (1st Dept 2024)

(Interim suspension.) The Court immediately suspended Grant because she failed to provide her escrow account information and bank statements when requested to do so, ignored the judicial subpoena to appear before the AGC for an examination under oath, and failed to maintain and safeguard client funds. (Staff Attorney Remi E. Shea)

Matter of Rahul Dev Manchanda, 233 AD3d 169 (1st Dept 2024)

(Disbarment.) On November 21, 2024, Manchanda was disbarred for engaging in a pervasive pattern of misconduct, including the use of offensive language in legal documents, unauthorized disclosure of confidential client information, and filing of frivolous legal motions. Despite Manchanda's multiple attempts to challenge the proceedings and delay the disciplinary action, the court found the evidence sufficient to warrant disbarment. The Referee, a retired judge, provided a meticulous assessment of the evidence, finding Manchanda's explanations for his misconduct to be evasive and unconvincing. The pattern of behavior, coupled with Manchanda's prior admonitions and legal sanctions, led to his disbarment as the only appropriate remedy to protect the public and uphold the profession's integrity. This decision sets a stringent precedent for attorney conduct in New York, particularly concerning the use of discriminatory language and the handling of confidential information. (Staff Attorney Remi E. Shea)

Matter of Michael Markovitch, 229 AD3d 191 (1st Dept 2024)

(Disciplinary resignation.) Markovitch, who was previously suspended based on a felony conviction for conspiracy to commit immigration fraud, owned two companies during his

suspension: a divorce filing service and an immigration filing service. Both companies employed nonlawyers who performed document preparation services for individuals who did not desire legal representation. The websites for both companies noted that neither company provided legal advice or counsel. Markovitch employed a nonlawyer as the case coordinator manager whose primary responsibility was document preparation and client communication. He failed to adequately supervise the manager and, unbeknownst to him, the manager informed clients that Markovitch was an attorney associated with the companies. When clients asked to speak with him, the manager informed them that he was in court. As Markovitch could not defend against the allegations, he submitted his resignation, which the Court accepted. (Staff Attorney Remi E. Shea)

Matter of Matthew A. Melville, 223 AD3d 48 (1st Dept 2024)

(Six-month suspension.) Melville, who was a partner at his law firm, utilized a parallel invoice system and directed clients to make payments to his personal account, which violated the partnership agreement. He also used the firm's letterhead for personal invoices and engaged in conduct that adversely reflected on his fitness as a lawyer by failing to report the earnings he received for professional activities on behalf of his clients while employed as a partner by the firm. He also inadvertently underreported the taxable income he earned from his side practice. Melville, who conceded that he engaged in conduct involving dishonesty, fraud, deceit, or misrepresentation, joined the AGC in moving for a six-month discipline by consent, which the Court granted. The Court further ordered Melville to comply with the business and mental health monitoring and reporting conditions as set forth in the parties' joint affirmation. (Staff Attorney Remi E. Shea)

Matter of Stephen M. Bander, 232 AD3d 1 (1st Dept 2024)

(Disbarment.) Pursuant to the doctrine of reciprocal discipline as set forth in 22 NYCRR 1240.13, the Court disbarred Bander based upon discipline imposed by the Supreme Court of Florida. The Supreme Court of Florida disbarred Bander for failing to place client funds in his trust account, failing to timely provide refunds to his clients for double payment of attorney's fees, and for using the fees to pay firm operating expenses. (Staff Attorney Eric Sun)

Matter of Matthew C. Browndorf, 231 AD3d 28 (1st Dept 2024)

(Interim suspension.) Browndorf pleaded guilty to the federal felony of failure to collect or pay over tax where he admitted that, as CEO and majority owner of a nationwide foreclosure and real estate law firm, he was responsible for collecting, accounting for, and paying over to the IRS the federal income taxes, Social Security taxes, and Medicare taxes

withheld from the wages paid to the employees of the firm. Browndorf also admitted that he failed to direct remittances into employee pension benefit plans. The Court deemed the offense a “serious crime,” immediately suspended Browndorf from the practice of law and remanded the matter for a hearing on sanctions. (Deputy Chief Attorney Raymond Vallejo)

Matter of Davion S. E. Chism, 232 AD3d 141 (1st Dept 2024)

(Public censure.) The Court granted a joint motion for discipline by consent and issued a public censure. Chism was court-martialed following her guilty plea to military crimes such as wrongful interference with an administrative proceeding, false swearing and false official statement. The Court considered, in mitigation, her unblemished disciplinary history, cooperation, remorse and impressive reputation and character evidence and her severe mental health issues which were a direct cause of her misconduct. (Deputy Chief Attorney Raymond Vallejo)

Matter of Arthur G. Cohen, 227 AD3d 18 (1st Dept 2024)

(Stricken.) Cohen pleaded guilty, in Supreme Court, New York County, to the New York State felonies of grand larceny in the first degree and criminal tax fraud in the third and fourth degrees. His conviction stemmed from his admission to stealing more than \$1 million over six years from his former employer and failing to declare the funds on his New York State income tax returns. Cohen was automatically disbarred based upon his felony convictions. (Deputy Chief Attorney Raymond Vallejo)

Matter of Telesforo Del Valle, Jr., 227 AD3d 22 (1st Dept 2024)

(Stricken.) Del Valle pleaded guilty to the federal felonies of conspiracy to bribe and unlawfully compensate a federal employee, illegal compensation and false statements. His guilty plea stemmed from a scheme in which he was involved with an employee in the Magistrate Clerk’s Office, whereby the employee would encourage criminal defendants to retain Del Valle to represent them in pending criminal cases, in exchange for which he paid the employee a portion of the fees the clients paid him. The Court determined that automatic disbarment was warranted because the statute under which Del Valle was convicted (federal employee bribery) was essentially similar to the New York felony of bribery in the third degree. (Deputy Chief Attorney Raymond Vallejo)

Matter of Allen A. Gessen, 232 AD3d 164 (1st Dept 2024)

(Stricken.) Gessen was convicted, following a jury trial, of murder for hire, a federal felony, based on his attempt to hire a hitman to murder the mother of his young children in exchange for the payment of \$50,000. Gessen was sentenced to 120 months of

imprisonment. The Court determined that automatic disbarment was warranted because the statute to which Gessen was convicted was essentially similar to the New York felony of conspiracy to commit murder, in violation of Penal Law 105.15. (Deputy Chief Attorney Raymond Vallejo)

Matter of Mark E. Heimendinger, 230 AD3d 35 (1st Dept 2024)

(Two-year suspension.) Pursuant to the doctrine of reciprocal discipline, under 22 NYCRR 1240.13, based upon an order issued by the Supreme Court of Florida, the Court suspended Heimendinger for two years. Heimendinger pleaded no contest to the charge of aggravated assault, carrying a concealed firearm, improper exhibition of a dangerous weapon and battery, for which he was sentenced to two days in jail and 60 months of probation. (Deputy Chief Attorney Raymond Vallejo)

Matter of Michael J. Little, 225 AD3d 19 (1st Dept 2024)

(Interim suspension.) Little was found guilty, following a jury trial, of four federal felonies: obstructing and impeding the administration of federal tax laws; willful failure to file reports of foreign accounts; conspiracy to defraud the IRS; aiding and assisting the preparations of false IRS forms; and, willful failure to file individual income tax returns, for which he was sentenced to 20 months of incarceration and ordered to pay over \$4 million in restitution. The Court deemed Little's convictions to be "serious crimes," immediately suspended him from the practice of law and remanded the matter for a hearing on sanctions. (Deputy Chief Attorney Raymond Vallejo)

Matter of Stefan M. Miller, 231 AD3d 100 (1st Dept 2024)

(Interim suspension.) Miller pleaded guilty to criminal contempt in the second degree, a class "A" misdemeanor, by having violated an order of protection. He was sentenced to a one-year conditional discharge, as a condition of which he was required to complete an abusive partner intervention program. The Court deemed the offense to which Miller pleaded guilty to be a "serious crime" and interimly suspended him from the practice of law pending further proceedings. Miller had opposed an interim suspension on the grounds that he had accepted responsibility for his criminal conduct and was neither incarcerated nor on probation. (Deputy Chief Attorney Raymond Vallejo)

Matter of William J. Miller, 233 AD3d 195 (1st Dept 2024)

(One-year suspension.) The Court granted a joint motion for discipline by consent suspending Miller for one year as a result of his failures to file his state and federal income tax returns for eight years and to pay his state and federal tax liabilities and his omissions

and false statements in personal financial statements that he completed in connection with a line of credit he had at a bank. The Court considered that, as a longtime partner at his law firm, Miller earned a substantial income during the period in which he failed to file or pay income taxes. (Deputy Chief Attorney Raymond Vallejo)

Matter of Jack H. Nguyen, 231 AD3d 219 (1st Dept 2024)

(Resignation.) The Court granted Nguyen's application for a disciplinary resignation following his conviction, by guilty plea, to conspiracy to launder monetary instruments, a federal felony. Nguyen's conviction stemmed from his conspiring with others to create a foundation to launder and conceal proceeds from the sale of illegal narcotics and illegal weapons. The Court had previously deemed Nguyen's conviction to be a "serious crime" and interimly suspended him until further order of the Court. (Deputy Chief Attorney Raymond Vallejo)

Matter of George Royle, 234 AD3d 97 (1st Dept 2024)

(Stricken.) Royle was convicted, following a jury trial, of the federal felony of possession of/access with intent to view child pornography for which he was sentenced to 32 months imprisonment. The Court determined that automatic disbarment was warranted because Royle's conviction for distribution of child pornography, if rendered in New York, would constitute the New York felony of possessing a sexual performance by a child under New York Penal Law 263.16. (Deputy Chief Attorney Raymond Vallejo)

Appendix A: Committee Composition

Committee Members from January 1, 2024 through September 30, 2024

Committee 1

Abigail T. Reardon
 Milton L. Williams, Jr.
 Marijo C. Adimey
 Erica Barrow
 Martin S. Bell
 Peter A. Bellacosa
 Eleazar F. Bueno*
 John P. Buza
 Miguelina M. Camilo
 Russell Capone
 William F. Dahill
 Lissette A. Duran
 C. Willem Houck*
 Arthur M. Luxenberg
 Scott E. Mollen
 Virginia A. Reilly
 Beatrice Seravello*
 Joshua Silber
 S. Yan Sin
 Hon. Milton A. Tingling
 Judith E. White

Committee 2

Robert J. Anello
 Tina M. Wells
 Steven Benathen
 Rev. Reyn Cabinte*
 Hon. James M. Catterson
 Susan M. Cofield*
 Robert Stephan Cohen
 Julie Goldscheid
 Virginia Goodman Futterman
 Phillip C. Hamilton
 Jaipat S. Jain
 Barbara Kairson, PhD
 Devika Kewalramani
 Amy L. Legow
 Christopher Morel
 Vianny M. Paulino-Pichardo
 Joanna Rotgers
 Jeffrey S. Stillman
 Lisa Vicens
 Terel R. Watson
 Mark C. Zauderer

*Lay member

Appendix A: Committee Composition

Committee Members from October 1, 2024 through December 31, 2024

Committee 1

Abigail T. Reardon
 Milton L. Williams, Jr.
 Marijo C. Adimey
 Erica Barrow
 Martin S. Bell
 Peter A. Bellacosa
 Eleazar F. Bueno*
 John P. Buza
 Miguelina M. Camilo
 Russell Capone
 William F. Dahill
 Lissette A. Duran
 C. Willem Houck*
 Arthur M. Luxenberg
 Scott E. Mollen
 Virginia A. Reilly
 Beatrice Seravello*
 Joshua Silber
 S. Yan Sin
 Hon. Milton A. Tingling
 Judith E. White

Committee 2

Robert J. Anello
 Tina M. Wells
 Steven Benathen
 Hon. James M. Catterson
 Susan M. Cofield*
 Robert Stephan Cohen
 Julie Goldscheid
 Virginia Goodman Futterman
 Phillip C. Hamilton
 Jaipat S. Jain
 Barbara Kairson, PhD
 J. Andrew Kent
 Devika Kewalramani
 Christopher Morel
 Vianny M. Paulino-Pichardo
 Joanna Rotgers
 Deborah Schein*
 Jeffrey S. Stillman
 Elisabeth Lisa Vicens
 Terel R. Watson
 Mark C. Zauderer

Appendix B: Office of the Chief Attorney: Attorneys

Chief Attorney

Jorge Dopico

Deputy Chief Attorneys

Angela Christmas

Kevin P. Culley

Naomi F. Goldstein

Vitaly Lipkansky

Raymond Vallejo

Staff Attorneys

Louis J. Bara

Sean A. Brandveen

Andrea B. Carter

Kevin M. Doyle

Gillian C. Gamberdell

Kelly A. Latham

Jun H. Lee

Norma I. Lopez

Diana Neyman

Gina M. Patterson

Orlando Reyes

Christopher Ronk

Yvette A. Rosario

Remi E. Shea

Eric Sun

Appendix C: Office of the Chief Attorney: Administrative Staff

Investigators

Nancy DeLeon, Chief
Robert Murphy
Anthony Rodriguez

Paralegals

Joel A. Peterson, Chief
Grace Pajuelo
Reginald E. Thomas

Office Manager

Marcy Sterling

Data Personnel

Mark Hernandez, Data Entry
Shayna LaPlante
Tennille Millhouse

Accountant

Martin Swinger

Support Staff

Devin B. Anglada
Monique R. Hudson
Tina M. Nardelli
Celina M. Nelson
Clarissa Perez
Michael J. Ramirez
Sharon Ramirez
Stephanie W. Ross
Natasha S. Solomon
Nathalie P. Suarez
Shaniya Z. Thomas
Lorraine Wright

Appendix D

ATTORNEY GRIEVANCE COMMITTEE FIRST JUDICIAL DEPARTMENT MATTERS PROCESSED IN 2024

Matters Pending as of December 31, 2024	934
---	-----

Details

1. Matters pending on January 1, 2024	1029
2. New matters received between January 1, 2024 and December 31, 2024	5408
3. Closed matters reactivated between January 1, 2024 and December 31, 2024	<u>26</u>
Total matters processed between January 1, 2024 and December 31, 2024 (1+2+3)	6463
Total matters disposed between January 1, 2024 and December 31, 2024	<u>(5529)</u>
Matters pending as of December 31, 2024	934

Appendix E: Budget for Fiscal Year 2024-2025

Attorney Grievance Committee Budget Fiscal Year April 2024 – March 2025

	<u>Allocation:</u>
Personal Service Total:	\$4,503,412
Non-Personal Service:	
Office Supplies	23,146
EDP Supplies	3,600
Postage Only	0
Legal Reference & Subscriptions	18,000
Misc. Supplies and Materials	4,200
Travel General	203
Rentals of Equipment	3,050
Repairs of Equipment	6,000
Shipping, Postage & Mailing Services	20,000
Printing - General	3,495
Telephones	1,000
Office/Clerical Services	0
Records Management Services	19,708
Professional Services Expert Witnesses	750
Other Court-Appointed Services	14,000
Other General Services	5,000
Professional Services Per Diem Interpreters	500
Transcript Costs General	52,000
Non-Personal Service Total:	174,652
TOTAL BUDGET FISCAL YEAR 2023-2024	4,678,064

Appendix F: Complaint Form

(Rev. 7.30.2020)

ATTORNEY GRIEVANCE COMMITTEE
Supreme Court, Appellate Division
First Judicial Department
180 Maiden Lane, 17th Floor
New York, New York 10038
(212) 401-0800

JORGE DOPICO
Chief Attorney

Email Complaint and Attachments to: AD1-AGC-newcomplaints@nycourts.gov. In addition, please send **one copy** of your complaint and attachments **by regular mail** to the above address. (If you do not have a personal email account, please send two (2) complete sets of your complaint and all attachments. There may be a delay in processing your matter if it is not emailed. Please **do not** include any original documents because we are unable to return them.)

Background Information

Today's Date: _____

Your Full Name: (Mr. Ms. Mrs.) _____

Address: _____

City: _____ State: _____ Zip Code: _____

Cell Phone: _____ Business/Home Phone: _____

Email Address: _____

Are you represented by a lawyer regarding this complaint? Yes No If Yes:

Lawyer's Name: _____

Address: _____

City: _____ State: _____ Zip Code: _____

Business Phone: _____ Cell Phone: _____

Attorney Information

Full Name of Attorney Complained of: (Mr. Ms. Mrs.) _____

Address: _____

City: _____ State: _____ Zip Code: _____

Business Phone: _____ Cell Phone: _____

Email Address: _____

Date(s) of Representation/Incident: _____

Have you filed a civil or criminal complaint against this attorney? Yes No If Yes:

If yes, name of case (if applicable): _____

Name of Court: _____

Index Number of Case (if known): _____

Have you filed a complaint concerning this matter with another Grievance Committee, Bar Association, District Attorney's Office, or any other agency? Yes No

If yes, name of agency: _____

Action taken by agency, if any: _____

Details of Complaint

Please describe the alleged misconduct in as much detail as possible including what happened, where and when, the names of any witnesses, what was said, and in what tone of voice, etc. Use additional sheets if necessary.

Complainant's Signature (Required): _____

PROFESSIONAL MATTERS CASELOAD REPORT

(Proposed Revision to current UCS-176 Form)

GRIEVANCE COMMITTEE: Grievance Committee for the 2nd, 11th & 13th & JD

REPORT PERIOD: 1/1/2024 through 12/31/2024

DATE: March 21, 2025

I. PROFESSIONAL MATTERS¹ PROCESSED BY THE COMMITTEE:

A. Matters Pending at Start of Report Period	<u>1248</u>
B. New Matters During Report Period (see Part II, <u>infra</u>)	<u>2948</u>
C. Closed Matters Reactivated During Report Period ²	<u>17</u>
D. Total Matters to be Processed During Report Period (A+B+C)	<u>4213</u>
E. Total Matters Disposed of During Report Period (see Parts III & IV, <u>infra</u>)	<u>2291</u>
F. Matters Pending at End of Report Period (I.D - I.E)	<u>1922</u>

II. NEW MATTERS DURING REPORT PERIOD:

A. Sua Sponte Investigations Authorized by Committee Pursuant to Rules for Attorney Disciplinary Matters (22 NYCRR) § 1240.7 (a) (1) ³	<u>632</u>
B. Cases Referred by the Court for Examination Due to Reversal of a Criminal Conviction	
1. On the Ground of Ineffective Assistance of Counsel	<u>0</u>
2. On the Ground of Prosecutorial Misconduct	<u>0</u>
C. Matters Arising Under Judiciary Law § 90 (4) (c) and Rules for Attorney Disciplinary Matters (22 NYCRR) § 1240.12 (a)	<u>6</u>
D. Matters Arising Under Rules for Attorney Disciplinary Matters (22 NYCRR) § 1240.13 (d)	<u>10</u>

¹ The term "Matters" refers to individual files generated by complaint, inquiry or other filing at the Committee level and any one respondent may be the subject of multiple matters simultaneously.

² May also include closed matters which have become subject to Court review pursuant to Rules for Attorney Disciplinary Matters (22 NYCRR) § 1240.7 (e) or CPLR art 56.

³ May include Dishonored Check Reports pursuant to Rules of Appellate Division, All Departments (22 NYCRR) § 1300.1 (g).

E. Matters Arising Under Rules for Attorney Disciplinary Matters	
(22 NYCRR) § 1240.9 ⁴	<u>1</u>
F. Motions for Reinstatement Pursuant to Rules for Attorney Disciplinary Matters (22 NYCRR) §§ 1240.16, 1240.17 & 1240.22 (b)	<u>9</u>
G. Applications for Leave to Resign Pursuant to Rules for Attorney Disciplinary Matters (22 NYCRR) § 1240.22 (a)	<u>79</u>
H. Attorney Solicitation Filings Pursuant to Rules of Professional Conduct (22 NYCRR 1200.0) rule 7.3 (c) (1)	<u>35</u>
I. Disciplinary History Letter Requests and Other Inquiries	<u>588</u>
J. All Other Complaints Filed or Transferred in Pursuant to Rules for Attorney Disciplinary Matters (22 NYCRR) § 1240.7 (a) (1) or (2)	<u>1588</u>
TOTAL NEW MATTERS	<u>2948</u>

III. MATTERS DISPOSED OF BY CHIEF ATTORNEY:

A. Matters Disposed of Pursuant to Rules for Attorney Disciplinary Matters (22 NYCRR) § 1240.7 (d) (1) (i)	<u>998</u>
B. Matters Referred to Other Agencies Pursuant to Rules for Attorney Disciplinary Matters (22 NYCRR) § 1240.7 (d) (1) (ii)	<u>44</u>
C. Matters Transferred to Another Grievance Committee Pursuant to Rules for Attorney Disciplinary Matters (22 NYCRR) § 1240.7 (a) (2)	<u>336</u>
D. Other⁵	<u>577</u>
TOTAL DISPOSED OF BY CHIEF ATTORNEY	<u>1955</u>

⁴ Refers to a new Matter arising from an existing file where the respondent has failed to cooperate with the Committee investigation (§ 1240.9 [a] [1], [3]), or where the investigation has given rise to an admission by the respondent under oath (§ 1240.9 [a] [2]), or revealed that the respondent has willfully failed to paid money to a client (§ 1240.9 [a] [4]) or exposed uncontested evidence of the respondent's misconduct (§ 1240.9 [a] [5]).

⁵ Includes acknowledgment of Attorney Solicitation Filings pursuant to Rules of Professional Conduct (22 NYCRR 1200.0) rule 7.3 (c) (1), the provision of disciplinary history letters upon request and other closed inquiries.

IV. MATTERS DISPOSED OF BY COMMITTEE:

A. Matters Disposed of Pursuant to Rules for Attorney Disciplinary Matters (22 NYCRR) § 1240.7 (d) (2) (i) or (ii)	<u>54</u>
B. Issuance of a Letter of Advisement Pursuant to Rules for Attorney Disciplinary Matters (22 NYCRR) § 1240.7 (d) (2) (iv)	<u>135</u>
C. Issuance of an Admonition Pursuant to Rules for Attorney Disciplinary Matters (22 NYCRR) § 1240.7 (d) (2) (v)	<u>23</u>
D. Matters Referred to the Appellate Division for Action	
1. Pursuant to Rules for Attorney Disciplinary Matters (22 NYCRR) § 1240.8	<u>21</u>
2. Pursuant to Rules for Attorney Disciplinary Matters (22 NYCRR) § 1240.9 (see Part II.E, <u>supra</u>)	<u>12</u>
3. Pursuant to Rules for Attorney Disciplinary Matters (22 NYCRR) § 1240.10 (for Matters under investigation)	<u>0</u>
4. Pursuant to Rules for Attorney Disciplinary Matters (22 NYCRR) § 1240.11	<u>0</u>
5. Pursuant to Rules for Attorney Disciplinary Matters (22 NYCRR) § 1240.12	<u>1</u>
6. Pursuant to Rules for Attorney Disciplinary Matters (22 NYCRR) § 1240.13	<u>2</u>
7. Pursuant to Rules for Attorney Disciplinary Matters (22 NYCRR) § 1240.14	<u>0</u>
TOTAL REFERRED TO APPELLATE DIVISION	<u>36</u>
E. Responsive Filings	
1. On Motions for Reinstatement Pursuant to Rules for Attorney Disciplinary Matters (22 NYCRR) §§ 1240.16, 1240.17 and 1240.22 (b) (see Part II.F, <u>supra</u>)	<u>9</u>

2. On Applications for Leave to Resign Pursuant to Rules for Attorney Disciplinary Matters (22 NYCRR) § 1240.22	
(a) (see Part II.G, <u>supra</u>)	<u>79</u>
3. On Motions for Court Review Pursuant to Rules for Attorney Disciplinary Matters (22 NYCRR) § 1240.7 (e)	
(1) (ii) and (2) (see Part I.C and associated footnote, <u>supra</u>)	<u>0</u>
TOTAL RESPONSIVE FILINGS	<u>88</u>
 TOTAL DISPOSED OF BY COMMITTEE	<u>336</u>
 V. CASES⁶ PROCESSED BY THE APPELLATE DIVISION:	
A. Cases Pending at Start of Report Period	<u>54</u>
B. Cases Initiated During Report Period ⁷	<u>62</u>
C. Cases Disposed of During Report Period (see Part VI, <u>infra</u>)	<u>80</u>
D. Cases Pending at End of Report Period (A + B - C)	<u>36</u>
 VI. CASES DISPOSED OF BY THE APPELLATE DIVISION:	
A. Disbarments, including disciplinary resignation	<u>9</u>
B. Suspensions (Including Pursuant to Rules for Attorney Disciplinary Matters [22 NYCRR] §§ 1240.9 and 1240.14)	<u>8</u>
C. Censures	<u>2</u>
D. Dismissed	<u>0</u>
E. Reinstatements Granted	<u>0</u>
F. Reinstatements Denied	<u>1</u>
G. Nondisciplinary Resignations Granted	<u>52</u>

⁶ The term "Cases" refers to filings made at the Appellate Division level, is respondent-specific, and any such Case may encompass what was previously multiple Matters at the Committee level.

⁷ Includes Cases referred to the Appellate Division (see Part IV.D, supra), motions for reinstatement pursuant to Rules for Attorney Disciplinary Matters (22 NYCRR) §§ 1240.16, 1240.17 and 1240.22 (b) (see Part II.F, supra), applications for leave to resign pursuant to Rules for Attorney Disciplinary Matters (22 NYCRR) § 1240.22 (a) (see Part II.G, supra), and motions for Court review pursuant to Rules for Attorney Disciplinary Matters (22 NYCRR) § 1240.7 (e) (1) (ii) and (2) (see Parts I.C and IV.E.3).

H. Nondisciplinary Resignations Denied	0
I. Other	8
TOTAL DISPOSED OF BY THE APPELLATE DIVISION	80

VII. PRACTICE AREA STATISTICS:

A. CRIMINAL LAW

1. New Matters During Report Period (<u>see</u> Part II, <u>supra</u>)	
Pertaining to Prosecutors	39
Pertaining to Defense Counsel	127
2. Matters Disposed of Pursuant to Rules for Attorney	
Disciplinary Matters (22 NYCRR) § 1240.7 (d) (1) or	
(2) (i), (ii) or (iv)	
Pertaining to Prosecutors	44
Pertaining to Defense Counsel	106
3. Matters Disposed of Pursuant to Rules for Attorney	
Disciplinary Matters (22 NYCRR) § 1240.7 (d) (2) (v) and	
Cases Disposed of by the Appellate Division	
(<u>see</u> Part VI.A-VI.C, <u>supra</u>)	
Pertaining to Prosecutors	0
Pertaining to Defense Counsel	4

B. IMMIGRATION LAW

1. New Matters During Report Period (<u>see</u> Part II, <u>supra</u>)	133
2. Matters Disposed of Pursuant to Rules for Attorney	
Disciplinary Matters (22 NYCRR) § 1240.7 (d) (1) or	
(2) (i), (ii) or (iv)	84
3. Matters Disposed of Pursuant to Rules for Attorney	
Disciplinary Matters (22 NYCRR) § 1240.7 (d) (2) (v) and	
Cases Disposed of by the Appellate Division	
(<u>see</u> Part VI.A-VI.C, <u>supra</u>)	1

C. FAMILY & MATRIMONIAL LAW

1. New Matters During Report Period (<u>see</u> Part II, <u>supra</u>)	<u>145</u>
2. Matters Disposed of Pursuant to Rules for Attorney Disciplinary Matters (22 NYCRR) § 1240.7 (d) (1) or (2) (i), (ii) or (iv)	<u>115</u>
3. Matters Disposed of Pursuant to Rules for Attorney Disciplinary Matters (22 NYCRR) § 1240.7 (d) (2) (v) and Cases Disposed of by the Appellate Division (<u>see</u> Part VI.A-VI.C, <u>supra</u>)	<u>6</u>

D. REAL PROPERTY

1. New Matters During Report Period (<u>see</u> Part II, <u>supra</u>)	<u>211</u>
2. Matters Disposed of Pursuant to Rules for Attorney Disciplinary Matters (22 NYCRR) § 1240.7 (d) (1) or (2) (i), (ii) or (iv)	<u>152</u>
3. Matters Disposed of Pursuant to Rules for Attorney Disciplinary Matters (22 NYCRR) § 1240.7 (d) (2) (v) and Cases Disposed of by the Appellate Division (<u>see</u> Part VI.A-VI.C, <u>supra</u>)	<u>10</u>

E. TRUSTS & ESTATES

1. New Matters During Report Period (<u>see</u> Part II, <u>supra</u>)	<u>71</u>
2. Matters Disposed of Pursuant to Rules for Attorney Disciplinary Matters (22 NYCRR) § 1240.7 (d) (1) or (2) (i), (ii) or (iv)	<u>68</u>
3. Matters Disposed of Pursuant to Rules for Attorney Disciplinary Matters (22 NYCRR) § 1240.7 (d) (2) (v) and Cases Disposed of by the Appellate Division (<u>see</u> Part VI.A-VI.C, <u>supra</u>)	<u>4</u>

F. COMMERCIAL LITIGATION

1. New Matters During Report Period (<u>see</u> Part II, <u>supra</u>)	<u>21</u>
--	-----------

2. Matters Disposed of Pursuant to Rules for Attorney Disciplinary Matters (22 NYCRR) § 1240.7 (d) (1) or (2) (i), (ii) or (iv)	<u>14</u>
3. Matters Disposed of Pursuant to Rules for Attorney Disciplinary Matters (22 NYCRR) § 1240.7 (d) (2) (v) and Cases Disposed of by the Appellate Division (<u>see</u> Part VI.A-VI.C, <u>supra</u>)	<u>2</u>
G. OTHER CIVIL LITIGATION	
1. New Matters During Report Period (<u>see</u> Part II, <u>supra</u>)	<u>221</u>
2. Matters Disposed of Pursuant to Rules for Attorney Disciplinary Matters (22 NYCRR) § 1240.7 (d) (1) or (2) (i), (ii) or (iv)	<u>170</u>
3. Matters Disposed of Pursuant to Rules for Attorney Disciplinary Matters (22 NYCRR) § 1240.7 (d) (2) (v) and Cases Disposed of by the Appellate Division (<u>see</u> Part VI.A-VI.C, <u>supra</u>)	<u>11</u>

PUBLIC DISPOSITIONS
SECOND DEPARTMENT
Grievance Committee for the
Second, Eleventh and Thirteenth Judicial Districts

2024

<u>Attorney</u>	<u>Disposition</u>	<u>Summary</u>
Michael D. Don, admitted as Michael David Don, a disbarred attorney 223 AD3d 110	Disbarred (on default) January 24, 2024	Illegal conduct adversely reflecting on honesty, trustworthiness, or fitness as a lawyer; convicted of a felony, which was later vacated
Shahid Ali 224 AD3d 68	Suspended 1 year January 31, 2024	Misappropriation; escrow checks cleared against other client funds; failed to maintain accurate bookkeeping records
Gregg X. Fonti, a suspended attorney	Reinstatement held in abeyance – Referred for investigation to Character & Fitness Committee February 2, 2024	
Arthur Arcadian, admitted as Artur Sutyshev 225 AD3d 39	Disbarred February 21, 2024 Motion to Reargue Denied September 16, 2024	Federal felony conviction – Conspiracy to commit immigration fraud (18 USC §§ 371 and 1546[a]).
Julia Greenberg	Interim Suspension April 5, 2024	Federal felony conviction – Conspiracy to commit immigration fraud (18 USC §§ 371 and 1546[a])
Manuel Ortega, a suspended attorney	Respondent's motion to refer matter to a hearing before a Special Referee is granted April 5, 2024	By decision and order on motion dated October 13, 2023, the respondent was immediately suspended and directed to show cause why a final order of suspension, censure, or disbarment should not be made based on his conviction of a serious crime

Matthew William Woitkowksi 227 AD3d 147	Suspended 6 months April 10, 2024	Reciprocal sanction for 3 month suspension in New Jersey, with the respondent's prior 2 year suspension involving similar misconduct in New York in aggravation – Misappropriated funds; conflict of interest; failure to maintain financial records; acted as a settlement agent through a company owned by respondent
Malgorzata Elzbieta Bereziewicz	Non-Disciplinary Resignation – Granted April 23, 2024	
Philip Joseph Caruso	Non-Disciplinary Resignation – Granted April 23, 2024	
Howard Martin Cohn	Non-Disciplinary Resignation – Granted April 23, 2024	
Louise A. Foutch	Non-Disciplinary Resignation – Granted April 23, 2024	
John Paul Greer	Non-Disciplinary Resignation – Granted April 23, 2024	
Faith Laurie Halter	Non-Disciplinary Resignation – Granted April 23, 2024	
Serena Grace Shu-hua Liu, admitted as Serena Grace Shu-Hu Liu	Non-Disciplinary Resignation – Granted April 23, 2024	
Meena G. Mariwalla	Non-Disciplinary Resignation – Granted April 23, 2024	
Amaka Megwalu	Non-Disciplinary Resignation – Granted April 23, 2024	
Greta Boeringer Schoenberg, admitted as Margaret Jane Boeringer	Non-Disciplinary Resignation – Granted April 23, 2024	

Joshua James Smith	Non-Disciplinary Resignation – Granted April 23, 2024	
Thomas Martin Vaughan	Non-Disciplinary Resignation – Granted April 23, 2024	
Andrea Woods	Non-Disciplinary Resignation – Granted April 23, 2024	
David J.S. Ziff	Non-Disciplinary Resignation – Granted April 23, 2024	
Mitchell Moses Ozeri 229 AD3d 1	Suspended 2 years May 15, 2024	Misappropriation; commingling; failed to maintain required bookkeeping records for escrow account
Young Min Kim 229 AD3d 27	Disbarred May 29, 2024	Reciprocal sanction for disbarment in New Jersey – Knowingly practiced law while suspended, failed to cooperate with disciplinary authorities, engaged in deceitful/dishonest conduct
James D. Castelli, admitted as James E. Daguanno, a suspended attorney	Reinstatement denied June 28, 2024	
Daniel Fier 230 AD3d 150	Disbarred (on default) July 3, 2024	Misappropriation; neglect; failure to cooperate
Salvatore Emilio Strazzullo 230 AD3d 168	Disbarred (on default) July 3, 2024	Misappropriation; failure to cooperate
Jason A. Nielson 215 NYS3d 173	Suspended 6 months July 10, 2024 October 4, 2024, recalled and vacated due to death of respondent on November 5, 2022	Reciprocal sanction for 30 day suspension, and 1 year of probation, in New Jersey – Failed to keep client informed; failed to explain matter to extent needed for client to make informed decisions; failed to ensure conduct of non-lawyer was compatible with respondent's obligations; engaged in conduct involving dishonesty, fraud, deceit, or misrepresentation
David L. Kagel 231 AD3d 91	Disbarred July 24, 2024	Reciprocal sanction for disbarment in California – Misappropriation

Sanny Barkats 231 AD3d 97	Disbarred (on default) July 24, 2024	Failure to satisfy two monetary judgements entered against him in the U.S. District Court for the Southern District of New York
Kenneth F. Nwele 231 AD3d 119	Suspended 1 year July 31, 2024	Misappropriation; failed to properly identify escrow account; practiced under misleading firm name
Leonard D. Duboff, admitted as Leonard David Duboff 231 AD3d 162	Public Censure August 7, 2024	Reciprocal sanction for public reprimand in Oregon – Failed to disclose essential terms of a transaction entered into with clients
Therese Marie Filardi, also known as Therese M. Larussa 231 AD3d 245	Suspended 1 year August 21, 2024	Reciprocal sanction for 10 month suspension in Massachusetts – Made unauthorized charge on client credit card; failed to properly maintain IOLTA account
Daniel G. Ruggiero, admitted as Daniel Goldsmith Ruggiero 232 AD3d 124	Suspended 1 year September 11, 2024	Reciprocal sanction for 1 year and 1 day suspension in Massachusetts – Participated in scheme with nonlawyers to charge and collect illegal and excessive fees from clients
Jennifer Lee Bienenstock	Non-Disciplinary Resignation – Granted September 17, 2024	
Richard N. Bowers	Non-Disciplinary Resignation – Granted September 17, 2024	
Jenna Eileen Browning	Non-Disciplinary Resignation – Granted September 17, 2024	
Nancy Anne Brownstein	Non-Disciplinary Resignation – Granted September 17, 2024	
Lauren E. Caesar, admitted as Lauren Elise Heifetz	Non-Disciplinary Resignation – Granted September 17, 2024	
Charles Cipolla	Non-Disciplinary Resignation – Granted September 17, 2024	

David Curtis Embree	Non-Disciplinary Resignation – Granted September 17, 2024	
Susan M. Fettner	Non-Disciplinary Resignation – Granted September 17, 2024	
Timothy Kilgariff Gibbons	Non-Disciplinary Resignation – Granted September 17, 2024	
Douglas Seth Glucroft	Non-Disciplinary Resignation – Granted September 17, 2024	
Edward Barry Gradinger	Non-Disciplinary Resignation – Granted September 17, 2024	
Don Henry Hainbach	Non-Disciplinary Resignation – Granted September 17, 2024	
Howard Warren Hans	Non-Disciplinary Resignation – Granted September 17, 2024	
Thomas F. Harrison	Non-Disciplinary Resignation – Granted September 17, 2024	
Lawrence Terry Hurwitz	Non-Disciplinary Resignation – Granted September 17, 2024	
David Stephen Jacobs	Non-Disciplinary Resignation – Granted September 17, 2024	
George James Kokorelis	Non-Disciplinary Resignation – Granted September 17, 2024	
Alfred C. Knight	Non-Disciplinary Resignation – Granted September 17, 2024	

Justin T. Loughry, admitted as Justin Terence Loughry	Non-Disciplinary Resignation – Granted September 17, 2024	
Alan S. Madans	Non-Disciplinary Resignation – Granted September 17, 2024	
Estrella Devnice Cedillo Martinez	Non-Disciplinary Resignation – Granted September 17, 2024	
Jeffrey Andrew Mason	Non-Disciplinary Resignation – Granted September 17, 2024	
John T. Moore, admitted as John Thomas Moore	Non-Disciplinary Resignation – Granted September 17, 2024	
Glynne Nelson	Non-Disciplinary Resignation – Granted September 17, 2024	
Serena Michelle Nguyen	Non-Disciplinary Resignation – Granted September 17, 2024	
William Councilman Owens, Jr.	Non-Disciplinary Resignation – Granted September 17, 2024	
Daniel J. Ping, admitted as Daniel John Ping	Non-Disciplinary Resignation – Granted September 17, 2024	
Deborah Sorace Prutzman	Non-Disciplinary Resignation – Granted September 17, 2024	
Robert John Roth	Non-Disciplinary Resignation – Granted September 17, 2024	
David M. Schwarz, admitted as David Michael Schwarz	Non-Disciplinary Resignation – Granted September 17, 2024	

Jonathan William Sobel	Non-Disciplinary Resignation – Granted September 17, 2024	
Joseph Paul Stevens	Non-Disciplinary Resignation – Granted September 17, 2024	
Martin G. Weinstein, admitted as Martin Garson Weinstein	Non-Disciplinary Resignation – Granted September 17, 2024	
William Watters, admitted as William M. Watters	Non-Disciplinary Resignation – Granted September 17, 2024	
Dennis Steven Berkowsky, a disbarred attorney	Application to withdraw second motion for reinstatement – Granted September 16, 2024	By decision and order on motion dated December 21, 2022, respondent's second motion for reinstatement was held in abeyance and referred for investigation to the Committee on Character and Fitness; the December 21, 2022 decision and order is recalled and vacated, and the second motion for reinstatement is deemed withdrawn
Israel D. Weinstein, admitted as Israel Dov Weinstein, a suspended attorney	Motion to reargue denied September 16, 2024	By opinion and order dated November 29, 2023, respondent was suspended for five years, effective December 29, 2023; his motion for leave to argue is denied
Erik W. Centner 233 AD3d 44	Public censure October 9, 2024	Reciprocal sanction for admonition in Arizona – Violated rules concerning diligence, communication, and duties to former clients
Arthur Joseph Morburger, admitted as Arthur J. Morburger 233 AD3d 119	Disbarred November 6, 2024	Reciprocal sanction for suspension and disbarment in Florida – Violation of rules concerning safekeeping property, trust accounts, and conduct involving dishonesty, fraud, deceit, or misrepresentation
Richard J. Zimmerman, a suspended attorney	Reinstatement denied November 15, 2024	
Michael G. Albano	Non-Disciplinary Resignation – Granted November 21, 2024	

Jonathan Carroll Latimer	Non-Disciplinary Resignation – Granted November 21, 2024	
Fadi Mansour	Non-Disciplinary Resignation – Granted November 21, 2024	
Francis John McKee	Non-Disciplinary Resignation – Granted November 21, 2024	
Alan Jay Sanders	Non-Disciplinary Resignation – Granted November 21, 2024	
Loren Siegel	Non-Disciplinary Resignation – Granted November 21, 2024	
Anne F. Zinkin, admitted as Anne Frances Zinkin	Non-Disciplinary Resignation – Granted November 21, 2024	
Kenneth Barrett Phillips 234 AD3d 35	Suspended 6 months December 4, 2024	Reciprocal sanction for 3 month suspension in Massachusetts, which was stayed for one year with conditions – Insufficient and noncompliant recordkeeping and reconciliations; misuse of client funds
Larry Wallace 234 AD3d 59	Disbarred (on default) December 11, 2024	Misappropriation; conduct prejudicial to the administration of justice; failure to maintain required bookkeeping records; failure to properly title escrow account checks

**GRIEVANCE COMMITTEE FOR THE
SECOND, ELEVENTH & THIRTEENTH
JUDICIAL DISTRICTS**

Staff - 2024

Diana Maxfield Kearse, Chief Counsel (*until May 2024*)
David W. Chandler, Chief Counsel (*effective November 2024*)
Mark F. DeWan, Deputy Chief Counsel
Susan Korenberg, Staff Counsel
Susan B. Master, Staff Counsel
Sara Mustafa, Staff Counsel
Lisa M. McCabe, Staff Counsel (*until November 2024*)
Lauren C. Cooper, Staff Counsel
Conor Hartnett, Staff Counsel
Michael D'Ambrosio, Staff Counsel
Erika Edinger, Accountant
Timothy McCormick, Paralegal (*until August 2024*)
Thomas Catapano, Investigator
Vanessa Mendez, Court Analyst
Claudette Coleman, Secretary
Tacia Compail, Secretary
Jennifer Campoverde, Secretary

**COMMITTEE MEMBERS
OF THE
GRIEVANCE COMMITTEE FOR THE
SECOND, ELEVENTH AND THIRTEENTH
JUDICIAL DISTRICTS**

2024

Andrea E. Bonina, Esq., Chair (*Former Chair - term ended in October 2024*)
Angelicque M. Moreno, Esq., Chair (*Current Chair - effective November 2024*)
Michael D. Abneri, Esq.
Jeffrey Alfano, Esq.
Lamont R. Bailey, Esq.
Joseph Carola, III, Esq.
Lee A. Coppage, Esq.
Allyn J. Crawford, Esq. (*Former member - term ended in October 2024*)
Michael C. Farkas, Esq. (*Former member - term ended in September 2024*)
Michael V. Gervasi, Esq.
Yvette A. Hinds Wills, Esq.
Vivia L. Joseph, Esq.
Kim M. Melendez, LCSW*
Raquel Miranda, Esq.
Jaclyn Rinaldo*
Casilda E. Roper-Simpson, Esq.
Violet E. Samuels, Esq.
Joy A. Thomson, Esq.
Anthony W. Vaughn, Jr., Esq. (*Former member - term ended in November 2024*)
Christine A. Walsh, MD, FAAP, FACC*
Jesus M. Zeno, Esq.

***Lay Persons**

A

PROFESSIONAL MATTERS CASELOAD REPORT

GRIEVANCE COMMITTEE: AGC, THIRD DEPARTMENT

REPORT PERIOD: AMENDED ANNUAL REPORT (01/01/2024 through 12/31/2024)

DATE: 04/15/25

I. PROFESSIONAL MATTERS¹ PROCESSED BY THE COMMITTEE:

A. Matters Pending at Start of Report Period	<u>2,740</u>
B. New Matters During Report Period (see Part II, <u>infra</u>)	<u>5,094</u>
C. Closed Matters Reactivated During Report Period ²	<u>66</u>
D. Total Matters to be Processed During Report Period (A+B+C)	<u>7,900</u>
E. Total Matters Disposed of During Report Period (see Parts III & IV, <u>infra</u>)	<u>4,374</u>
F. Matters Pending at End of Report Period (I.D - I.E)	<u>3,526</u>

II. NEW MATTERS DURING REPORT PERIOD:

A. Sua Sponte Investigations Authorized by Committee Pursuant to Rules for Attorney Disciplinary Matters (22 NYCRR) § 1240.7 (a) (1) ³	<u>42</u>
B. Cases Referred by the Court for Examination Due to Reversal of a Criminal Conviction on the Ground of Ineffective Assistance of Counsel or Prosecutorial Misconduct	<u>0</u>
C. Matters Arising Under Judiciary Law § 90 (4) (c) and Rules for Attorney Disciplinary Matters (22 NYCRR) § 1240.12 (a)	<u>13</u>
D. Matters Arising Under Rules for Attorney Disciplinary Matters (22 NYCRR) § 1240.13 (d)	<u>50</u>
E. Matters Arising Under Rules for Attorney Disciplinary Matters (22 NYCRR) § 1240.9 ⁴	<u>8</u>

¹ The term "Matters" refers to individual files generated by complaint, inquiry or other filing at the Committee level and any one respondent may be the subject of multiple matters simultaneously.

² May also include closed matters which have become subject to Court review pursuant to Rules for Attorney Disciplinary Matters (22 NYCRR) § 1240.7 (e) or CPLR art 56.

³ May include Dishonored Check Reports pursuant to Rules of Appellate Division, All Departments (22 NYCRR) § 1300.1 (g).

⁴ Refers to a new Matter arising from an existing file where the respondent has failed to cooperate with the Committee investigation (§ 1240.9 [a] [1], [3]), or where the investigation has given rise to an admission by the

F. Motions for Reinstatement Pursuant to Rules for Attorney Disciplinary Matters (22 NYCRR) §§ 1240.16, 1240.17 & 1240.22 (b)	<u>90</u>
G. Applications for Leave to Resign Pursuant to Rules for Attorney Disciplinary Matters (22 NYCRR) § 1240.22 (a)	<u>198</u>
H. Attorney Solicitation Filings Pursuant to Rules of Professional Conduct (22 NYCRR 1200.0) rule 7.3 (c) (1)	<u>37</u>
I. Disciplinary History Letter Requests and Other Inquiries	<u>2,018</u>
J. All Other Complaints Filed or Transferred in Pursuant to Rules for Attorney Disciplinary Matters (22 NYCRR) § 1240.7 (a) (1) or (2)	<u>2,638</u>
TOTAL NEW MATTERS	<u>5,094</u>

III. MATTERS DISPOSED OF BY CHIEF ATTORNEY:

A. Matters Disposed of Pursuant to Rules for Attorney Disciplinary Matters (22 NYCRR) § 1240.7 (d) (1) (i)	<u>390</u>
B. Matters Referred to Other Agencies Pursuant to Rules for Attorney Disciplinary Matters (22 NYCRR) § 1240.7 (d) (1) (ii)	<u>34</u>
C. Matters Transferred to Another Grievance Committee Pursuant to Rules for Attorney Disciplinary Matters (22 NYCRR) § 1240.7 (a) (2)	<u>124</u>
D. Other⁵	<u>3,354</u>
TOTAL DISPOSED OF BY CHIEF ATTORNEY	<u>3,902</u>

IV. MATTERS DISPOSED OF BY COMMITTEE:

A. Matters Disposed of Pursuant to Rules for Attorney Disciplinary Matters (22 NYCRR) § 1240.7 (d) (2) (i) or (ii)	<u>103</u>
---	------------

respondent under oath (§ 1240.9 [a] [2]), or revealed that the respondent has willfully failed to paid money to a client (§ 1240.9 [a] [4]) or exposed uncontroverted evidence of the respondent's misconduct (§ 1240.9 [a] [5]).

⁵ Includes acknowledgment of Attorney Solicitation Filings pursuant to Rules of Professional Conduct (22 NYCRR 1200.0) rule 7.3 (c) (1), the provision of disciplinary history letters upon request and other closed inquiries.

B. Issuance of a Letter of Advisement Pursuant to Rules for Attorney Disciplinary Matters (22 NYCRR) § 1240.7 (d) (2) (iv)	<u>69</u>
C. Issuance of an Admonition Pursuant to Rules for Attorney Disciplinary Matters (22 NYCRR) § 1240.7 (d) (2) (v)	<u>47</u>
D. Matters Referred to the Appellate Division for Action	
1. Pursuant to Rules for Attorney Disciplinary Matters (22 NYCRR) § 1240.8	<u>10</u>
2. Pursuant to Rules for Attorney Disciplinary Matters (22 NYCRR) § 1240.9 (see Part II.E, <u>supra</u>)	<u>0</u>
3. Pursuant to Rules for Attorney Disciplinary Matters (22 NYCRR) § 1240.10 (for Matters under investigation)	<u>0</u>
4. Pursuant to Rules for Attorney Disciplinary Matters (22 NYCRR) § 1240.11	<u>0</u>
5. Pursuant to Rules for Attorney Disciplinary Matters (22 NYCRR) § 1240.12	<u>0</u>
6. Pursuant to Rules for Attorney Disciplinary Matters (22 NYCRR) § 1240.13	<u>0</u>
7. Pursuant to Rules for Attorney Disciplinary Matters (22 NYCRR) § 1240.14	<u>0</u>
TOTAL REFERRED TO APPELLATE DIVISION	<u>10</u>

E. Responsive Filings

1. On Motions for Reinstatement Pursuant to Rules for Attorney Disciplinary Matters (22 NYCRR) §§ 1240.16, 1240.17 and 1240.22 (b) (see Part II.F, <u>supra</u>)	<u>85</u>
2. On Applications for Leave to Resign Pursuant to Rules for Attorney Disciplinary Matters (22 NYCRR) § 1240.22 (a) (see Part II.G, <u>supra</u>)	<u>158</u>

3. On Motions for Court Review Pursuant to Rules for Attorney Disciplinary Matters (22 NYCRR) § 1240.7 (e)	
(1) (ii) and (2) (<u>see</u> Part I.C and associated footnote, <u>supra</u>)	<u>0</u>
TOTAL RESPONSIVE FILINGS	<u>243</u>
TOTAL DISPOSED OF BY COMMITTEE	<u>472</u>

V. CASES⁶ PROCESSED BY THE APPELLATE DIVISION:

A. Cases Pending at Start of Report Period	<u>46</u>
B. Cases Initiated During Report Period ⁷	<u>1,766</u>
C. Cases Disposed of During Report Period (<u>see</u> Part VI, <u>infra</u>)	<u>1,804</u>
D. Cases Pending at End of Report Period (A + B - C)	<u>8</u>

VI. CASES DISPOSED OF BY THE APPELLATE DIVISION:

A. Disbarments, including disciplinary resignation	<u>7</u>
B. Suspensions (Including Pursuant to Rules for Attorney Disciplinary Matters [22 NYCRR] §§ 1240.9 and 1240.14)	<u>987</u>
C. Censures	<u>7</u>
Dismissed	<u>28</u>
D. Reinstatements Granted	<u>73</u>
E. Reinstatements Denied	<u>5</u>
F. Nondisciplinary Resignations Granted	<u>143</u>
G. Nondisciplinary Resignations Denied	<u>7</u>
H. Other	<u>547</u>
TOTAL DISPOSED OF BY THE APPELLATE DIVISION	<u>1,804</u>

⁶ The term "Cases" refers to filings made at the Appellate Division level, is respondent-specific, and any such Case may encompass what was previously multiple Matters at the Committee level.

⁷ Includes Cases referred to the Appellate Division (see Part IV.D, supra), motions for reinstatement pursuant to Rules for Attorney Disciplinary Matters (22 NYCRR) §§ 1240.16, 1240.17 and 1240.22 (b) (see Part II.F, supra), applications for leave to resign pursuant to Rules for Attorney Disciplinary Matters (22 NYCRR) § 1240.22 (a) (see Part II.G, supra), and motions for Court review pursuant to Rules for Attorney Disciplinary Matters (22 NYCRR) § 1240.7 (e) (1) (ii) and (2) (see Parts I.C and IV.E.3).

VII. PRACTICE AREA STATISTICS:

A. CRIMINAL LAW

1. New Matters During Report Period (<u>see Part II, <i>supra</i></u>)	
Pertaining to Prosecutors	<u>50</u>
Pertaining to Defense Counsel	<u>188</u>
2. Matters Disposed of Pursuant to Rules for Attorney	
Disciplinary Matters (22 NYCRR) § 1240.7 (d) (1) or	
(2) (i), (ii) or (iv)	
Pertaining to Prosecutors	<u>34</u>
Pertaining to Defense Counsel	<u>152</u>
Matters Disposed of Pursuant to Rules for Attorney	
Disciplinary Matters (22 NYCRR) § 1240.7 (d) (2) (v) and	
Cases Disposed of by the Appellate Division	
(<u>see Part VI.A-VI.C, <i>supra</i></u>)	
Pertaining to Prosecutors	<u>0</u>
Pertaining to Defense Counsel	<u>0</u>

B. IMMIGRATION LAW

1. New Matters During Report Period (<u>see Part II, <i>supra</i></u>)	<u>51</u>
2. Matters Disposed of Pursuant to Rules for Attorney	
Disciplinary Matters (22 NYCRR) § 1240.7 (d) (1) or	
(2) (i), (ii) or (iv)	<u>23</u>
3. Matters Disposed of Pursuant to Rules for Attorney	
Disciplinary Matters (22 NYCRR) § 1240.7 (d) (2) (v) and	
Cases Disposed of by the Appellate Division	
(<u>see Part VI.A-VI.C, <i>supra</i></u>)	<u>0</u>

C. FAMILY & MATRIMONIAL LAW

1. New Matters During Report Period (<u>see Part II, <i>supra</i></u>)	<u>139</u>
2. Matters Disposed of Pursuant to Rules for Attorney	
Disciplinary Matters (22 NYCRR) § 1240.7 (d) (1) or	

(2) (i), (ii) or (iv)	<u>104</u>
3. Matters Disposed of Pursuant to Rules for Attorney Disciplinary Matters (22 NYCRR) § 1240.7 (d) (2) (v) and Cases Disposed of by the Appellate Division (<u>see Part VI.A-VI.C, supra</u>)	<u>0</u>
D. REAL PROPERTY	
1. New Matters During Report Period (<u>see Part II, supra</u>)	<u>36</u>
2. Matters Disposed of Pursuant to Rules for Attorney Disciplinary Matters (22 NYCRR) § 1240.7 (d) (1) or (2) (i), (ii) or (iv)	<u>29</u>
3. Matters Disposed of Pursuant to Rules for Attorney Disciplinary Matters (22 NYCRR) § 1240.7 (d) (2) (v) and Cases Disposed of by the Appellate Division (<u>see Part VI.A-VI.C, supra</u>)	<u>0</u>
E. TRUSTS & ESTATES	
1. New Matters During Report Period (<u>see Part II, supra</u>)	<u>42</u>
2. Matters Disposed of Pursuant to Rules for Attorney Disciplinary Matters (22 NYCRR) § 1240.7 (d) (1) or (2) (i), (ii) or (iv)	<u>40</u>
3. Matters Disposed of Pursuant to Rules for Attorney Disciplinary Matters (22 NYCRR) § 1240.7 (d) (2) (v) and Cases Disposed of by the Appellate Division (<u>see Part VI.A-VI.C, supra</u>)	<u>0</u>
F. COMMERCIAL LITIGATION	
1. New Matters During Report Period (<u>see Part II, supra</u>)	<u>6</u>
2. Matters Disposed of Pursuant to Rules for Attorney Disciplinary Matters (22 NYCRR) § 1240.7 (d) (1) or (2) (i), (ii) or (iv)	<u>2</u>
3. Matters Disposed of Pursuant to Rules for Attorney	

Disciplinary Matters (22 NYCRR) § 1240.7 (d) (2) (v) and
Cases Disposed of by the Appellate Division
(see Part VI.A-VI.C, supra) 0

G. OTHER CIVIL LITIGATION

1. New Matters During Report Period (<u>see</u> Part II, <u>supra</u>)	<u>185</u>
2. Matters Disposed of Pursuant to Rules for Attorney Disciplinary Matters (22 NYCRR) § 1240.7 (d) (1) or (2) (i), (ii) or (iv)	<u>132</u>
3. Matters Disposed of Pursuant to Rules for Attorney Disciplinary Matters (22 NYCRR) § 1240.7 (d) (2) (v) and Cases Disposed of by the Appellate Division (<u>see</u> Part VI.A-VI.C, <u>supra</u>)	<u>0</u>

B

2024
APPELLATE DIVISION
THIRD JUDICIAL DEPARTMENT

DECISIONS

DECIDED AND ENTERED:

January 11, 2024

REINSTATEMENT [(22 NYCRR) §1240.16]

Granted:

Matter of Jenette Hernandez - PM-01-24
Matter of Jocelyn Elizabeth Mackie - PM-02-24
Matter of Emi Wakatsuki - PM-03-24

January 18, 2024

REINSTATEMENT [(22 NYCRR) §1240.16]

Denied:

Matter of Ronald Leonard Daigle, Jr., - PM-04-24

January 25, 2024

REINSTATEMENT [(22 NYCRR) §1240.16]

Granted:

Matter of Urs Martin Lauchli - PM-05-24
Matter of Ojeaga Adebola Longe - PM-06-24
Matter of Patrina Alesia Ozurumba - PM-07-24
Matter of Karen Sett Wong - PM-08-24

February 1, 2024

REINSTATEMENT [(22 NYCRR) §1240.16]

Denied:

[Matter of Anthony Emeka Nze Nwosu - PM-16-24](#)

REINSTATEMENT CONDITIONS SATISFIED [(22 NYCRR) §1240.16]

[Matter of Vincent Dominick Paragano - PM-09-24](#)

NONDISCIPLINARY RESIGNATION [(22 NYCRR) §1240.22(a)]

Granted:

[Matter of Michael Everett Heygood - PM-10-24](#)

[Matter of Patricia Marie Malone - PM-12-24](#)

[Matter of Cynthia Kellie Sargeant - PM-13-24](#)

[Matter of Eileen Weiss Toll - PM-14-24](#)

[Matter of Nancy Louise Walkley - PM-15-24](#)

Denied:

[Matter of Bruce Michael Cooper - PM-11-24](#)

February 8, 2024

REINSTATEMENT [(22 NYCRR) §1240.16]

Granted:

[Matter of Fang Bao - PM-17-24](#)

[Matter of Grace Marie Walsh Gallagher - PM-18-24](#)

February 15, 2024

REINSTATEMENT [(22 NYCRR) §1240.16]

Denied:

[Matter of Sung Youl Kim - PM-19-24](#)

February 29, 2024

REINSTATEMENT CONDITIONS TERMINATED AND SATISFIED

[Matter of William Castro - PM-20-24](#)

REINSTATEMENT [(22 NYCRR) §1240.16]

Granted:

[Matter of Michael Anthony Suarez - PM-21-24](#)

[Matter of Aleksandra Elzbieta Krawcewicz - PM-22-24](#)

[Matter of Peter Seung-K Wang Lee - PM-23-24](#)

[Matter of Seni Mansur Adio - PM-25-24](#)

[Matter of Qi Jing - PM-27-24](#)

NONDISCIPLINARY RESIGNATION [(22 NYCRR) §1240.22(a)]

Granted:

[Matter of Kimberly Jeanne Gost - PM-24-24](#)

[Matter of Jerome J. Convery - PM-26-24](#)

[Matter of Peter Liloia III - PM-28-24](#)

March 7, 2024

REINSTATEMENT [(22 NYCRR) §1240.16]

Granted:

[Matter of Rosemarie Andrea Anderson - PM-34-24](#)
[Matter of Amante Albano Pimentel - PM-29-24](#)
[Matter of Daniel Mark Donahue - PM-30-24](#)
[Matter of Youngsoog Na - PM-31-24](#)

NONDISCIPLINARY RESIGNATION [(22 NYCRR) §1240.22(a)]

Granted:

[Matter of Jonathan Michael Cohen - PM-32-24](#)
[Matter of Hector A. Rivera Jr. - PM-33-24](#)
[Matter of Mary B. Androski - PM-35-24](#)
[Matter of Catherine Esther Bocskor - PM-36-24](#)
[Matter of Ollie Minton Harton - PM-37-24](#)
[Matter of Eli Patrick McCrain - PM-38-24](#)

March 14, 2024

CENSURE [(22 NYCRR) §1240.13]

[Matter of Hanna Mary Renna - PM-43-24](#)

SUSPENSION [(22 NYCRR) §1240.9(a)]

[Matter of Delores Felice Seligman - PM-44-24](#)

MOTION TO REARGUE

Denied:

[Matter of Jerry Ray Hamling - PM-42-24](#)

SUSPENSION ORDER VACATED [(22 NYCRR) §1240.9(a)]

[Matter of Delores Felice Seligman - PM-44-24](#)

NONDISCIPLINARY RESIGNATION [(22 NYCRR) §1240.22(a)]

Granted:

[Matter of Robert Adam Mosier - PM-39-24](#)

[Matter of Daniel Farrell O'Brien - PM-40-24](#)

[Matter of Peter David Van Buren - PM-41-24](#)

March 21, 2024

SUSPENSION [(22 NYCRR) §1240.14]

[Matter of Daniel Joseph O'Phelan - PM-51-24](#)

REINSTATEMENT [(22 NYCRR) §1240.16]

Granted:

[Matter of Tsipora Benji - PM-45-24](#)

[Matter of Michael Andrew Fusco - PM-46-24](#)

[Matter of Kyung Jin Kim - PM-47-24](#)

[Matter of Sun Min Lee - PM-48-24](#)

[Matter of Xiaoyuan Li - PM-49-24](#)

[Matter of Olrick Michael Ojong - PM-50-24](#)

April 4, 2024

SUSPENSION [(22 NYCRR) §1240.13]

[Matter of Gemma Marilyn Antoine-Belton - PM-55-24](#)

CENSURE [(22NYCRR) §1240.8]

[Matter of Paul L. Gruner - PM-56-24](#)

REINSTATEMENT [(22 NYCRR) §1240.16]

Granted:

[Matter of Benjamin Michael Saul - PM-59-24](#)

NONDISCIPLINARY RESIGNATION [(22 NYCRR) §1240.22(a)]

Granted:

[Matter of Kayley Alexis Bebber - PM-52-24](#)

[Matter of Thomas Aquinas DiBiase - PM-53-24](#)

[Matter of Deborah McInnes Festa - PM-54-24](#)

[Matter of Ryan Paul Hallisey - PM-57-24](#)

[Matter of Joseph G. Murray - PM-58-24](#)

April 11, 2024

NONDISCIPLINARY RESIGNATION [(22 NYCRR) §1240.22(a)]

Granted:

[Matter of Marcia A. Membrino - PM-60-24](#)

[Matter of Jeffrey David Singer - PM-61-24](#)

[Matter of Ellyn C. Vigin - PM-62-24](#)

[Matter of Thomas Granville Burgess - PM-63-24](#)

[Matter of Peter J. Liska - PM-64-24](#)

[Matter of Tara Dahl Mattessich - PM-65-24](#)

[Matter of James David Toll - PM-66-24](#)

April 18, 2024

DISBARMENT [(22 NYCRR) §1240.13]

[Matter of Zak Ahmad Aljaludi - PM-69-24](#)

ORDER STAYING INVESTIGATION VACATED [(22 NYCRR) §1240.14]

[Matter of Randel Aaron Scharf - PM-67-24](#)

NONDISCIPLINARY RESIGNATION [(22 NYCRR) §1240.22(a)]

Granted:

[Matter of Scott Douglas Pinsky - PM-68-24](#)

April 25, 2024

REINSTATEMENT [(22 NYCRR) §1240.16]

Granted:

[Matter of Demetra Agriantoni, also known as Demetra Agriantoni Maurice - PM-70-24](#)
[Matter of Sabrina Alyce Nelson - PM-72-24](#)
[Matter of Catherine Sunae Shin - PM-73-24](#)
[Matter of Kali Chantelle Jones- PM-75-24](#)
[Matter of Eric Ryan Plant - PM-76-24](#)

**REINSTATEMENT [(22 NYCRR) §1240.16] and
NONDISCIPLINARY RESIGNATION [(22 NYCRR) §1240.22(a)]**

Granted:

[Matter of Katherine Ann Aidala - PM-71-24](#)
[Matter of Vilas S. Dhar - PM-74-24](#)

May 2, 2024

REINSTATEMENT [(22 NYCRR) §1240.16]

Denied:

[Matter of Yasutaka Orihara - P-78-24](#)

May 9, 2024

SUSPENSION [(22 NYCRR) §1240.13]

[Matter of Rita Horwitz Altman - PM-86-24](#)

[Matter of William Haymore Brammer, Jr. - PM-87-24](#)

SUSPENSION [(22 NYCRR) §1240.8(a)(5)]

[Matter of Gerald Orseck - PM-88-24](#)

NONDISCIPLINARY RESIGNATION [(22 NYCRR) §1240.22(a)]

Granted:

[Matter of Kate Lommel Ciravolo - PM-79-24](#)

[Matter of Jonathan D. Deily - PM-80-24](#)

[Matter of Beth Ann Diebel - PM-81-24](#)

[Matter of Todd Charles Fineberg - PM-82-24](#)

[Matter of Marcus Harry Karavan - PM-83-24](#)

[Matter of Harry Post Meislahn - PM-84-24](#)

[Matter of Catherine Marie Squillace - PM-85-24](#)

May 16, 2024

CENSURED [(22 NYCRR) §1240.8(a)(5)]

[Matter of Devon Joseph Casertino - PM-94-24](#)

NONDISCIPLINARY RESIGNATION [(22 NYCRR) §1240.22(a)]

Granted:

[Matter of Jin Hee Ahn - PM-89-24](#)
[Matter of Matthew Edward Feinberg - PM-90-24](#)
[Matter of Susan Ghelerter - PM-91-24](#)
[Matter of J. Stuart Lemle - PM-92-24](#)
[Matter of William Bailey Roberts - PM-93-24](#)
[Matter of Joseph Mead Gesley - PM-95-24](#)
[Matter of Daniel Raymond Healy - PM-96-24](#)

May 23, 2024

REINSTATEMENT [(22 NYCRR) §1240.16]

Granted:

[Matter of John Michael Amorison - PM-97-24](#)
[Matter of Geeta Nadia Kapur - PM-99-24](#)
[Matter of Christian John Riddell - PM-100-24](#)
[Matter of Ricardo Mena Sanchez - PM-101-24](#)
[Matter of Yingmao Tang - PM-102-24](#)

REINSTATEMENT [(22 NYCRR) §1240.16] and
NONDISCIPLINARY RESIGNATION [(22 NYCRR) §1240.22(a)]

Granted:

[Matter of Peter Christian Hus - PM-98-24](#)

May 30, 2024

SUSPENSION [(22 NYCRR) §1240.13]

[Matter of Paul Saul Haar - PM-109-24](#)

REINSTATEMENT [(22 NYCRR) §1240.16]

Granted:

Matter of Eberechukwu Nkechinyere Nwakudu.

Also known as Eberechukwu Nkechinyere Nwakudu Ekechukwu - PM-112-24

NONDISCIPLINARY RESIGNATION [(22 NYCRR) §1240.22(a)]

Granted:

Matter of Charyn Kay Hain - PM-103-24

Matter of Francis L. Ramirez - PM-104-24

Matter of Helen Vera - PM-105-24

Matter of Cynthia Nicole Baker - PM-106-24

Matter of James Wright Clayton - PM-107-24

Matter of Nancy Sher Cohen - PM-108-24

Matter of Kyung Jin Kim - PM-110-24

Matter of Nancy Carol Smith - PM-111-24

June 6, 2024

DISBARMENT [(22 NYCRR) §1240.13}]

Matter of Bryan Nazor - PM-118-24

SUSPENSION [(22 NYCRR) §1240.9(a)]

Matter of John Frederick Gearing - PM-114-24

**DECISION AND ORDER RELIEVING BAR ASSOCIATION OF
LIMITED CUSTODIAN APPOINTMENT**

Matter of Randel Aaron Scharf - PM-117-24

NONDISCIPLINARY RESIGNATION [(22 NYCRR) §1240.22(a)]

Granted:

[Matter of Nathan Hoye Nelson - PM-116-24](#)

Denied:

[Matter of Mary Elizabeth Deal - PM-113-24](#)

[Matter of Thomas James Henderson - PM-115-24](#)

June 13, 2024

DISBARMENT [(22 NYCRR) §1240.13]

[Matter of Gary Lee Mason - PM-120-24](#)

REINSTATEMENT [(22 NYCRR) §1240.16]

Granted:

[Matter of John Thomas Shaban - PM-119-24](#)

June 20, 2024

REINSTATEMENT [(22 NYCRR) §1240.16]

Granted:

[Matter of Jennifer Paige Lambdin - PM-121-24](#)

[Matter of Lisa Liju Wong - PM-122-24](#)

NONDISCIPLINARY RESIGNATION [(22 NYCRR) §1240.22(a)]

Granted:

[Matter of Robert P. Hall-App - PM-123-24](#)

June 27, 2024

REINSTATEMENT [(22 NYCRR) §1240.16]

Granted:

[Matter of Willem Lodewikus Pretorius - PM-124-24](#)

July 3, 2024

NONDISCIPLINARY RESIGNATION [(22 NYCRR) §1240.22(a)]

Granted:

[Matter of Fern Ruth Epstein - PM-125-24](#)

[Matter of Robert Steven Hertzberg - PM-126-24](#)

[Matter of Frederic Warren Jacoby - PM-127-24](#)

[Matter of John Cicchino - PM-128-24](#)

[Matter of Ian Clemson Driscoll - PM-129-24](#)

[Matter of Claudine Q. Homolash - PM-130-24](#)

[Matter of Robert A. Kaye - PM-131-24](#)

[Matter of Elan Howard Ronen - PM-132-24](#)

July 11, 2024

DISBARMENT [(22 NYCRR) §1240.12]

[Matter of James Dalton Saunders - PM-138-24](#)

NONDISCIPLINARY RESIGNATION [(22 NYCRR) §1240.22(a)]

Granted:

[Matter of Barbara L. Prendergast - PM-133-24](#)

[Matter of Heather Louise Erskine - PM-134-24](#)

[Matter of Daniel Michael Majtan III - PM-135-24](#)

[Matter of Stephen Albert Unsworth - PM-137-24](#)

Denied:

[Matter of William Joseph Martin - PM-136-24](#)

July 18, 2024

**RESIGNATION WHILE INVESTIGATION OR PROCEEDING IS PENDING-
DISBARMENT [(22 NYCRR) §1240.10]**

[Matter of E. Stewart Jones, Jr. - PM-139-24](#)

NONDISCIPLINARY RESIGNATION [(22 NYCRR) §1240.22(a)]

Granted:

[Matter of Quinton Rhys Singleton - PM-140-24](#)

[Matter of Steven James Talevi - PM-141-24](#)

July 25, 2024

REINSTATEMENT [(22 NYCRR) §1240.16]

Granted:

[Matter of Nisha Pramod Koradia - PM-142-24](#)

[Matter of Yanyan Song - PM-144-24](#)

REINSTATEMENT WITH CONDITIONS [(22 NYCRR) §1240.16]

Granted:

[Matter of Thomas Joseph Tierney - PM-146-24](#)

REINSTATEMENT [(22 NYCRR) §1240.16] and
NONDISCIPLINARY RESIGNATION [(22 NYCRR) §1240.22(a)]

Granted:

[Matter of Gareth William Notis - PM-143-24](#)

NONDISCIPLINARY RESIGNATION [(22 NYCRR) §1240.22(a)]

Granted:

[Matter of Alyssa Noreen Farley - PM-145-24](#)

[Matter of Kathryn Christine Vouri-Misso - PM-147-24](#)

[Matter of Peter Richard Jarvis - PM-148-24](#)

August 1, 2024

SUSPENSION [(22 NYCRR) §1240.13]

[Matter of Daniel David Hediger - PM-149-24](#)

REINSTATEMENT WITH CONDITIONS [(22 NYCRR) §1240.16]

Granted:

[Matter of Rachel Ann Mariner - PM-151-24](#)

NONDISCIPLINARY RESIGNATION [(22 NYCRR) §1240.22(a)]

Granted:

[Matter of Douglas Mark Husid - PM-150-24](#)

[Matter of Hannah Jean Vice - PM-152-24](#)

August 8, 2024

SUSPENSION [(22 NYCRR) §1240.13]

[Matter of Wilson Daniel Swayze Jr. - PM-162-24](#)

CENSURE [(22 NYCRR) §1240.13]

[Matter of Allan Baldwin Cruikshank Jr. - PM-159-24](#)

REINSTATEMENT [(22 NYCRR) §1240.16]

Granted:

[Matter of John James Hayes II - PM-153-24](#)

[Matter of Hiroko Miyazaki - PM-154-24](#)

[Matter of Sara Irfan Shah - PM-155-24](#)

NONDISCIPLINARY RESIGNATION [(22 NYCRR) §1240.22(a)]

Granted:

[Matter of Joseph Anthony Merlino - PM-156-24](#)

[Matter of Alison Douty Mortinger - PM-157-24](#)

[Matter of Gavin Robert Tisdale - PM-158-24](#)

[Matter of Alan Stephen Deutsch - PM-160-24](#)

[Matter of Kimberly Ann Kearney - PM-161-24](#)

August 15, 2024

REINSTATEMENT WITH CONDITIONS [(22 NYCRR) §1240.16]

Granted:

[Matter of David John Watson - PM-164-24](#)

NONDISCIPLINARY RESIGNATION [(22 NYCRR) §1240.22(a)]

Granted:

[Matter of Frank Evan Karabetsos - PM-163-24](#)

[Matter of Thomas Anthony Callaghan - PM-165-24](#)

[Matter of Mark Leland Hopkins - PM-166-24](#)

August 22, 2024

CENSURE [(22 NYCRR) §1240.13]

[Matter of Herbert Ira Mendelsohn - PM-167-24](#)

REINSTATEMENT [(22 NYCRR) §1240.16]

Granted:

[Matter of Chin Cheung - PM-168-24](#)

[Matter of Camille Natasha Warner - PM-169-24](#)

NONDISCIPLINARY RESIGNATION [(22 NYCRR) §1240.22(a)]

Granted:

[Matter of Alina Belen Lindblom - PM-170-24](#)

August 29, 2024

NONDISCIPLINARY RESIGNATION [(22 NYCRR) §1240.22(a)]

Granted:

[Matter of Damian V. Santomauro - PM-171-24](#)

September 5, 2024

NONDISCIPLINARY RESIGNATION [(22 NYCRR) §1240.22(a)]

Granted:

[Matter of Mary L. Maloney - PM-172-24](#)

[Matter of John Francis Murray - PM-173-24](#)

[Matter of Tim Robert Ramnitz - PM-174-24](#)

[Matter of Maria Salome De Basso Temudo - PM-175-24](#)

September 12, 2024

REINSTATEMENT WITH CONDITIONS [(22 NYCRR) §1240.16]

Granted:

[Matter of Christos P. Kotsogiannis - PM-182-24](#)

NONDISCIPLINARY RESIGNATION [(22 NYCRR) §1240.22(a)]

Granted:

[Matter of Stacey Alton - PM-176-24](#)

[Matter of Michael J. Chulak - PM-177-24](#)

[Matter of Samuel John Kearing - PM-178-24](#)

[Matter of Anne Newton McFadden - PM-179-24](#)

[Matter of Melvin Pearlman - PM-180-24](#)

Denied:

[Matter of Ananda Bikash Roy - PM-181-24](#)

September 19, 2024

REINSTATEMENT [(22 NYCRR) §1240.16]

Granted:

[Matter of Andi David Daze - PM-183-24](#)

[Matter of Yvette Gibbons - PM-184-24](#)

[Matter of Kyung Jik Kwak - PM-185-24](#)

[Matter of Liat Har Adir, also known as Liat Franco - PM-186-24](#)

[Matter of Yingxia Li - PM-187-24](#)

September 26, 2024

SUSPENSION [Judiciary Law §468(a)]

[Matter of Attorneys in Violation of Judiciary Law §468-a](#)

NONDISCIPLINARY RESIGNATION [(22 NYCRR) §1240.22(a)]

Granted:

[Matter of Emily Elizabeth Gabor - PM-188-24](#)

[Matter of Jody Taliaferro McCormack - PM-190-24](#)

[Matter of Brian Thomas Ortelere - PM-191-24](#)

[Matter of Kathryn Leibell Pasternak - PM-192-24](#)

[Matter of Mihret Mengesha Woldesemait - PM-193-24](#)

October 3, 2024

DISBARMENT [(22NYCRR) §1240.13)]

[Matter of Dianne E. Laurenzo - PM-197-24](#)

NONDISCIPLINARY RESIGNATION [(22 NYCRR) §1240.22(a)]

Granted:

[Matter of Paul Lawrence Alpern - PM-194-24](#)

[Matter of Justin Dale Cope - PM-195-24](#)
[Matter of Steven C. Goldberg - PM-196-24](#)
[Matter of Gregory Evers May - PM-198-24](#)
[Matter of Hitomi Nakamura - PM-199-24](#)
[Matter of James C. Tuttle - PM-200-24](#)

October 10, 2024

MOTION FOR LEAVE TO VACATE ORDER OF DISBARMENT DENIED

[Matter of Erwin Rosenberg - PM-202-24](#)

REINSTATEMENT [(22 NYCRR) §1240.16]

Granted:

[Matter of Janet Hyonson Roh - PM-203-24](#)
[Matter of Carolina Boechat Lopes Raimondi - PM-204-24](#)
[Matter of Afua Sarpong Akoto - PM-205-24](#)

NONDISCIPLINARY RESIGNATION [(22 NYCRR) §1240.22(a)]

Granted:

[Matter of Joseph P. McDonald - PM-201-24](#)

October 24, 2024

DISBARMENT [(22 NYCRR) §1240.13]

[Matter of Lisbeth Ann Freeman – PM-206-24](#)

SUSPENSION [(22 NYCRR) §1240.13]

[Matter of David M. Goldstein – PM-207-24](#)

NONDISCIPLINARY RESIGNATION [(22 NYCRR) §1240.22(a)]

Denied:

[Matter of Jonathan Wayne – PM-208-24](#)

October 31, 2024

SUSPENSION [(22 NYCRR) §1240.12]

[Matter of Kenneth John Chesebro - PM-213-24](#)

NONDISCIPLINARY RESIGNATION [(22 NYCRR) §1240.22(a)]

Granted:

[Matter of Victoria Howard Jueds - PM-209-24](#)

[Matter of Michael John Lunga - PM-210-24](#)

[Matter of Conor Scott Gilligan - PM-211-24](#)

[Matter of Michael C. Thompson - PM-212-24](#)

November 7, 2024

CENSURE [(22 NYCRR) §1240.8(a)(5)]

[Matter of Alice Renee Sutton - PM-219-24](#)

SUSPENSION [(22 NYCRR) §1240.9(a)]

[Matter of Darlene Debra Brown - PM-216-24](#)

REINSTATEMENT [(22 NYCRR) §1240.16]

Granted:

[Matter of Aliki Drakodaidis, also known as Aliki Sofis - PM-214-24](#)

[Matter of Kyong Jin Yo - PM-215-24](#)

NONDISCIPLINARY RESIGNATION [(22 NYCRR) §1240.22(a)]

Granted:

[Matter of Peter J. Chepuavage - PM-217-24](#)
[Matter of Edward J. Copeland - PM-218-24](#)
[Matter of F. Elias Boujaoude - PM-220-24](#)
[Matter of Christine Marie Francescani - PM-221-24](#)
[Matter of Virginia Marie King - PM-222-24](#)
[Matter of Anthony Joseph Marchetta - PM-223-24](#)

November 14, 2024

NONDISCIPLINARY RESIGNATION [(22 NYCRR) §1240.22(a)]

Granted:

[Matter of Meredith Margaret Brumfield - PM-224-24](#)
[Matter of Leslee Wilkins Miraldi - PM-225-24](#)

November 21, 2024

DISBARMENT [(22 NYCRR) §1240.13]

[Matter of Donald Albert Young - PM-227-24](#)

CENSURED [(22 NYCRR) §1240.13]

[Matter of David Peddy Kashani - PM-226-24](#)

REINSTATEMENT CONDITIONS TERMINATED [(22 NYCRR) §1240.16]

[Matter of Leonard W. Krouner - PM-228-24](#)

NONDISCIPLINARY RESIGNATION [(22 NYCRR) §1240.22(a)]

Granted:

[Matter of Kenneth B. Weckstein - PM-229-24](#)

November 27, 2024

CENSURED [(22 NYCRR) §1240.13]

[Matter of Wooseok Chang - PM-234-24](#)

REINSTATEMENT [(22 NYCRR) §1240.16]

Granted:

[Matter of Saen Michael Boden - PM-232-24](#)

NONDISCIPLINARY RESIGNATION [(22 NYCRR) §1240.22(a)]

Granted:

[Matter of Aubrey Lynn Ardema - PM-230-24](#)

[Matter of David W. Beier - PM-231-24](#)

[Matter of Richard Dan Buchwald - PM-233-24](#)

[Matter of Paul Mikal Hauge - PM-235-24](#)

[Matter of Karla Mulholland - PM-236-24](#)

[Matter of Stephen Bernard Gillman - PM-237-24](#)

December 5, 2024

SUSPENSION [(22 NYCRR) §1240.13]

[Matter of Kevin Mbeh Tabe - PM-247-24](#)

APPLICATION FOR ADMISSION DENIED

[Matter of Anonymous - PM-238-24](#)

NONDISCIPLINARY RESIGNATION [(22 NYCRR) §1240.22(a)]

Granted:

Matter of Joseph James Berrigan - PM-239-24
Matter of Phoebe Fischer-Groban - PM-240-24
Matter of Donald Edward Frechette - PM-241-24
Matter of Jane T. Holler - PM-242-24
Matter of Colleen Frances Manwell - PM-243-24
Matter of Molly Ann Moynihan - PM-244-24
Matter of Michael Fred Brandman - PM-245-24
Matter of Andrew Knight Crawford - PM-246-24

December 12, 2024

REINSTATEMENT [(22 NYCRR) §1240.16]

Granted:

Matter of David James Ekelund Jr. - PM-248-24
Matter of Yoshikazu Iwase - PM-249-24
Matter of Mark Christopher Reichel - PM-250-24

December 19, 2024

MOTION FOR LEAVE TO VACATE ORDER OF DISBARMENT DENIED

Matter of Erwin Rosenberg - PM-257-24

REINSTATEMENT [(22 NYCRR) §1240.16]

Denied:

Matter of William Haymore Brammer, Jr. - PM-255-24

Granted:

Matter of Chaz Robert Fisher - PM-259-24v
Matter of Colin McClellan Breeze - PM-251-24
Matter of Kristen Elizabeth Gerweck - PM-252-24

[Matter of Ji Min Lim - PM-253-24](#)
[Matter of Janisha Sham Sabnani - PM-254-24](#)
[Matter of Robert Henry Rankin - PM-256-24](#)

NONDISCIPLINARY RESIGNATION [(22 NYCRR) §1240.22(a)]

Granted:

[Matter of Martha S. Faigen - PM-260-24](#)
[Matter of Andreas Gerten - PM-261-24](#)

Denied:

[Matter of Michael J. Toohey - PM-258-24](#)

December 26, 2024

NONDISCIPLINARY RESIGNATION [(22 NYCRR) §1240.22(a)]

Granted:

[Matter of Bart Edwin Bodkin - PM-262-24](#)
[Matter of Ericka Aida Antonia Bryam - PM-263-24](#)
[Matter of Donald Edward Lacey Jr. - PM-264-24](#)
[Matter of Kenneth J. Mayers - PM-265-24](#)

C

**Attorney Grievance Committee
Third Judicial Department
Committee Members
April 1, 2024 - March 31, 2025**

**Scott J. Clippinger, Esq.
Chair**

**Sixth Judicial District
(Chenango County)**

Third Judicial District

**Virginia D. Benedict, Esq.
(Columbia County)**

**Leonard J. D'Arrigo, Esq.
(Albany County)**

**Barbara Graves-Poller, Esq.
(Ulster County)**

**Andrew B. Howard, Esq.
(Columbia County)**

**Alejandra N. Paulino, Esq.
(Albany County)**

**Marcus Q. Pryor
(Albany County)**

**Brian M. Wang, Esq.
(Albany County)**

Fourth Judicial District

**Cynthia Feathers, Esq.
(Saratoga County)**

**Dana D. Peck, Esq.
(Clinton County)**

**John R. Seebold, Esq.
(Schenectady County)**

**Joseph M. Sise, Esq.
(Schenectady County)**

**Elena J. Tastensen, Esq.
(Saratoga County)**

**John P. Triller
(Warren County)**

**D. Alan Wrigley, Jr., Esq.
(Washington County)**

Sixth Judicial District

**Megan E. Curinga, Esq.
(Broome County)**

**C. Wells Horton
(Chenango County)**

**Holly L. Mosher, Esq.
(Tompkins County)**

**Marvin D. Parshall, Jr., Esq.
(Otsego County)**

**Willa S. Payne, Esq.
(Madison County)**

**Tina M. Wayland-Smith, Esq.
(Madison County)**

D

**Attorney Grievance Committee
for Third Judicial Department
April 1, 2024 - March 31, 2025**

Chief Attorney

Monica A. Duffy, Esq.

Office Manager

Jean R. Picard

Deputy Chief Attorney

Alison M. Coan, Esq.

Legal Assistants

Amanda Luther

Sherry Jaquish White

Alizandra Rodriguez*

*(departed November 2024)

Principal Attorneys

Lauren S. Cousineau, Esq.

Michael K. Creaser, Esq.

Kelsey E. Roche, Esq.

Robert Max Beyer, Esq. (departed November 2024)

Nikolas S. Tamburello, Esq. (departed December 2024)

Investigators

Sarah L. Lloyd

Christine M. Adams

PROFESSIONAL MATTERS CASELOAD REPORT

GRIEVANCE COMMITTEE: 5TH JUDICIAL DISTRICT
REPORT PERIOD: 01-01-2024 to 12-31-2024
DATE: February 5, 2025

FOURTH DEPARTMENT

I. PROFESSIONAL MATTERS PROCESSED BY THE COMMITTEE:

A. Matters Pending at Start of Report Period	184
B. New Matters During Report Period (see Part II, <i>infra</i>)	462
C. Closed Matters Reactivated During Report Period ²	4
D. Total Matters to be Processed During Report Period (A+B+C)	650
E. Total Matters Disposed of During Report Period (see Parts III & IV, <i>infra</i>)	451
F. Matters Pending at End of Report Period (I.D - I.E)	199

II. NEW MATTERS DURING REPORT PERIOD:

A. Sua Sponte Investigations Authorized by Committee Pursuant to Rules for Attorney Disciplinary Matters (22 NYCRR) § 1240.7 (a) (1) ³	30
B. Cases Referred by the Court for Examination Due to Reversal of a Criminal Conviction on the Ground of Ineffective Assistance of Counsel or Prosecutorial Misconduct	0
C. Matters Arising Under Judiciary Law § 90 (4) (c) and Rules for Attorney Disciplinary Matters (22 NYCRR) § 1240.12 (a)	0
D. Matters Arising Under Rules for Attorney Disciplinary Matters (22 NYCRR) § 1240.13 (d)	0
E. Matters Arising Under Rules for Attorney Disciplinary Matters (22 NYCRR) § 1240.9 ⁴	0

¹ The term "Matters" refers to individual files generated by complaint, inquiry or other filing at the Committee level and any one respondent may be the subject of multiple matters simultaneously.

² May also include closed matters which have become subject to Court review pursuant to Rules for Attorney Disciplinary Matters (22 NYCRR) § 1240.7 (e) or CPLR art 56.

³ May include Dishonored Check Reports pursuant to Rules of Appellate Division, All Departments (22 NYCRR) § 1300.1 (g).

⁴ Refers to a new Matter arising from an existing file where the respondent has failed to cooperate with the Committee investigation (§ 1240.9 [a] [1], [3]), or where the investigation has given rise to an admission by the

F. Motions for Reinstatement Pursuant to Rules for Attorney Disciplinary Matters (22 NYCRR) §§ 1240.16, 1240.17 & 1240.22 (b)	0
G. Applications for Leave to Resign Pursuant to Rules for Attorney Disciplinary Matters (22 NYCRR) § 1240.22 (a)	0
H. Attorney Solicitation Filings Pursuant to Rules of Professional Conduct (22 NYCRR 1200.0) rule 7.3 (c) (1)	9
I. Disciplinary History Letter Requests and Other Inquiries	30
J. All Other Complaints Filed or Transferred in Pursuant to Rules for Attorney Disciplinary Matters (22 NYCRR) § 1240.7 (a) (1) or (2)	0
TOTAL NEW MATTERS	69

III. MATTERS DISPOSED OF BY CHIEF ATTORNEY:

A. Matters Disposed of Pursuant to Rules for Attorney Disciplinary Matters (22 NYCRR) § 1240.7 (d) (1) (i)	216
B. Matters Referred to Other Agencies Pursuant to Rules for Attorney Disciplinary Matters (22 NYCRR) § 1240.7 (d) (1) (ii)	2
C. Matters Transferred to Another Grievance Committee Pursuant to Rules for Attorney Disciplinary Matters (22 NYCRR) § 1240.7 (a) (2)	46
D. Other⁵	105
TOTAL DISPOSED OF BY CHIEF ATTORNEY	369

IV. MATTERS DISPOSED OF BY COMMITTEE:

A. Matters Disposed of Pursuant to Rules for Attorney Disciplinary Matters (22 NYCRR) § 1240.7 (d) (2) (i) or (ii)	0
---	----------

respondent under oath (§ 1240.9 [a] [2]), or revealed that the respondent has willfully failed to paid money to a client (§ 1240.9 [a] [4]) or exposed uncontroverted evidence of the respondent's misconduct (§ 1240.9 [a] [5]).

⁵ Includes acknowledgment of Attorney Solicitation Filings pursuant to Rules of Professional Conduct (22 NYCRR 1200.0) rule 7.3 (c) (1), the provision of disciplinary history letters upon request and other closed inquiries.

B. Issuance of a Letter of Advisement Pursuant to Rules for Attorney Disciplinary Matters (22 NYCRR) § 1240.7 (d) (2) (iv)	44
C. Issuance of an Admonition Pursuant to Rules for Attorney Disciplinary Matters (22 NYCRR) § 1240.7 (d) (2) (v)	17
D. Matters Referred to the Appellate Division for Action	
1. Pursuant to Rules for Attorney Disciplinary Matters (22 NYCRR) § 1240.8	8
2. Pursuant to Rules for Attorney Disciplinary Matters (22 NYCRR) § 1240.9 (see Part II.E, <u>supra</u>)	0
3. Pursuant to Rules for Attorney Disciplinary Matters (22 NYCRR) § 1240.10 (for Matters under investigation)	0
4. Pursuant to Rules for Attorney Disciplinary Matters (22 NYCRR) § 1240.11	3
5. Pursuant to Rules for Attorney Disciplinary Matters (22 NYCRR) § 1240.12	0
6. Pursuant to Rules for Attorney Disciplinary Matters (22 NYCRR) § 1240.13	0
7. Pursuant to Rules for Attorney Disciplinary Matters (22 NYCRR) § 1240.14	0
TOTAL REFERRED TO APPELLATE DIVISION	11
E. Responsive Filings	
1. On Motions for Reinstatement Pursuant to Rules for Attorney Disciplinary Matters (22 NYCRR) §§ 1240.16, 1240.17 and 1240.22 (b) (see Part II.F, <u>supra</u>)	0
2. On Applications for Leave to Resign Pursuant to Rules for Attorney Disciplinary Matters (22 NYCRR) § 1240.22 (a) (see Part II.G, <u>supra</u>)	0

3. On Motions for Court Review Pursuant to Rules for Attorney Disciplinary Matters (22 NYCRR) § 1240.7 (e)	
(1) (ii) and (2) (<u>see</u> Part I.C and associated footnote, <u>supra</u>)	<u>0</u>
TOTAL RESPONSIVE FILINGS	<u>0</u>
 TOTAL DISPOSED OF BY COMMITTEE	<u>28</u>

V. CASES⁶ PROCESSED BY THE APPELLATE DIVISION:

A. Cases Pending at Start of Report Period	<u>19</u>
B. Cases Initiated During Report Period ⁷	<u>15</u>
C. Cases Disposed of During Report Period (<u>see</u> Part VI, <u>infra</u>)	<u>16</u>
D. Cases Pending at End of Report Period (A + B - C)	<u>18</u>

VI. CASES DISPOSED OF BY THE APPELLATE DIVISION:

A. Disbarments, including disciplinary resignation	<u>2</u>
B. Suspensions (Including Pursuant to Rules for Attorney Disciplinary Matters [22 NYCRR] §§ 1240.9 and 1240.14)	<u>1</u>
C. Censures	<u>0</u>
D. Dismissed	<u>2</u>
E. Reinstatements Granted	<u>0</u>
F. Reinstatements Denied	<u>0</u>
G. Nondisciplinary Resignations Granted	<u>0</u>
H. Nondisciplinary Resignations Denied	<u>0</u>
I. Other	<u>14</u>
 TOTAL DISPOSED OF BY THE APPELLATE DIVISION	<u>16</u>

⁶ The term "Cases" refers to filings made at the Appellate Division level, is respondent-specific, and any such Case may encompass what was previously multiple Matters at the Committee level.

⁷ Includes Cases referred to the Appellate Division (see Part IV.D, supra), motions for reinstatement pursuant to Rules for Attorney Disciplinary Matters (22 NYCRR) §§ 1240.16, 1240.17 and 1240.22 (b) (see Part II.F, supra), applications for leave to resign pursuant to Rules for Attorney Disciplinary Matters (22 NYCRR) § 1240.22 (a) (see Part II.G, supra), and motions for Court review pursuant to Rules for Attorney Disciplinary Matters (22 NYCRR) § 1240.7 (e) (1) (ii) and (2) (see Parts I.C and IV.E.3).

VII. PRACTICE AREA STATISTICS:

A. CRIMINAL LAW

1. New Matters During Report Period (<u>see Part II, supra</u>)		
Pertaining to Prosecutors	26	
Pertaining to Defense Counsel		<u>109</u>
2. Matters Disposed of Pursuant to Rules for Attorney		
Disciplinary Matters (22 NYCRR) § 1240.7 (d) (1) or		
(2) (i), (ii) or (iv)		
Pertaining to Prosecutors	0	
Pertaining to Defense Counsel		<u>67</u>
3. Matters Disposed of Pursuant to Rules for Attorney		
Disciplinary Matters (22 NYCRR) § 1240.7 (d) (2) (v) and		
Cases Disposed of by the Appellate Division		
(<u>see Part VI.A-VI.C, supra</u>)		
Pertaining to Prosecutors	0	
Pertaining to Defense Counsel		<u>3</u>

B. IMMIGRATION LAW

1. New Matters During Report Period (<u>see Part II, supra</u>)		1
2. Matters Disposed of Pursuant to Rules for Attorney		
Disciplinary Matters (22 NYCRR) § 1240.7 (d) (1) or		
(2) (i), (ii) or (iv)		0
3. Matters Disposed of Pursuant to Rules for Attorney		
Disciplinary Matters (22 NYCRR) § 1240.7 (d) (2) (v) and		
Cases Disposed of by the Appellate Division		0
(<u>see Part VI.A-VI.C, supra</u>)		

C. FAMILY & MATRIMONIAL LAW

1. New Matters During Report Period (<u>see Part II, supra</u>)		60
2. Matters Disposed of Pursuant to Rules for Attorney		
Disciplinary Matters (22 NYCRR) § 1240.7 (d) (1) or		
(2) (i), (ii) or (iv)		<u>29</u>

3. Matters Disposed of Pursuant to Rules for Attorney Disciplinary Matters (22 NYCRR) § 1240.7 (d) (2) (v) and Cases Disposed of by the Appellate Division (<u>see</u> Part VI.A-VI.C, <u>supra</u>)	6
---	---

D. REAL PROPERTY

1. New Matters During Report Period (<u>see</u> Part II, <u>supra</u>)	22
2. Matters Disposed of Pursuant to Rules for Attorney Disciplinary Matters (22 NYCRR) § 1240.7 (d) (1) or (2) (i), (ii) or (iv)	11
3. Matters Disposed of Pursuant to Rules for Attorney Disciplinary Matters (22 NYCRR) § 1240.7 (d) (2) (v) and Cases Disposed of by the Appellate Division (<u>see</u> Part VI.A-VI.C, <u>supra</u>)	3

E. TRUSTS & ESTATES

1. New Matters During Report Period (<u>see</u> Part II, <u>supra</u>)	22
2. Matters Disposed of Pursuant to Rules for Attorney Disciplinary Matters (22 NYCRR) § 1240.7 (d) (1) or (2) (i), (ii) or (iv)	7
3. Matters Disposed of Pursuant to Rules for Attorney Disciplinary Matters (22 NYCRR) § 1240.7 (d) (2) (v) and Cases Disposed of by the Appellate Division (<u>see</u> Part VI.A-VI.C, <u>supra</u>)	4

F. COMMERCIAL LITIGATION

1. New Matters During Report Period (<u>see</u> Part II, <u>supra</u>)	0
2. Matters Disposed of Pursuant to Rules for Attorney Disciplinary Matters (22 NYCRR) § 1240.7 (d) (1) or (2) (i), (ii) or (iv)	1

3. Matters Disposed of Pursuant to Rules for Attorney Disciplinary Matters (22 NYCRR) § 1240.7 (d) (2) (v) and Cases Disposed of by the Appellate Division (<u>see</u> Part VI.A-VI.C, <u>supra</u>)	0
---	---

G. OTHER CIVIL LITIGATION

1. New Matters During Report Period (<u>see</u> Part II, <u>supra</u>)	<u>59</u>
2. Matters Disposed of Pursuant to Rules for Attorney Disciplinary Matters (22 NYCRR) § 1240.7 (d) (1) or (2) (i), (ii) or (iv)	<u>25</u>
3. Matters Disposed of Pursuant to Rules for Attorney Disciplinary Matters (22 NYCRR) § 1240.7 (d) (2) (v) and Cases Disposed of by the Appellate Division (<u>see</u> Part VI.A-VI.C, <u>supra</u>)	<u>14</u>

H. PRACTICE AREA UNKNOWN

1. New Matters During Report Period (<u>see</u> Part II, <u>supra</u>)	<u>59</u>
2. Matters Disposed of Pursuant to Rules for Attorney Disciplinary Matters (22 NYCRR) § 1240.7 (d) (1) or (2) (i), (ii) or (iv)	<u>24</u>
3. Matters Disposed of Pursuant to Rules for Attorney Disciplinary Matters (22 NYCRR) § 1240.7 (d) (2) (v) and Cases Disposed of by the Appellate Division (<u>see</u> Part VI.A-VI.C, <u>supra</u>)	<u>14</u>

PROFESSIONAL MATTERS CASELOAD REPORT

GRIEVANCE COMMITTEE: 7TH JUDICIAL DISTRICT
REPORT PERIOD: 01-01-2024 to 12-31-2024
DATE: February 4, 2025

FOURTH DEPARTMENT

I. PROFESSIONAL MATTERS PROCESSED BY THE COMMITTEE:

A. Matters Pending at Start of Report Period	81
B. New Matters During Report Period (see Part II, <i>infra</i>)	569
C. Closed Matters Reactivated During Report Period ²	0
D. Total Matters to be Processed During Report Period (A+B+C)	650
E. Total Matters Disposed of During Report Period (see Parts III & IV, <i>infra</i>)	555
F. Matters Pending at End of Report Period (I.D - I.E)	95

II. NEW MATTERS DURING REPORT PERIOD:

A. Sua Sponte Investigations Authorized by Committee Pursuant to Rules for Attorney Disciplinary Matters (22 NYCRR) § 1240.7 (a) (1) ³	2
B. Cases Referred by the Court for Examination Due to Reversal of a Criminal Conviction on the Ground of Ineffective Assistance of Counsel or Prosecutorial Misconduct	0
C. Matters Arising Under Judiciary Law § 90 (4) (c) and Rules for Attorney Disciplinary Matters (22 NYCRR) § 1240.12 (a)	0
D. Matters Arising Under Rules for Attorney Disciplinary Matters (22 NYCRR) § 1240.13 (d)	0
E. Matters Arising Under Rules for Attorney Disciplinary Matters (22 NYCRR) § 1240.9 ⁴	0

¹ The term "Matters" refers to individual files generated by complaint, inquiry or other filing at the Committee level and any one respondent may be the subject of multiple matters simultaneously.

² May also include closed matters which have become subject to Court review pursuant to Rules for Attorney Disciplinary Matters (22 NYCRR) § 1240.7 (e) or CPLR art 56.

³ May include Dishonored Check Reports pursuant to Rules of Appellate Division, All Departments (22 NYCRR) § 1300.1 (g).

⁴ Refers to a new Matter arising from an existing file where the respondent has failed to cooperate with the Committee investigation (§ 1240.9 [a] [1], [3]), or where the investigation has given rise to an admission by the

F. Motions for Reinstatement Pursuant to Rules for Attorney Disciplinary Matters (22 NYCRR) §§ 1240.16, 1240.17 & 1240.22 (b)	0
G. Applications for Leave to Resign Pursuant to Rules for Attorney Disciplinary Matters (22 NYCRR) § 1240.22 (a)	0
H. Attorney Solicitation Filings Pursuant to Rules of Professional Conduct (22 NYCRR 1200.0) rule 7.3 (c) (1)	36
I. Disciplinary History Letter Requests and Other Inquiries	37
J. All Other Complaints Filed or Transferred in Pursuant to Rules for Attorney Disciplinary Matters (22 NYCRR) § 1240.7 (a) (1) or (2)	0
TOTAL NEW MATTERS	75

III. MATTERS DISPOSED OF BY CHIEF ATTORNEY:

A. Matters Disposed of Pursuant to Rules for Attorney Disciplinary Matters (22 NYCRR) § 1240.7 (d) (1) (i)	337
B. Matters Referred to Other Agencies Pursuant to Rules for Attorney Disciplinary Matters (22 NYCRR) § 1240.7 (d) (1) (ii)	0
C. Matters Transferred to Another Grievance Committee Pursuant to Rules for Attorney Disciplinary Matters (22 NYCRR) § 1240.7 (a) (2)	50
D. Other⁵	85
TOTAL DISPOSED OF BY CHIEF ATTORNEY	472

IV. MATTERS DISPOSED OF BY COMMITTEE:

A. Matters Disposed of Pursuant to Rules for Attorney Disciplinary Matters (22 NYCRR) § 1240.7 (d) (2) (i) or (ii)	0
---	----------

respondent under oath (§ 1240.9 [a] [2]), or revealed that the respondent has willfully failed to paid money to a client (§ 1240.9 [a] [4]) or exposed uncontroverted evidence of the respondent's misconduct (§ 1240.9 [a] [5]).

⁵ Includes acknowledgment of Attorney Solicitation Filings pursuant to Rules of Professional Conduct (22 NYCRR 1200.0) rule 7.3 (c) (1), the provision of disciplinary history letters upon request and other closed inquiries.

B. Issuance of a Letter of Advisement Pursuant to Rules for Attorney Disciplinary Matters (22 NYCRR) § 1240.7 (d) (2) (iv)	24
C. Issuance of an Admonition Pursuant to Rules for Attorney Disciplinary Matters (22 NYCRR) § 1240.7 (d) (2) (v)	12
D. Matters Referred to the Appellate Division for Action	
1. Pursuant to Rules for Attorney Disciplinary Matters (22 NYCRR) § 1240.8	39
2. Pursuant to Rules for Attorney Disciplinary Matters (22 NYCRR) § 1240.9 (see Part II.E, <u>supra</u>)	1
3. Pursuant to Rules for Attorney Disciplinary Matters (22 NYCRR) § 1240.10 (for Matters under investigation)	0
4. Pursuant to Rules for Attorney Disciplinary Matters (22 NYCRR) § 1240.11	0
5. Pursuant to Rules for Attorney Disciplinary Matters (22 NYCRR) § 1240.12	0
6. Pursuant to Rules for Attorney Disciplinary Matters (22 NYCRR) § 1240.13	0
7. Pursuant to Rules for Attorney Disciplinary Matters (22 NYCRR) § 1240.14	0
TOTAL REFERRED TO APPELLATE DIVISION	40

E. Responsive Filings

1. On Motions for Reinstatement Pursuant to Rules for Attorney Disciplinary Matters (22 NYCRR) §§ 1240.16, 1240.17 and 1240.22 (b) (see Part II.F, <u>supra</u>)	1
2. On Applications for Leave to Resign Pursuant to Rules for Attorney Disciplinary Matters (22 NYCRR) § 1240.22 (a) (see Part II.G, <u>supra</u>)	0

3. On Motions for Court Review Pursuant to Rules for Attorney Disciplinary Matters (22 NYCRR) § 1240.7 (e)	
(1) (ii) and (2) (<u>see</u> Part I.C and associated footnote, <u>supra</u>)	<u>0</u>
TOTAL RESPONSIVE FILINGS	<u>1</u>
TOTAL DISPOSED OF BY COMMITTEE	<u>53</u>

V. CASES⁶ PROCESSED BY THE APPELLATE DIVISION:

A. Cases Pending at Start of Report Period	<u>13</u>
B. Cases Initiated During Report Period ⁷	<u>10</u>
C. Cases Disposed of During Report Period (<u>see</u> Part VI, <u>infra</u>)	<u>13</u>
D. Cases Pending at End of Report Period (A + B - C)	<u>10</u>

VI. CASES DISPOSED OF BY THE APPELLATE DIVISION:

A. Disbarments, including disciplinary resignation	<u>4</u>
B. Suspensions (Including Pursuant to Rules for Attorney Disciplinary Matters [22 NYCRR] §§ 1240.9 and 1240.14)	<u>3</u>
C. Censures	<u>0</u>
D. Dismissed	<u>2</u>
E. Reinstatements Granted	<u>1</u>
F. Reinstatements Denied	<u>0</u>
G. Nondisciplinary Resignations Granted	<u>1</u>
H. Nondisciplinary Resignations Denied	<u>1</u>
I. Other	<u>1</u>
TOTAL DISPOSED OF BY THE APPELLATE DIVISION	<u>13</u>

⁶ The term "Cases" refers to filings made at the Appellate Division level, is respondent-specific, and any such Case may encompass what was previously multiple Matters at the Committee level.

⁷ Includes Cases referred to the Appellate Division (see Part IV.D, supra), motions for reinstatement pursuant to Rules for Attorney Disciplinary Matters (22 NYCRR) §§ 1240.16, 1240.17 and 1240.22 (b) (see Part II.F, supra), applications for leave to resign pursuant to Rules for Attorney Disciplinary Matters (22 NYCRR) § 1240.22 (a) (see Part II.G, supra), and motions for Court review pursuant to Rules for Attorney Disciplinary Matters (22 NYCRR) § 1240.7 (e) (1) (ii) and (2) (see Parts I.C and IV.E.3).

VII. PRACTICE AREA STATISTICS:

A. CRIMINAL LAW

1. New Matters During Report Period (<u>see Part II, supra</u>)		
Pertaining to Prosecutors	16	
Pertaining to Defense Counsel	154	<hr/>
2. Matters Disposed of Pursuant to Rules for Attorney		
Disciplinary Matters (22 NYCRR) § 1240.7 (d) (1) or		
(2) (i), (ii) or (iv)		
Pertaining to Prosecutors	0	
Pertaining to Defense Counsel	43	<hr/>
3. Matters Disposed of Pursuant to Rules for Attorney		
Disciplinary Matters (22 NYCRR) § 1240.7 (d) (2) (v) and		
Cases Disposed of by the Appellate Division		
(<u>see Part VI.A-VI.C, supra</u>)		
Pertaining to Prosecutors	0	
Pertaining to Defense Counsel	4	<hr/>

B. IMMIGRATION LAW

1. New Matters During Report Period (<u>see Part II, supra</u>)		0
2. Matters Disposed of Pursuant to Rules for Attorney		
Disciplinary Matters (22 NYCRR) § 1240.7 (d) (1) or		
(2) (i), (ii) or (iv)		0
3. Matters Disposed of Pursuant to Rules for Attorney		
Disciplinary Matters (22 NYCRR) § 1240.7 (d) (2) (v) and		
Cases Disposed of by the Appellate Division		0
(<u>see Part VI.A-VI.C, supra</u>)		<hr/>

C. FAMILY & MATRIMONIAL LAW

1. New Matters During Report Period (<u>see Part II, supra</u>)		49
2. Matters Disposed of Pursuant to Rules for Attorney		
Disciplinary Matters (22 NYCRR) § 1240.7 (d) (1) or		
(2) (i), (ii) or (iv)		22

3. Matters Disposed of Pursuant to Rules for Attorney
Disciplinary Matters (22 NYCRR) § 1240.7 (d) (2) (v) and
Cases Disposed of by the Appellate Division
(see Part VI.A-VI.C, supra)

1

D. REAL PROPERTY

1. New Matters During Report Period (see Part II, supra)

5

2. Matters Disposed of Pursuant to Rules for Attorney

Disciplinary Matters (22 NYCRR) § 1240.7 (d) (1) or
(2) (i), (ii) or (iv)

4

3. Matters Disposed of Pursuant to Rules for Attorney

Disciplinary Matters (22 NYCRR) § 1240.7 (d) (2) (v) and
Cases Disposed of by the Appellate Division

(see Part VI.A-VI.C, supra)

1

E. TRUSTS & ESTATES

1. New Matters During Report Period (see Part II, supra)

7

2. Matters Disposed of Pursuant to Rules for Attorney

Disciplinary Matters (22 NYCRR) § 1240.7 (d) (1) or
(2) (i), (ii) or (iv)

13

3. Matters Disposed of Pursuant to Rules for Attorney

Disciplinary Matters (22 NYCRR) § 1240.7 (d) (2) (v) and
Cases Disposed of by the Appellate Division

(see Part VI.A-VI.C, supra)

1

F. COMMERCIAL LITIGATION

1. New Matters During Report Period (see Part II, supra)

0

2. Matters Disposed of Pursuant to Rules for Attorney

Disciplinary Matters (22 NYCRR) § 1240.7 (d) (1) or
(2) (i), (ii) or (iv)

0

3. Matters Disposed of Pursuant to Rules for Attorney Disciplinary Matters (22 NYCRR) § 1240.7 (d) (2) (v) and Cases Disposed of by the Appellate Division (see Part VI.A-VI.C, <u>supra</u>)	0
---	---

G. OTHER CIVIL LITIGATION

1. New Matters During Report Period (see Part II, <u>supra</u>)	54
2. Matters Disposed of Pursuant to Rules for Attorney Disciplinary Matters (22 NYCRR) § 1240.7 (d) (1) or (2) (i), (ii) or (iv)	21
3. Matters Disposed of Pursuant to Rules for Attorney Disciplinary Matters (22 NYCRR) § 1240.7 (d) (2) (v) and Cases Disposed of by the Appellate Division (see Part VI.A-VI.C, <u>supra</u>)	2

H. PRACTICE AREA UNKNOWN

1. New Matters During Report Period (see Part II, <u>supra</u>)	97
2. Matters Disposed of Pursuant to Rules for Attorney Disciplinary Matters (22 NYCRR) § 1240.7 (d) (1) or (2) (i), (ii) or (iv)	27
3. Matters Disposed of Pursuant to Rules for Attorney Disciplinary Matters (22 NYCRR) § 1240.7 (d) (2) (v) and Cases Disposed of by the Appellate Division (see Part VI.A-VI.C, <u>supra</u>)	13

PROFESSIONAL MATTERS CASELOAD REPORT

GRIEVANCE COMMITTEE: 8TH JUDICIAL DISTRICT
REPORT PERIOD: 01-01-2024 to 12-31-2024
DATE: February 3, 2025

FOURTH DEPARTMENT

I. PROFESSIONAL MATTERS PROCESSED BY THE COMMITTEE:

A. Matters Pending at Start of Report Period	123
B. New Matters During Report Period (see Part II, <i>infra</i>)	1060
C. Closed Matters Reactivated During Report Period ²	3
D. Total Matters to be Processed During Report Period (A+B+C)	1186
E. Total Matters Disposed of During Report Period (see Parts III & IV, <i>infra</i>)	875
F. Matters Pending at End of Report Period (I.D - I.E)	311

II. NEW MATTERS DURING REPORT PERIOD:

A. Sua Sponte Investigations Authorized by Committee Pursuant to Rules for Attorney Disciplinary Matters (22 NYCRR) § 1240.7 (a) (1) ³	0
B. Cases Referred by the Court for Examination Due to Reversal of a Criminal Conviction on the Ground of Ineffective Assistance of Counsel or Prosecutorial Misconduct	0
C. Matters Arising Under Judiciary Law § 90 (4) (c) and Rules for Attorney Disciplinary Matters (22 NYCRR) § 1240.12 (a)	0
D. Matters Arising Under Rules for Attorney Disciplinary Matters (22 NYCRR) § 1240.13 (d)	0
E. Matters Arising Under Rules for Attorney Disciplinary Matters (22 NYCRR) § 1240.9 ⁴	0

¹ The term "Matters" refers to individual files generated by complaint, inquiry or other filing at the Committee level and any one respondent may be the subject of multiple matters simultaneously.

² May also include closed matters which have become subject to Court review pursuant to Rules for Attorney Disciplinary Matters (22 NYCRR) § 1240.7 (e) or CPLR art 56.

³ May include Dishonored Check Reports pursuant to Rules of Appellate Division, All Departments (22 NYCRR) § 1300.1 (g).

⁴ Refers to a new Matter arising from an existing file where the respondent has failed to cooperate with the Committee investigation (§ 1240.9 [a] [1], [3]), or where the investigation has given rise to an admission by the

F. Motions for Reinstatement Pursuant to Rules for Attorney Disciplinary Matters (22 NYCRR) §§ 1240.16, 1240.17 & 1240.22 (b)	<u>2</u>
G. Applications for Leave to Resign Pursuant to Rules for Attorney Disciplinary Matters (22 NYCRR) § 1240.22 (a)	<u>48</u>
H. Attorney Solicitation Filings Pursuant to Rules of Professional Conduct (22 NYCRR 1200.0) rule 7.3 (c) (1)	<u>68</u>
I. Disciplinary History Letter Requests and Other Inquiries	<u>169</u>
J. All Other Complaints Filed or Transferred in Pursuant to Rules for Attorney Disciplinary Matters (22 NYCRR) § 1240.7 (a) (1) or (2)	<u>0</u>
TOTAL NEW MATTERS	<u>287</u>

III. MATTERS DISPOSED OF BY CHIEF ATTORNEY:

A. Matters Disposed of Pursuant to Rules for Attorney Disciplinary Matters (22 NYCRR) § 1240.7 (d) (1) (i)	<u>486</u>
B. Matters Referred to Other Agencies Pursuant to Rules for Attorney Disciplinary Matters (22 NYCRR) § 1240.7 (d) (1) (ii)	<u>0</u>
C. Matters Transferred to Another Grievance Committee Pursuant to Rules for Attorney Disciplinary Matters (22 NYCRR) § 1240.7 (a) (2)	<u>41</u>
D. Other⁵	<u>217</u>
TOTAL DISPOSED OF BY CHIEF ATTORNEY	<u>744</u>

IV. MATTERS DISPOSED OF BY COMMITTEE:

A. Matters Disposed of Pursuant to Rules for Attorney Disciplinary Matters (22 NYCRR) § 1240.7 (d) (2) (i) or (ii)	<u>0</u>
---	----------

respondent under oath (§ 1240.9 [a] [2]), or revealed that the respondent has willfully failed to paid money to a client (§ 1240.9 [a] [4]) or exposed uncontroverted evidence of the respondent's misconduct (§ 1240.9 [a] [5]).

⁵ Includes acknowledgment of Attorney Solicitation Filings pursuant to Rules of Professional Conduct (22 NYCRR 1200.0) rule 7.3 (c) (1), the provision of disciplinary history letters upon request and other closed inquiries.

B. Issuance of a Letter of Advisement Pursuant to Rules for Attorney Disciplinary Matters (22 NYCRR) § 1240.7 (d) (2) (iv)	33
C. Issuance of an Admonition Pursuant to Rules for Attorney Disciplinary Matters (22 NYCRR) § 1240.7 (d) (2) (v)	10
D. Matters Referred to the Appellate Division for Action	
1. Pursuant to Rules for Attorney Disciplinary Matters (22 NYCRR) § 1240.8	0
2. Pursuant to Rules for Attorney Disciplinary Matters (22 NYCRR) § 1240.9 (see Part II.E, <u>supra</u>)	0
3. Pursuant to Rules for Attorney Disciplinary Matters (22 NYCRR) § 1240.10 (for Matters under investigation)	0
4. Pursuant to Rules for Attorney Disciplinary Matters (22 NYCRR) § 1240.11	1
5. Pursuant to Rules for Attorney Disciplinary Matters (22 NYCRR) § 1240.12	1
6. Pursuant to Rules for Attorney Disciplinary Matters (22 NYCRR) § 1240.13	0
7. Pursuant to Rules for Attorney Disciplinary Matters (22 NYCRR) § 1240.14	0
TOTAL REFERRED TO APPELLATE DIVISION	2
E. Responsive Filings	
1. On Motions for Reinstatement Pursuant to Rules for Attorney Disciplinary Matters (22 NYCRR) §§ 1240.16, 1240.17 and 1240.22 (b) (see Part II.F, <u>supra</u>)	3
2. On Applications for Leave to Resign Pursuant to Rules for Attorney Disciplinary Matters (22 NYCRR) § 1240.22 (a) (see Part II.G, <u>supra</u>)	74

3. On Motions for Court Review Pursuant to Rules for Attorney Disciplinary Matters (22 NYCRR) § 1240.7 (e)	
(1) (ii) and (2) (<u>see</u> Part I.C and associated footnote, <u>supra</u>)	<u>0</u>
TOTAL RESPONSIVE FILINGS	<u>77</u>
 TOTAL DISPOSED OF BY COMMITTEE	<u>89</u>

V. CASES⁶ PROCESSED BY THE APPELLATE DIVISION:

A. Cases Pending at Start of Report Period	<u>17</u>
B. Cases Initiated During Report Period ⁷	<u>88</u>
C. Cases Disposed of During Report Period (<u>see</u> Part VI, <u>infra</u>)	<u>78</u>
D. Cases Pending at End of Report Period (A + B - C)	<u>27</u>

VI. CASES DISPOSED OF BY THE APPELLATE DIVISION:

A. Disbarments, including disciplinary resignation	<u>1</u>
B. Suspensions (Including Pursuant to Rules for Attorney Disciplinary Matters [22 NYCRR] §§ 1240.9 and 1240.14)	<u>2</u>
C. Censures	<u>0</u>
D. Dismissed	<u>6</u>
E. Reinstatements Granted	<u>4</u>
F. Reinstatements Denied	<u>0</u>
G. Nondisciplinary Resignations Granted	<u>58</u>
H. Nondisciplinary Resignations Denied	<u>0</u>
I. Other	<u>11</u>
 TOTAL DISPOSED OF BY THE APPELLATE DIVISION	<u>78</u>

⁶ The term "Cases" refers to filings made at the Appellate Division level, is respondent-specific, and any such Case may encompass what was previously multiple Matters at the Committee level.

⁷ Includes Cases referred to the Appellate Division (see Part IV.D, supra), motions for reinstatement pursuant to Rules for Attorney Disciplinary Matters (22 NYCRR) §§ 1240.16, 1240.17 and 1240.22 (b) (see Part II.F, supra), applications for leave to resign pursuant to Rules for Attorney Disciplinary Matters (22 NYCRR) § 1240.22 (a) (see Part II.G, supra), and motions for Court review pursuant to Rules for Attorney Disciplinary Matters (22 NYCRR) § 1240.7 (e) (1) (ii) and (2) (see Parts I.C and IV.E.3).

VII. PRACTICE AREA STATISTICS:

A. CRIMINAL LAW

1. New Matters During Report Period (<u>see Part II, supra</u>)		
Pertaining to Prosecutors	36	
Pertaining to Defense Counsel	183	
2. Matters Disposed of Pursuant to Rules for Attorney		
Disciplinary Matters (22 NYCRR) § 1240.7 (d) (1) or		
(2) (i), (ii) or (iv)		
Pertaining to Prosecutors	2	
Pertaining to Defense Counsel	71	
3. Matters Disposed of Pursuant to Rules for Attorney		
Disciplinary Matters (22 NYCRR) § 1240.7 (d) (2) (v) and		
Cases Disposed of by the Appellate Division		
(<u>see Part VI.A-VI.C, supra</u>)		
Pertaining to Prosecutors	0	
Pertaining to Defense Counsel	0	

B. IMMIGRATION LAW

1. New Matters During Report Period (<u>see Part II, supra</u>)	7
2. Matters Disposed of Pursuant to Rules for Attorney	
Disciplinary Matters (22 NYCRR) § 1240.7 (d) (1) or	
(2) (i), (ii) or (iv)	3
3. Matters Disposed of Pursuant to Rules for Attorney	
Disciplinary Matters (22 NYCRR) § 1240.7 (d) (2) (v) and	
Cases Disposed of by the Appellate Division	0
(<u>see Part VI.A-VI.C, supra</u>)	

C. FAMILY & MATRIMONIAL LAW

1. New Matters During Report Period (<u>see Part II, supra</u>)	91
2. Matters Disposed of Pursuant to Rules for Attorney	
Disciplinary Matters (22 NYCRR) § 1240.7 (d) (1) or	
(2) (i), (ii) or (iv)	27

3. Matters Disposed of Pursuant to Rules for Attorney Disciplinary Matters (22 NYCRR) § 1240.7 (d) (2) (v) and Cases Disposed of by the Appellate Division (<u>see Part VI.A-VI.C, <i>supra</i></u>)	8
---	---

D. REAL PROPERTY

1. New Matters During Report Period (<u>see Part II, <i>supra</i></u>)	22
2. Matters Disposed of Pursuant to Rules for Attorney Disciplinary Matters (22 NYCRR) § 1240.7 (d) (1) or (2) (i), (ii) or (iv)	12
3. Matters Disposed of Pursuant to Rules for Attorney Disciplinary Matters (22 NYCRR) § 1240.7 (d) (2) (v) and Cases Disposed of by the Appellate Division (<u>see Part VI.A-VI.C, <i>supra</i></u>)	1

E. TRUSTS & ESTATES

1. New Matters During Report Period (<u>see Part II, <i>supra</i></u>)	39
2. Matters Disposed of Pursuant to Rules for Attorney Disciplinary Matters (22 NYCRR) § 1240.7 (d) (1) or (2) (i), (ii) or (iv)	21
3. Matters Disposed of Pursuant to Rules for Attorney Disciplinary Matters (22 NYCRR) § 1240.7 (d) (2) (v) and Cases Disposed of by the Appellate Division (<u>see Part VI.A-VI.C, <i>supra</i></u>)	0

F. COMMERCIAL LITIGATION

1. New Matters During Report Period (<u>see Part II, <i>supra</i></u>)	1
2. Matters Disposed of Pursuant to Rules for Attorney Disciplinary Matters (22 NYCRR) § 1240.7 (d) (1) or (2) (i), (ii) or (iv)	0

3. Matters Disposed of Pursuant to Rules for Attorney Disciplinary Matters (22 NYCRR) § 1240.7 (d) (2) (v) and Cases Disposed of by the Appellate Division (see Part VI.A-VI.C, <u>supra</u>)	0
---	---

G. OTHER CIVIL LITIGATION

1. New Matters During Report Period (see Part II, <u>supra</u>)	109
2. Matters Disposed of Pursuant to Rules for Attorney Disciplinary Matters (22 NYCRR) § 1240.7 (d) (1) or (2) (i), (ii) or (iv)	41
3. Matters Disposed of Pursuant to Rules for Attorney Disciplinary Matters (22 NYCRR) § 1240.7 (d) (2) (v) and Cases Disposed of by the Appellate Division (see Part VI.A-VI.C, <u>supra</u>)	5

H. PRACTICE AREA UNKNOWN

1. New Matters During Report Period (see Part II, <u>supra</u>)	308
2. Matters Disposed of Pursuant to Rules for Attorney Disciplinary Matters (22 NYCRR) § 1240.7 (d) (1) or (2) (i), (ii) or (iv)	187
3. Matters Disposed of Pursuant to Rules for Attorney Disciplinary Matters (22 NYCRR) § 1240.7 (d) (2) (v) and Cases Disposed of by the Appellate Division (see Part VI.A-VI.C, <u>supra</u>)	76

FOURTH DEPARTMENT
(Fifth Judicial District)

Attorney	Disposition	Summary of Charges
Stefan D. Berg 227 A.D.3d 12 03/22/24	Contempt	Judiciary Law §750(A)(3)
Michael S. Ciaccio 233 A.D.3d 25 08/09/24	Disbarred	22 NYCRR 1200.0 - Rule 1.2 (d) - counseling or assisting a client to engage in conduct that the lawyer knows is illegal or fraudulent; Rule 3.3 (a) (1) - knowingly making a false statement of fact or law to a tribunal or failing to correct a false statement of material fact or law previously made to a tribunal by the lawyer; Rule 3.3 (a) (3) - offering or using evidence that the lawyer knows to be false; Rule 8.4 (b) - engaging in illegal conduct that adversely reflects on the lawyer's honesty, trustworthiness, or fitness as a lawyer; Rule 8.4 (c) - engaging in conduct involving dishonesty, fraud, deceit, or misrepresentation; Rule 8.4 (d) - engaging in conduct that is prejudicial to the administration of justice; and Rule 8.4 (h) - engaging in conduct that adversely reflects on the lawyer's fitness as a lawyer.
Robert H. Fix 234 A.D.3d 111 12/20/24	Disbarred	22 NYCRR 1200.0 - Rule 1.3 (a) - failing to act with reasonable diligence and promptness in representing a client; Rule 1.3 (b) - neglecting a legal matter entrusted to him; Rule 1.4 (a) (3) - failing to keep a client reasonably informed about the status of a matter; Rule 1.4 (a) (4) - failing to comply in a prompt manner with a client's reasonable requests for information; Rule 1.15 (a) - misappropriating funds belonging to another person that were received incident to his practice of law; Rule 1.15 (b) (1) - failing to maintain funds belonging to another person that were received incident to

his practice of law in a segregated account, separate from his business or personal accounts or those of his law firm; Rule 1.15 (c) (4) - failing to deliver to a client or third person in a prompt manner, as requested by the client or third person, funds in his possession that the client or third person is entitled to receive; Rule 1.16 (e) - failing to refund promptly any part of a fee paid in advance that has not been earned; Rule 8.4 (c) - engaging in conduct involving dishonesty, fraud, deceit, or misrepresentation; Rule 8.4 (d) - engaging in conduct that is prejudicial to the administration of justice; and Rule 8.4 (h) - engaging in conduct that adversely reflects on his fitness as a lawyer.

William H. Getman
224 A.D3d 54
02/02/24

Suspended
One Year

22 NYCRR 1200.0 - Rule 1.3 (a) - failing to act with reasonable diligence and promptness in representing a client; Rule 1.3 (b) - neglecting a legal matter entrusted to him; Rule 1.4 (a) (1) (iii) - failing to inform a client in a prompt manner of a material development in a matter; Rule 1.4 (a) (3) - failing to keep a client reasonably informed about the status of a matter; Rule 1.16 (e) - when withdrawal is required, failing to take steps upon termination of representation, to the extent reasonably practicable, to avoid foreseeable prejudice to the rights of the client, including giving reasonable notice to the client and allowing time for employment of other counsel; Rule 3.3 (a) (1) - making a false statement of fact or law to a tribunal or failing to correct a false statement of material fact or law that he previously made to a tribunal; Rule 8.4 (d) - engaging in conduct that is prejudicial to the administration of justice; and Rule 8.4 (h) - engaging in conduct that adversely reflects on his fitness as a lawyer.

Joseph M. Hobaica 234 A.D.3d 119 11/22/24	Contempt	Judiciary Law §750(A)(3)
William J. Lamitie 234 A.D.3d 116 12/20/24	Suspended Two Years	22 NYCRR 1200.0 - Rule 5.5 (a) - engaging in the unauthorized practice of law; Rule 8.4 (c) - engaging in conduct involving dishonesty, fraud, deceit, or misrepresentation; Rule 8.4 (d) - engaging in conduct that is prejudicial to the administration of justice; and Rule 8.4 (h) - engaging in conduct that adversely reflects on his fitness as a lawyer.

(Seventh Judicial District)

Attorney	Disposition	Summary of Charges
Aaron M. Gavenda 229 A.D.3d 1168 05/31/24	Interim Suspension	22 NYCRR 1240.9
Michael A. Guarino 224 A.D.3d 1334 01/17/24	Interim Suspension	Judiciary Law §90(4)(f)
Michael A. Guarino 228 A.D. 3d 67 05/03/24	Suspended Six Months Effective 1/17/24	Criminal conviction - offering a false instrument for filing in the second degree, a class A misdemeanor.
Michael A. Guarino 229 A.D.3d 1385 07/18/24	Reinstated	
Steven P. Maio 230 A.D.3d 145 05/17/24	Suspended Three Years	22 NYCRR 1200.0 - Rule 1.8 (j) (1) (i) - requiring or demanding sexual relations with a person as a condition of entering into or continuing any professional representation; Rule 3.5 (a) (1) - seeking to influence a judge, official, or employee of a tribunal by means prohibited by law; Rule 3.6 (a) - making an extrajudicial

statement in relation to a civil or criminal matter in which he was participating, or had participated, that he knew or reasonably should have known would be disseminated by means of public communication and would have a substantial likelihood of materially prejudicing an adjudicative proceeding in the matter; Rule 8.4 (b) - engaging in illegal conduct that adversely reflects on his honesty, trustworthiness, or fitness as a lawyer; Rule 8.4 (c) - engaging in conduct involving dishonesty, fraud, deceit, or misrepresentation; Rule 8.4 (d) - engaging in conduct that is prejudicial to the administration of justice; and Rule 8.4 (h) - engaging in conduct that adversely reflects on his fitness as a lawyer

James Patrick Miller
230 A.D.3d 1592
09/10/24

Disbarred

Judiciary Law §90(4)(b)

Charles O. Rooker
224 A.D.3d 1334
01/17/24

Disbarred
Effective
8/21/23

22 NYCRR 1240.12(c)(1) and Judiciary Law §90(4)(b)

Randolph W. Rowe
232 A.D.3d 1332
10/07/24

Disbarred

Judiciary Law §90(4)(b)

Arnis Visvaldis
Sprancmanis
224 A.D.3d 1334
01/17/24

Disbarred
(Resigned)

22 NYCRR 1240.10

(Eighth Judicial District)

Attorney	Disposition	Summary of Charges
Aaron G. Chambers 233 AD. 3d 1530 12/16/24	Reinstated	

Randi E. Cohen Brown 230 A.D.3d 1592 08/26/24	Reinstated	
Christopher A. Johnson 225 A.D.3d 1242 02/28/24	Reinstated	
Robert T. Koryl 230 A.D.3d 1591 09/25/24	Disbarred	Judiciary Law §90(4)(b)
Julia Ann Lang 224 A.D.3d 48 02/02/24	Suspended Two Years Effective 6/22/21	22 NYCRR 1200.0 - Rule 1.3 (a) - failing to act with reasonable diligence and promptness in representing a client; Rule 1.3 (b) - neglecting a legal matter entrusted to her; Rule 1.5 (d) (5) (ii) - entering into an arrangement for, charging, or collecting a fee in a domestic relations matter without a written retainer agreement signed by the lawyer and client setting forth in plain language the nature of the relationship and the details of the fee arrangement; Rule 1.5 (e) - failing to provide a prospective client in a domestic relations matter with a statement of client's rights and responsibilities at the initial conference and prior to the signing of a written retainer agreement; Rule 1.15 (a) - misappropriating funds belonging to another person and commingling personal funds with such funds; rule 1.15 (c) (1) - failing to provide to a client or third person prompt notice of the receipt of funds, securities, or other properties in which the client or third person has an interest; Rule 1.15 (c) (3) - failing to maintain complete records of all funds of a client or third person coming into her possession and to render appropriate accounts to the client or third person regarding them; Rule 1.15 (e) - making withdrawals from her attorney trust account in a manner other than by check payable to a named payee; Rule 1.16 (e) - failing to

refund promptly any part of a fee paid in advance that has not been earned; Rule 8.4 (b) - engaging in illegal conduct that adversely reflects on her honesty, trustworthiness, or fitness as a lawyer; Rule 8.4 (c) - engaging in conduct involving dishonesty, fraud, deceit, or misrepresentation; Rule 8.4 (d) - engaging in conduct that is prejudicial to the administration of justice; and Rule 8.4 (h) - and engaging in conduct that adversely reflects on her fitness as a lawyer; and 22 NYCRR Part 1400.

John M. Mavroudis 227 A.D.3d 15 03/22/24	Suspended One Year Effective 7/3/23	Reciprocal discipline pursuant to 22 NYCRR 1240.13(c)
Anthony L. Pendergrass 231 A.D.3d 115 07/26/24	Suspended Two Years Effective nunc pro tunc to 6/22/21; Reinstated	22 NYCRR 1200.0 - Rule 1.3 (a) - failing to act with reasonable diligence and promptness in representing a client; Rule 1.3 (b) - neglecting a legal matter entrusted to him; Rule 1.4 (a) (1) (iii) - failing to promptly inform a client of material developments in a matter; Rule 1.15 (d) (1) (iii) - failing to maintain a copy of all retainer and compensation agreements with a client; Rule 1.16 (e) - withdrawing from the representation of a client without taking steps, to the extent reasonably practicable, to avoid foreseeable prejudice to the rights of the client; Rule 8.4 (d) - engaging in conduct that is prejudicial to the administration of justice; and Rule 8.4 (h) - engaging in conduct that adversely reflects on his fitness as a lawyer; 22 NYCRR 1215.1; Judiciary Law §468-a and 22 NYCRR 118.1.

2024

**FOURTH DEPARTMENT
DISTRICT GRIEVANCE COMMITTEES**

Grievance Committee for the 5th Judicial District

Hon. John V. Centra, Chair	Mary E. Langan
Cora Alsante	Robert M. Lazzaro*
Justin F. Brotherton	Bryn Lovejoy-Grinnell
Herbert I. Cully	Joseph C. Macri
Kathleen M. Dougherty	Karl Manne
Anthony J. Gigliotti	Kevin M. McArdle
Dean L. Gordon	Mary E. McGowan
Kevin T. Hunt	Lourdes P. Rosario
Bradley E. Keem	Megan P. Smith
Judith A. LaManna	Juan J. Sotomayor*

Grievance Committee for the 7th Judicial District

Peter H. Abdella, Chair	Chenoa A. Maye
Spencer L. Ash	Margaret Meath*
Stefanie L. Barnes	Duffy Palmer*
Danielle E. Bernard	Edward J. Pelta
Lauren Dixon*	Leah Tarantino Cintineo
Kimberly F. Duguay	Cassandra C. Rich
Sareer A. Fazili	Tyler Savage
Heidi Feinberg	Sara Valencia

Grievance Committee for the 8th Judicial District

Pamela Thibodeau, Chair	Sarah B. Hedden
Jill K. Bond	Kristin M. Lee Yaw
J.R. Santana Carter	Anna S.M. McCarthy
Peter Cutler*	Mary Ann Oliver
Reetuparna Dutta	Karen E. Richardson
Robert R. Fogg	Anna Marie Richmond
John Gavenda	Larry E. Waters
Michael F. Griffith	

* Lay Member

2024

**FOURTH DEPARTMENT ATTORNEY GRIEVANCE COMMITTEE
PROFESSIONAL DISCIPLINARY STAFF**

Grievance Committee for the 5th Judicial District
224 Harrison Street, Suite 408
Syracuse, NY 13202
(315) 401-3344

Cydney A. Kelly, Chief Counsel
Dom Cambareri, Principal Counsel
Mary E. Gasparini, Principal Counsel
Carrie Chantler, Court Analyst
Deborah A. Cole, Assistant Court Analyst

Grievance Committee for the 7th Judicial District
50 East Avenue, Suite 404
Rochester, NY 14604
(585) 530-3180

Cydney A. Kelly, Chief Counsel
Mark W. Bennett, Principal Counsel
Eftihia Bourtis, Principal Counsel
Kelly A. Page, Court Analyst
Kristen M. Reynolds, Assistant Court Analyst

Grievance Committee for the 8th Judicial District
438 Main Street, Suite 800
Buffalo, NY 14202
(716) 845-3630

Cydney A. Kelly, Chief Counsel
Margaret C. Callanan, Principal Counsel
Erin E. Hart, Principal Counsel
Timothy J. Flynn, Principal Counsel
Anna M. Hunt, Principal Court Analyst
Carolyn M. Stachura, Senior Court Analyst
Craig E. Semple, Senior Court Analyst
Catherine R. Carney, Court Analyst
Carissa A. Pershyn, Assistant Court Analyst
Kasia C. Williams, Secretary

PROFESSIONAL MATTERS CASELOAD REPORT

(Proposed Revision to current UCS-176 Form)

GRIEVANCE COMMITTEE: Grievance Committee for the Ninth Judicial District

REPORT PERIOD: Year End 2024 (January 1, 2024 - December 31, 2024)

DATE: February 5, 2025

I. PROFESSIONAL MATTERS¹ PROCESSED BY THE COMMITTEE:

A. Matters Pending at Start of Report Period	<u>802</u>
B. New Matters During Report Period (see Part II, <u>infra</u>)	<u>1781</u>
C. Closed Matters Reactivated During Report Period ²	<u>21</u>
D. Total Matters to be Processed During Report Period (A+B+C)	<u>2604</u>
E. Total Matters Disposed of During Report Period (see Parts III & IV, <u>infra</u>)	<u>1261</u>
F. Matters Pending at End of Report Period (I.D - I.E)	<u>1343</u>

II. NEW MATTERS DURING REPORT PERIOD:

A. Sua Sponte Investigations Authorized by Committee Pursuant to Rules for Attorney Disciplinary Matters (22 NYCRR) § 1240.7 (a) (1) ³	<u>602</u>
B. Cases Referred by the Court for Examination Due to Reversal of a Criminal Conviction	
1. On the Ground of Ineffective Assistance of Counsel	<u>0</u>
2. On the Ground of Prosecutorial Misconduct	<u>0</u>
C. Matters Arising Under Judiciary Law § 90 (4) (c) and Rules for Attorney Disciplinary Matters (22 NYCRR) § 1240.12 (a)	<u>1</u>
D. Matters Arising Under Rules for Attorney Disciplinary Matters (22 NYCRR) § 1240.13 (d)	<u>1</u>

¹ The term "Matters" refers to individual files generated by complaint, inquiry or other filing at the Committee level and any one respondent may be the subject of multiple matters simultaneously.

² May also include closed matters which have become subject to Court review pursuant to Rules for Attorney Disciplinary Matters (22 NYCRR) § 1240.7 (e) or CPLR art 56.

³ May include Dishonored Check Reports pursuant to Rules of Appellate Division, All Departments (22 NYCRR) § 1300.1 (g).

E. Matters Arising Under Rules for Attorney Disciplinary Matters (22 NYCRR) § 1240.9⁴	0
F. Motions for Reinstatement Pursuant to Rules for Attorney Disciplinary Matters (22 NYCRR) §§ 1240.16, 1240.17 & 1240.22 (b)	8
G. Applications for Leave to Resign Pursuant to Rules for Attorney Disciplinary Matters (22 NYCRR) § 1240.22 (a)	49
H. Attorney Solicitation Filings Pursuant to Rules of Professional Conduct (22 NYCRR 1200.0) rule 7.3 (c) (1)	40
I. Disciplinary History Letter Requests and Other Inquiries	420
J. All Other Complaints Filed or Transferred in Pursuant to Rules for Attorney Disciplinary Matters (22 NYCRR) § 1240.7 (a) (1) or (2)	681
TOTAL NEW MATTERS	1802

III. MATTERS DISPOSED OF BY CHIEF ATTORNEY:

A. Matters Disposed of Pursuant to Rules for Attorney Disciplinary Matters (22 NYCRR) § 1240.7 (d) (1) (i)	371
B. Matters Referred to Other Agencies Pursuant to Rules for Attorney Disciplinary Matters (22 NYCRR) § 1240.7 (d) (1) (ii)	3
C. Matters Transferred to Another Grievance Committee Pursuant to Rules for Attorney Disciplinary Matters (22 NYCRR) § 1240.7 (a) (2)	115
D. Other⁵	600
TOTAL DISPOSED OF BY CHIEF ATTORNEY	1089

⁴ Refers to a new Matter arising from an existing file where the respondent has failed to cooperate with the Committee investigation (§ 1240.9 [a] [1], [3]), or where the investigation has given rise to an admission by the respondent under oath (§ 1240.9 [a] [2]), or revealed that the respondent has willfully failed to paid money to a client (§ 1240.9 [a] [4]) or exposed uncontested evidence of the respondent's misconduct (§ 1240.9 [a] [5]).
⁵ Includes acknowledgment of Attorney Solicitation Filings pursuant to Rules of Professional Conduct (22 NYCRR 1200.0) rule 7.3 (c) (1), the provision of disciplinary history letters upon request and other closed inquiries.

IV. MATTERS DISPOSED OF BY COMMITTEE:

A. Matters Disposed of Pursuant to Rules for Attorney Disciplinary Matters (22 NYCRR) § 1240.7 (d) (2) (i) or (ii)	<u>16</u>
B. Issuance of a Letter of Advisement Pursuant to Rules for Attorney Disciplinary Matters (22 NYCRR) § 1240.7 (d) (2) (iv)	<u>60</u>
C. Issuance of an Admonition Pursuant to Rules for Attorney Disciplinary Matters (22 NYCRR) § 1240.7 (d) (2) (v)	<u>53</u>
D. Matters Referred to the Appellate Division for Action	
1. Pursuant to Rules for Attorney Disciplinary Matters (22 NYCRR) § 1240.8	<u>26</u>
2. Pursuant to Rules for Attorney Disciplinary Matters (22 NYCRR) § 1240.9 (<u>see</u> Part II.E, <u>supra</u>)	<u>7</u>
3. Pursuant to Rules for Attorney Disciplinary Matters (22 NYCRR) § 1240.10 (for Matters under investigation)	<u>3</u>
4. Pursuant to Rules for Attorney Disciplinary Matters (22 NYCRR) § 1240.11	<u>0</u>
5. Pursuant to Rules for Attorney Disciplinary Matters (22 NYCRR) § 1240.12	<u>3</u>
6. Pursuant to Rules for Attorney Disciplinary Matters (22 NYCRR) § 1240.13	<u>2</u>
7. Pursuant to Rules for Attorney Disciplinary Matters (22 NYCRR) § 1240.14	<u>0</u>
TOTAL REFERRED TO APPELLATE DIVISION	<u>170</u>
E. Responsive Filings	
1. On Motions for Reinstatement Pursuant to Rules for Attorney Disciplinary Matters (22 NYCRR) §§ 1240.16, 1240.17 and 1240.22 (b) (<u>see</u> Part II.F, <u>supra</u>)	<u>8</u>

2. On Applications for Leave to Resign Pursuant to Rules for Attorney Disciplinary Matters (22 NYCRR) § 1240.22	<u>41</u>
(a) (see Part II.G, <u>supra</u>)	
3. On Motions for Court Review Pursuant to Rules for Attorney Disciplinary Matters (22 NYCRR) § 1240.7 (e)	
(1) (ii) and (2) (see Part I.C and associated footnote, <u>supra</u>)	<u>3</u>
TOTAL RESPONSIVE FILINGS	<u>52</u>
TOTAL DISPOSED OF BY COMMITTEE	<u>1311</u>
V. CASES⁶ PROCESSED BY THE APPELLATE DIVISION:	
A. Cases Pending at Start of Report Period	<u>62</u>
B. Cases Initiated During Report Period ⁷	<u>42</u>
C. Cases Disposed of During Report Period (see Part VI, <u>infra</u>)	<u>51</u>
D. Cases Pending at End of Report Period (A + B - C)	<u>53</u>
VI. CASES DISPOSED OF BY THE APPELLATE DIVISION:	
A. Disbarments, including disciplinary resignation	<u>10</u>
B. Suspensions (Including Pursuant to Rules for Attorney Disciplinary Matters [22 NYCRR] §§ 1240.9 and 1240.14)	<u>9</u>
C. Censures	<u>2</u>
D. Dismissed	<u>0</u>
E. Reinstatements Granted	<u>0</u>
F. Reinstatements Denied	<u>4</u>
G. Nondisciplinary Resignations Granted	<u>11</u>

⁶ The term "Cases" refers to filings made at the Appellate Division level, is respondent-specific, and any such Case may encompass what was previously multiple Matters at the Committee level.

⁷ Includes Cases referred to the Appellate Division (see Part IV.D, supra), motions for reinstatement pursuant to Rules for Attorney Disciplinary Matters (22 NYCRR) §§ 1240.16, 1240.17 and 1240.22 (b) (see Part II.F, supra), applications for leave to resign pursuant to Rules for Attorney Disciplinary Matters (22 NYCRR) § 1240.22 (a) (see Part II.G, supra), and motions for Court review pursuant to Rules for Attorney Disciplinary Matters (22 NYCRR) § 1240.7 (e) (1) (ii) and (2) (see Parts I.C and IV.E.3).

H. Nondisciplinary Resignations Denied	0
I. Other	<u>15</u>
TOTAL DISPOSED OF BY THE APPELLATE DIVISION	<u>51</u>

VII. PRACTICE AREA STATISTICS:

A. CRIMINAL LAW

1. New Matters During Report Period (see Part II, supra)

Pertaining to Prosecutors	31
Pertaining to Defense Counsel	<u>107</u>

2. Matters Disposed of Pursuant to Rules for Attorney

Disciplinary Matters (22 NYCRR) § 1240.7 (d) (1) or
(2) (i), (ii) or (iv)

Pertaining to Prosecutors	28
Pertaining to Defense Counsel	<u>93</u>

3. Matters Disposed of Pursuant to Rules for Attorney

Disciplinary Matters (22 NYCRR) § 1240.7 (d) (2) (v) and
Cases Disposed of by the Appellate Division

(see Part VI.A-VI.C, supra)

Pertaining to Prosecutors	0
Pertaining to Defense Counsel	<u>4</u>

B. IMMIGRATION LAW

1. New Matters During Report Period (see Part II, supra)

14

2. Matters Disposed of Pursuant to Rules for Attorney

Disciplinary Matters (22 NYCRR) § 1240.7 (d) (1) or
(2) (i), (ii) or (iv)

9

3. Matters Disposed of Pursuant to Rules for Attorney

Disciplinary Matters (22 NYCRR) § 1240.7 (d) (2) (v) and
Cases Disposed of by the Appellate Division

(see Part VI.A-VI.C, supra)

1

C. FAMILY & MATRIMONIAL LAW

1. New Matters During Report Period (<u>see Part II, <i>supra</i></u>)	<u>125</u>
2. Matters Disposed of Pursuant to Rules for Attorney Disciplinary Matters (22 NYCRR) § 1240.7 (d) (1) or (2) (i), (ii) or (iv)	<u>112</u>
3. Matters Disposed of Pursuant to Rules for Attorney Disciplinary Matters (22 NYCRR) § 1240.7 (d) (2) (v) and Cases Disposed of by the Appellate Division (<u>see Part VI.A-VI.C, <i>supra</i></u>)	<u>3</u>

D. REAL PROPERTY

1. New Matters During Report Period (<u>see Part II, <i>supra</i></u>)	<u>55</u>
2. Matters Disposed of Pursuant to Rules for Attorney Disciplinary Matters (22 NYCRR) § 1240.7 (d) (1) or (2) (i), (ii) or (iv)	<u>36</u>
3. Matters Disposed of Pursuant to Rules for Attorney Disciplinary Matters (22 NYCRR) § 1240.7 (d) (2) (v) and Cases Disposed of by the Appellate Division (<u>see Part VI.A-VI.C, <i>supra</i></u>)	<u>5</u>

E. TRUSTS & ESTATES

1. New Matters During Report Period (<u>see Part II, <i>supra</i></u>)	<u>41</u>
2. Matters Disposed of Pursuant to Rules for Attorney Disciplinary Matters (22 NYCRR) § 1240.7 (d) (1) or (2) (i), (ii) or (iv)	<u>29</u>
3. Matters Disposed of Pursuant to Rules for Attorney Disciplinary Matters (22 NYCRR) § 1240.7 (d) (2) (v) and Cases Disposed of by the Appellate Division (<u>see Part VI.A-VI.C, <i>supra</i></u>)	<u>1</u>

F. COMMERCIAL LITIGATION

1. New Matters During Report Period (<u>see Part II, <i>supra</i></u>)	<u>4</u>
--	----------

2.	Matters Disposed of Pursuant to Rules for Attorney Disciplinary Matters (22 NYCRR) § 1240.7 (d) (1) or (2) (i), (ii) or (iv)	<u>2</u>
3.	Matters Disposed of Pursuant to Rules for Attorney Disciplinary Matters (22 NYCRR) § 1240.7 (d) (2) (v) and Cases Disposed of by the Appellate Division (<u>see Part VI.A-VI.C, <i>supra</i></u>)	<u>0</u>
G. OTHER CIVIL LITIGATION		
1.	New Matters During Report Period (<u>see Part II, <i>supra</i></u>)	<u>198</u>
2.	Matters Disposed of Pursuant to Rules for Attorney Disciplinary Matters (22 NYCRR) § 1240.7 (d) (1) or (2) (i), (ii) or (iv)	<u>144</u>
3.	Matters Disposed of Pursuant to Rules for Attorney Disciplinary Matters (22 NYCRR) § 1240.7 (d) (2) (v) and Cases Disposed of by the Appellate Division (<u>see Part VI.A-VI.C, <i>supra</i></u>)	<u>9</u>

LOCAL BAR ASSOCIATION ACTIVITIES

JANUARY – DECEMBER 2024

DUTCHESSE COUNTY BAR ASSOCIATION

A. Cases Closed to Grievance Committee	0
B. Cases Closed to Medication	0
Total Referred	0

PUTNAM COUNTY BAR ASSOCIATION

A. Cases Closed to Grievance Committee	0
B. Cases Closed to Mediation	0
Total Referred	0

ORANGE COUNTY BAR ASSOCIATION

A. Cases Closed to Grievance Committee	0
B. Cases Closed to Mediation	0
Total Referred	0

ROCKLAND COUNTY BAR ASSOCIATION

A. Cases Closed to Grievance Committee	0
B. Cases Closed to Medication	0
Total referred	0

WESTCHESTER COUNTY BAR ASSOCIATION

A. Cases Closed to Grievance Committee	0
B. Cases Closed to Mediation	0
Total referred	0

**GRIEVANCE COMMITTEE FOR THE
NINTH JUDICIAL DISTRICT**

**PUBLIC DISPOSITIONS / DISCIPLINE
2024**

Adams, Jon Holden	Non-Disciplinary Resignation – Granted November 21, 2024	
Bach, Wendy A.	Non-Disciplinary Resignation – Granted September 17, 2024	
Baron, David Franklin	Non-Disciplinary Resignation – Granted September 17, 2024	
Bobolia, Stephen J.	Non-Disciplinary Resignation – Granted September 17, 2024	
Braun, Donald	Disciplinary Resignation March 27, 2024	Misappropriation of fiduciary funds; commingling personal funds with funds incident to the practice of law; engaging in conduct involving dishonesty, fraud, deceit, or misrepresentation.
Brennan, William J.	Non-Disciplinary Resignation – Granted April 23, 2024	
Brody, Elizabeth Diane	Interim Suspension August 12, 2024	Failure to cooperate with the Grievance Committee's investigation; default on judicial subpoenas.
Brown, Sashi	Non-Disciplinary Resignation – Granted September 17, 2024	
Buck, Elizabeth J.	Non-Disciplinary Resignation – Granted September 17, 2024	

Cade, Bonita G.	Non-Disciplinary Resignation – Granted September 17, 2024	
Chittur, Krishnan S.	Suspension - Two Years December 24, 2024	Misappropriation of fiduciary funds; failure to maintain disputed funds in escrow until resolution of the dispute; failure to comply with a client's reasonable requests for information; conduct involving dishonesty, fraud, deceit, or misrepresentation; failure to make accurate entries of all financial transactions; cash withdrawals from an escrow account; failure to maintain required bookkeeping records; failure to make escrow account records available to the Grievance Committee; failure to take steps after termination of representation to avoid foreseeable prejudice to the rights of clients; conduct prejudicial to the administration of justice.
Coe, Laurie MacDonald	Disciplinary Resignation August 7, 2024	Failure to render an accounting in two estate matters as directed by court order; neglecting legal matters entrusted to her; commingling personal funds with funds incident to the practice of law.
Connor, Bernadette Yuan	Non-Disciplinary Resignation – Granted September 17, 2024	
Coogan, James Matthew	Non-Disciplinary Resignation – Granted September 17, 2024	
Cook, Sharon E.	Disciplinary Resignation August 7, 2024	Failure to file an eviction proceeding on behalf of a client; failure to cooperate with the Grievance Committee; failure to satisfy a judgment obtained against her.
Cosel, Robert Vincent	Non-Disciplinary Resignation – Granted September 17, 2024	

Deem, Michael Anthony	Disbarred March 6, 2024	Frivolous conduct; conduct that had no reasonable purpose other than to merely harass or maliciously injure another; conduct that disregarded, or advised a client to disregard, a standing rule of a tribunal or a ruling of a tribunal made in the course of a proceeding; conduct intended to disrupt a tribunal; conduct prejudicial to the administration of justice; conduct that adversely reflects on his fitness as a lawyer.
Deem, Michael Anthony	Motion for Immediate Suspension – Denied March 6, 2024	Denied as academic due to disbarment.
Delicata, Alfred Anthony	Disciplinary Resignation July 10, 2024	Misappropriation of fiduciary funds for personal use.
DeSantiago-Keene, Gareth David	Reinstatement - Denied December 20, 2024	
Four-Rosenbaum, Chelsea Ann	Disbarred January 17, 2024	Felony conviction for second degree kidnapping.
Galloway, Aubrey, III	Suspended - One Year August 28, 2024	Failure to timely and/or fully cooperate with the Grievance Committee; cash withdrawals from an escrow account; failure to obtain deposit slips for an escrow account with the proper title; conduct that adversely reflects on his fitness as a lawyer.
Giannetto, Alexander Michael	Non-Disciplinary Resignation – Granted September 17, 2024	
Gleason, Elizabeth Cramer	Non-Disciplinary Resignation – Granted November 21, 2024	
Green, Timothy A.	Disbarred December 24, 2024	Communicated with a party known to be represented by counsel concerning the subject of the representation; conduct that adversely reflects on his fitness as a lawyer; failure to cooperate with the

		Grievance Committee; default on judicial subpoenas.
Handelman, Joseph	Non-Disciplinary Resignation – Granted September 17, 2024	
Hollatz, Steve Emil	Disciplinary Resignation December 11, 2024	Misappropriation of fiduciary funds for personal use.
Jacobsen, Erik P.	Publicly Censured January 31, 2024	Conviction of driving while intoxicated, in violation of Vehicle and Traffic Law Section 1192(3).
Kane, John B., Jr.	Non-Disciplinary Resignation – Granted November 21, 2024	
Kulak, Andrew H.	Motion to accept affidavit of compliance nunc pro tunc – Granted January 31, 2024	
Leuzzi, Paul, II	Non-Disciplinary Resignation – Granted November 21, 2024	
Levine, Stuart H.	Non-Disciplinary Resignation – Granted April 23, 2024	
Lovell, Casey Milton	Publicly Censured August 28, 2024	Conviction of operating while visibly impaired, in violation of Michigan Compiled Laws Section 257.625(3).
Macelus, Edwyn D.	Disbarred December 4, 2024	Reciprocal discipline based on order of the Supreme Court of New Jersey dated May 2, 2023.
Mangone, Anthony Joseph	Reinstatement - Denied November 22, 2024	
McCormick, Dennis B.	Non-Disciplinary Resignation – Granted September 17, 2024	

McCoy, Earl	Non-Disciplinary Resignation – Granted September 17, 2024
Merrill, Anthony V.	Suspended - 18 months March 27, 2024
	Engaged in illegal conduct by assuming the identify of another to apply for and receive credit cards, which he used to make purchases for his own benefit; conduct involving dishonesty, fraud, deceit, or misrepresentation; conduct that adversely reflects on his fitness as a lawyer; commingling personal funds with funds incident to the practice of law; failure to deposit client and/or third party funds received incident to the practice of law in an attorney special account; failure to file required retainer and closing statements with the Office of Court Administration; failure to maintain required bookkeeping records.
Miller, Karen Ruth	Non-Disciplinary Resignation – Granted September 17, 2024
Mitchell, Stuart M.	Non-Disciplinary Resignation – Granted November 21, 2024
Mortinger, Stephen Ashley	Non-Disciplinary Resignation – Granted September 17, 2024
Nelson, Lawrence William	Non-Disciplinary Resignation – Granted September 17, 2024
Nicosia, Nicholas	Reinstatement - Denied May 13, 2024
Puleo, Louis J.	Non-Disciplinary Resignation – Granted April 23, 2024
Ricciardi, Lawrence Robert	Non-Disciplinary Resignation – Granted

November 21, 2024

Salowski, Annemarie	Suspended - One Year September 11, 2024	Misappropriation of fiduciary funds; failure to promptly deliver to a client or third party upon request funds in her possession that the client or third party were entitled to receive; failure to act with reasonable diligence in representing her clients; commingling personal and funds incident to the practice of law; failure to properly title escrow account; conduct that adversely reflects on her fitness as a lawyer.
Sanchez, Cindy L.	Suspended - Six Months December 11, 2024	Discipline by consent for failure to act with reasonable diligence and promptness in representing clients; neglecting legal matters entrusted to her; failure to keep clients reasonably informed about the status of their matters; failure to promptly inform a client about material developments in their matter.
Schmidt, Brian T.	Disbarred June 20, 2024	Misappropriation of fiduciary funds; failure to cooperate with the Grievance Committee.
Schmidt, Brian T.	Motion for Immediate Suspension – Denied June 20, 2024	Denied as academic due to disbarment.
Schwartz, Andrew Reid	Non-Disciplinary Resignation – Granted September 17, 2024	
Smallman, Philip J.	Suspended - Five Years November 13, 2024	Employed coercion, intimidation or undue influence in entering into sexual relations incident to his professional representation of a client; conduct that adversely reflects on his fitness as a lawyer.
Swigart, Suzanne Neeb	Non-Disciplinary Resignation – Granted November 21, 2024	

Venet, Daniel Charles	Non-Disciplinary Resignation – Granted September 17, 2024	
Wolf, Jason M.	Interim Suspension August 12, 2024	Conduct immediately threatening the public interest based on admissions under oath and uncontroverted evidence of misusing an escrow account to shield personal funds from creditors; cash withdrawals from an escrow account; permitting non-signatories to make withdrawals from an escrow account; failure to maintain required bookkeeping records.
Zilberberg, Mendel	Disbarred December 18, 2024	Federal felony conviction for embezzlement and misapplication of bank funds, in violation of 18 USC § 656.
Zucker, Edith Sander	Non-Disciplinary Resignation – Granted September 17, 2024	

Grievance Committee Members
(At the End of December 2024)

MEMBERS

Yellen, Susan (Chair)

Lerman, Barbara (Vice Chair)

Aldridge-Henry, Nicole P.

Constantino, James P.

Copeland, Lisa A.*

Dorsanvil, Laurie A.

Filiberto, Richard L.

Frucco, John P.

Gearity, Victoria*

Haffner, James

Hernandez, Jasmine

Kollias, Steve*

McGee, Dean

Pressler, Kelly A.

Preston, Kevin F.

Sohng, Won J.

Varma, Vikas

Weis, Robert A.

Zlotogura, Mindy

*Lay Member

Personnel of the Grievance Committee – 9th Judicial District
(At the End of December 2024)

Courtney Osterling, Chief Counsel

Antonia Cipollone, Staff Counsel

Anthony R. Wynne, Staff Counsel

Matthew Lee-Renert, Staff Counsel

Thomas Graham Amon, Staff Counsel

Thomas J. Murphy, Staff Counsel

Lisa M. McCabe, Staff Counsel

Elizabeth W. Smith, Staff Counsel

Patrick A. Smith, Principal Court Analyst

Anita Bellenchia, Court Analyst

Melody Rolon, Court Analyst

Erin Osborn, Court Analyst

Lucia Gennusa, Secretary

Monique Lewis, Secretary

Carol Godino, Secretary

Angela Pellegrino, Secretary

PROFESSIONAL MATTERS CASELOAD REPORT

(Proposed Revision to current UCS-176 Form)

GRIEVANCE COMMITTEE: NYS GRIEVANCE COMMITTEE, TENTH JUDICIAL DISTRICT
REPORT PERIOD: JANUARY - DECEMBER 2024, ANNUAL REPORT
DATE: January 17, 2025

I. PROFESSIONAL MATTERS¹ PROCESSED BY THE COMMITTEE:

A. Matters Pending at Start of Report Period	<u>813</u>
B. New Matters During Report Period (see Part II, <u>infra</u>)	<u>2660</u>
C. Closed Matters Reactivated During Report Period ²	<u>20</u>
D. Total Matters to be Processed During Report Period (A+B+C)	<u>3493</u>
E. Total Matters Disposed of During Report Period (see Parts III & IV, <u>infra</u>)	<u>2147</u>
F. Matters Pending at End of Report Period (I.D - I.E)	<u>1346</u>

II. NEW MATTERS DURING REPORT PERIOD:

A. Sua Sponte Investigations Authorized by Committee Pursuant to Rules for Attorney Disciplinary Matters (22 NYCRR) § 1240.7 (a) (1) ³	<u>684</u>
B. Cases Referred by the Court for Examination Due to Reversal of a Criminal Conviction	
1. On the Ground of Ineffective Assistance of Counsel	<u> </u>
2. On the Ground of Prosecutorial Misconduct	<u> </u>
C. Matters Arising Under Judiciary Law § 90 (4) (c) and Rules for Attorney Disciplinary Matters (22 NYCRR) § 1240.12 (a)	<u>7</u>
D. Matters Arising Under Rules for Attorney Disciplinary Matters (22 NYCRR) § 1240.13 (d)	<u>6</u>

¹ The term "Matters" refers to individual files generated by complaint, inquiry or other filing at the Committee level and any one respondent may be the subject of multiple matters simultaneously.

² May also include closed matters which have become subject to Court review pursuant to Rules for Attorney Disciplinary Matters (22 NYCRR) § 1240.7 (e) or CPLR art 56.

³ May include Dishonored Check Reports pursuant to Rules of Appellate Division, All Departments (22 NYCRR) § 1300.1 (g).

E. Matters Arising Under Rules for Attorney Disciplinary Matters	
(22 NYCRR) § 1240.9 ⁴	<u>1</u>
F. Motions for Reinstatement Pursuant to Rules for Attorney Disciplinary Matters (22 NYCRR) §§ 1240.16, 1240.17 & 1240.22 (b)	<u>3</u>
G. Applications for Leave to Resign Pursuant to Rules for Attorney Disciplinary Matters (22 NYCRR) § 1240.22 (a)	<u>23</u>
H. Attorney Solicitation Filings Pursuant to Rules of Professional Conduct (22 NYCRR 1200.0) rule 7.3 (c) (1)	<u>42</u>
I. Disciplinary History Letter Requests and Other Inquiries	<u>510</u>
J. All Other Complaints Filed or Transferred in Pursuant to Rules for Attorney Disciplinary Matters (22 NYCRR) § 1240.7 (a) (1) or (2)	<u>1384</u>
TOTAL NEW MATTERS	<u>2660</u>

III. MATTERS DISPOSED OF BY CHIEF ATTORNEY:

A. Matters Disposed of Pursuant to Rules for Attorney Disciplinary Matters (22 NYCRR) § 1240.7 (d) (1) (i)	<u>857</u>
B. Matters Referred to Other Agencies Pursuant to Rules for Attorney Disciplinary Matters (22 NYCRR) § 1240.7 (d) (1) (ii)	<u>31</u>
C. Matters Transferred to Another Grievance Committee Pursuant to Rules for Attorney Disciplinary Matters (22 NYCRR) § 1240.7 (a) (2)	<u>171</u>
D. Other⁵	<u>649</u>
TOTAL DISPOSED OF BY CHIEF ATTORNEY	<u>1708</u>

⁴ Refers to a new Matter arising from an existing file where the respondent has failed to cooperate with the Committee investigation (§ 1240.9 [a] [1], [3]), or where the investigation has given rise to an admission by the respondent under oath (§ 1240.9 [a] [2]), or revealed that the respondent has willfully failed to paid money to a client (§ 1240.9 [a] [4]) or exposed uncontroverted evidence of the respondent's misconduct (§ 1240.9 [a] [5]).

⁵ Includes acknowledgment of Attorney Solicitation Filings pursuant to Rules of Professional Conduct (22 NYCRR 1200.0) rule 7.3 (c) (1), the provision of disciplinary history letters upon request and other closed inquiries.

IV. MATTERS DISPOSED OF BY COMMITTEE:

A. Matters Disposed of Pursuant to Rules for Attorney Disciplinary Matters (22 NYCRR) § 1240.7 (d) (2) (i) or (ii)	<u>176</u>
B. Issuance of a Letter of Advisement Pursuant to Rules for Attorney Disciplinary Matters (22 NYCRR) § 1240.7 (d) (2) (iv)	<u>120</u>
C. Issuance of an Admonition Pursuant to Rules for Attorney Disciplinary Matters (22 NYCRR) § 1240.7 (d) (2) (v)	<u>35</u>
D. Matters Referred to the Appellate Division for Action	
1. Pursuant to Rules for Attorney Disciplinary Matters (22 NYCRR) § 1240.8	<u>81</u>
2. Pursuant to Rules for Attorney Disciplinary Matters (22 NYCRR) § 1240.9 (see Part II.E, <u>supra</u>)	<u>3</u>
3. Pursuant to Rules for Attorney Disciplinary Matters (22 NYCRR) § 1240.10 (for Matters under investigation)	<u>4</u>
4. Pursuant to Rules for Attorney Disciplinary Matters (22 NYCRR) § 1240.11	<u>0</u>
5. Pursuant to Rules for Attorney Disciplinary Matters (22 NYCRR) § 1240.12	<u>1</u>
6. Pursuant to Rules for Attorney Disciplinary Matters (22 NYCRR) § 1240.13	<u>4</u>
7. Pursuant to Rules for Attorney Disciplinary Matters (22 NYCRR) § 1240.14	<u>0</u>
TOTAL REFERRED TO APPELLATE DIVISION	<u>93</u>
E. Responsive Filings	
1. On Motions for Reinstatement Pursuant to Rules for Attorney Disciplinary Matters (22 NYCRR) §§ 1240.16, 1240.17 and 1240.22 (b) (see Part II.F, <u>supra</u>)	<u>9</u>

2. On Applications for Leave to Resign Pursuant to Rules for Attorney Disciplinary Matters (22 NYCRR) § 1240.22	<u>6</u>
(a) (<u>see</u> Part II.G, <u>supra</u>)	
3. On Motions for Court Review Pursuant to Rules for Attorney Disciplinary Matters (22 NYCRR) § 1240.7 (e)	
(1) (ii) and (2) (<u>see</u> Part I.C and associated footnote, <u>supra</u>)	<u>0</u>
TOTAL RESPONSIVE FILINGS	<u>15</u>
TOTAL DISPOSED OF BY COMMITTEE	<u>439</u>

V. CASES⁶ PROCESSED BY THE APPELLATE DIVISION:

A. Cases Pending at Start of Report Period	<u>70</u>
B. Cases Initiated During Report Period ⁷	<u>67</u>
C. Cases Disposed of During Report Period (<u>see</u> Part VI, <u>infra</u>)	<u>61</u>
D. Cases Pending at End of Report Period (A + B - C)	<u>76</u>

VI. CASES DISPOSED OF BY THE APPELLATE DIVISION:

A. Disbarments, including disciplinary resignation	<u>15</u>
B. Suspensions (Including Pursuant to Rules for Attorney Disciplinary Matters [22 NYCRR] §§ 1240.9 and 1240.14)	<u>11</u>
C. Censures	<u>2</u>
D. Dismissed	<u>0</u>
E. Reinstatements Granted	<u>3</u>
F. Reinstatements Denied	<u>9</u>
G. Nondisciplinary Resignations Granted	<u>2</u>

⁶ The term "Cases" refers to filings made at the Appellate Division level, is respondent-specific, and any such Case may encompass what was previously multiple Matters at the Committee level.

⁷ Includes Cases referred to the Appellate Division (see Part IV.D, supra), motions for reinstatement pursuant to Rules for Attorney Disciplinary Matters (22 NYCRR) §§ 1240.16, 1240.17 and 1240.22 (b) (see Part II.F, supra), applications for leave to resign pursuant to Rules for Attorney Disciplinary Matters (22 NYCRR) § 1240.22 (a) (see Part II.G, supra), and motions for Court review pursuant to Rules for Attorney Disciplinary Matters (22 NYCRR) § 1240.7 (e) (1) (ii) and (2) (see Parts I.C and IV.E.3).

H. Nondisciplinary Resignations Denied	<u>0</u>
I. Other	<u>19</u>
TOTAL DISPOSED OF BY THE APPELLATE DIVISION	<u>61</u>

VII. PRACTICE AREA STATISTICS:

A. CRIMINAL LAW

1. New Matters During Report Period (<u>see Part II, <i>supra</i></u>)	
Pertaining to Prosecutors	<u>23</u>
Pertaining to Defense Counsel	<u>104</u>
2. Matters Disposed of Pursuant to Rules for Attorney	
Disciplinary Matters (22 NYCRR) § 1240.7 (d) (1) or	
(2) (i), (ii) or (iv)	
Pertaining to Prosecutors	<u>14</u>
Pertaining to Defense Counsel	<u>129</u>
3. Matters Disposed of Pursuant to Rules for Attorney	
Disciplinary Matters (22 NYCRR) § 1240.7 (d) (2) (v) and	
Cases Disposed of by the Appellate Division	
(<u>see Part VI.A-VI.C, <i>supra</i></u>)	
Pertaining to Prosecutors	<u>1</u>
Pertaining to Defense Counsel	<u>2</u>

B. IMMIGRATION LAW

1. New Matters During Report Period (<u>see Part II, <i>supra</i></u>)	<u>43</u>
2. Matters Disposed of Pursuant to Rules for Attorney	
Disciplinary Matters (22 NYCRR) § 1240.7 (d) (1) or	
(2) (i), (ii) or (iv)	<u>44</u>
3. Matters Disposed of Pursuant to Rules for Attorney	
Disciplinary Matters (22 NYCRR) § 1240.7 (d) (2) (v) and	
Cases Disposed of by the Appellate Division	
(<u>see Part VI.A-VI.C, <i>supra</i></u>)	<u>3</u>

C. FAMILY & MATRIMONIAL LAW

1. New Matters During Report Period (<u>see Part II, <i>supra</i></u>)	<u>173</u>
2. Matters Disposed of Pursuant to Rules for Attorney Disciplinary Matters (22 NYCRR) § 1240.7 (d) (1) or (2) (i), (ii) or (iv)	<u>172</u>
3. Matters Disposed of Pursuant to Rules for Attorney Disciplinary Matters (22 NYCRR) § 1240.7 (d) (2) (v) and Cases Disposed of by the Appellate Division (<u>see Part VI.A-VI.C, <i>supra</i></u>)	<u>6</u>

D. REAL PROPERTY

1. New Matters During Report Period (<u>see Part II, <i>supra</i></u>)	<u>182</u>
2. Matters Disposed of Pursuant to Rules for Attorney Disciplinary Matters (22 NYCRR) § 1240.7 (d) (1) or (2) (i), (ii) or (iv)	<u>146</u>
3. Matters Disposed of Pursuant to Rules for Attorney Disciplinary Matters (22 NYCRR) § 1240.7 (d) (2) (v) and Cases Disposed of by the Appellate Division (<u>see Part VI.A-VI.C, <i>supra</i></u>)	<u>32</u>

E. TRUSTS & ESTATES

1. New Matters During Report Period (<u>see Part II, <i>supra</i></u>)	<u>122</u>
2. Matters Disposed of Pursuant to Rules for Attorney Disciplinary Matters (22 NYCRR) § 1240.7 (d) (1) or (2) (i), (ii) or (iv)	<u>118</u>
3. Matters Disposed of Pursuant to Rules for Attorney Disciplinary Matters (22 NYCRR) § 1240.7 (d) (2) (v) and Cases Disposed of by the Appellate Division (<u>see Part VI.A-VI.C, <i>supra</i></u>)	<u>11</u>

F. COMMERCIAL LITIGATION

1. New Matters During Report Period (<u>see Part II, <i>supra</i></u>)	<u>24</u>
--	-----------

2. Matters Disposed of Pursuant to Rules for Attorney Disciplinary Matters (22 NYCRR) § 1240.7 (d) (1) or (2) (i), (ii) or (iv)	<u>15</u>
3. Matters Disposed of Pursuant to Rules for Attorney Disciplinary Matters (22 NYCRR) § 1240.7 (d) (2) (v) and Cases Disposed of by the Appellate Division (<u>see</u> Part VI.A-VI.C, <u>supra</u>)	<u>4</u>
G. OTHER CIVIL LITIGATION	
1. New Matters During Report Period (<u>see</u> Part II, <u>supra</u>)	<u>162</u>
2. Matters Disposed of Pursuant to Rules for Attorney Disciplinary Matters (22 NYCRR) § 1240.7 (d) (1) or (2) (i), (ii) or (iv)	<u>143</u>
3. Matters Disposed of Pursuant to Rules for Attorney Disciplinary Matters (22 NYCRR) § 1240.7 (d) (2) (v) and Cases Disposed of by the Appellate Division (<u>see</u> Part VI.A-VI.C, <u>supra</u>)	<u>16</u>

LOCAL BAR ASSOCIATION ACTIVITIES
JANUARY - DECEMBER 2024

NASSAU COUNTY BAR ASSOCIATION

A. Cases Closed to Grievance Committee	7
B. Cases Closed to Mediation	2
Total Cases Referred:	9

SUFFOLK COUNTY BAR ASSOCIATION

A. Cases Closed to Grievance Committee	2
B. Cases Closed to Mediation	2
Total Cases Referred:	4

TOTAL CASES REFERRED TO LOCAL BAR ASSOCIATIONS: 13

* Numbers do not include matters referred to Fee Dispute

**NYS GRIEVANCE COMMITTEE FOR THE
TENTH JUDICIAL DISTRICT
PUBLIC DISPOSITIONS/SANCTIONS
2024**

Rekhi, Jessica K. 223 AD3D 71	6 Month Suspension 1/10/2024 commencing 2/9/2024	Misappropriation of funds entrusted to her as a fiduciary incident to her practice of law, failed to make reasonable efforts to ensure that another lawyer in the firm conformed to the Rules of Professional Conduct, failed to make accurate entries of all financial transactions in the escrow account in a ledger book or similar record, at or near the time of the transactions, engaged in conduct adversely reflecting on her fitness as a lawyer by failing to reconcile her escrow account, engaged in a conflict of interest by representing clients with differing interests in the same transactions & engaged in conduct adversely reflecting on her fitness as a lawyer.
Jason Kurland, admitted as Jason M. Kurland 224 AD3D 11	Disbarment 1/24/2024 effective 7/26/2022	Conspiracy to commit wire fraud, in violation of 18 USC §1349, wire fraud, in violation of 18 USC §§1343 & 1346 & scheme to defraud in the first degree, in violation of Penal Law §190.65 , a class E felony.
Jay M. Wolman, admitted as Jay Marshall Wolman 224 AD3D 95	Public Censure 1/24/2024	Reciprocal Discipline - CT - Public Reprimand
Matthew J. Klieger, admitted as Matthew Jordan Klieger 224 AD3D 76	Disbarment 1/31/2024 effective 12/6/2022	Criminal possession of a forged instrument, 2nd degree, class D felony, violation of Penal Law §170.25
Peter A. Saad Jr., admitted as Peter Anthony Saad Jr.,	Disbarment 1/31/2024	Failed to keep a client reasonably informed about the

a suspended attorney
224 AD3D 118

the status of a matter, failed to promptly comply with a client's reasonable requests for information, failed to promptly pay or deliver to a client funds in the lawyer's possession that the client is entitled to receive, misappropriated funds entrusted to him as a fiduciary incident to his practice of law, engaged in conduct prejudicial to the administration of justice & conduct that adversely reflects on his fitness as a lawyer & failure to cooperate

Eliot F. Bloom,
a suspended attorney

Reinstatement denied
1/31/2024

Larry Hallock,
a suspended attorney

Reinstatement denied
1/31/2024

Kenneth J. Dahl, admitted
as Kenneth Joseph Dahl
225 AD3D 7

Public Censure
2/7/2024

Failure to re-register, failed to cooperate with the lawful investigation by the Grievance Committee & engaged in conduct adversely reflecting on his fitness as a lawyer.

Thomas F. Liotti, admitted as
Thomas Francis Liotti
226 AD3D 138

6 Month Suspension 3/13/2024
commencing 4/12/2024

Engaging in undignified or discourteous conduct in appearing before a tribunal, engaging in conduct that is prejudicial to the administration of justice & engaging in conduct that adversely reflects on his fitness as a lawyer.

Virginia S. Ryan, admitted as
Virginia Susan Ryan
226 AD3D 146

Disbarment
3/13/2024

Reciprocal Discipline -
New Jersey Disbarment

Richard P. Liebowitz,
a suspended attorney
226 AD3D 118

Disbarment
3/13/2024

Reciprocal Discipline -
USDNY - Southern District
4 Year Suspension

Gaurav Malhotra, also known
as Gary Malhotra

Disbarment
5/15/2024

Engaged in conduct that is prejudicial to the administration

228 AD3D 189

of justice & engaged in conduct that adversely reflects on his fitness as a lawyer.

Brian M. Troy 229 AD3D 33	3 Year Suspension 5/29/2024, commencing 6/28/2024	Aggravated harassment, 2nd degree, in violation of Penal Law, §240.30, a misdemeanor
Loretta Frances Samenga, a disbarred attorney	Reinstatement granted 6/5/2024	
Tara A. Demetriades, admitted as Tara Anne Demetriades	Indefinite Suspension 6/28/2024	Incapacitated due to mental condition or illness
Rita Dave, a suspended attorney	Reinstatement denied 6/28/2024	
James D. Castelli, admitted as James E. Daguanno, a suspended attorney	Reinstatement denied 6/28/2024	
Robert Schirtzer 230 AD3D 176	1 Year Suspension 7/11/2024, commencing 8/12/2024	Conduct prejudicial to the administration of justice by failure to cooperate with a disciplinary investigation & engaged in conduct adversely reflecting on his fitness as an attorney.
Steven R. Blyer	Interim Suspension 7/19/2024	
Ramy Joudeh	Interim Suspension 7/31/2024	
Paul Stephen Beeber 231 AD3D 167	Disbarment 8/7/2024	Engaged in conduct that adversely reflects on his fitness as a lawyer, engaged in conduct prejudicial to the administration of justice, failed to maintain required bookkeeping records & failed to produce all requested bookkeeping records in connection with a disciplinary investigation
Stewart David Pollak,	Disbarment dated 8/14/2024	Engaged in the unauthorized

a suspended attorney 231 AD3D 216	based on Resignation	practice of law during a period of time that he was suspended & misappropriated client funds in relation to his representation of an estate.
Zahra Mushtaq Cheema, a disbarred attorney 230 AD3D 760	5 Year Suspension 8/28/2024	Engaged in pattern of neglecting client legal matters, engaged in pattern of failing to keep her clients informed about the status of their matters, engaged in pattern of failing to comply with her clients' reasonable requests for information, engaged in conduct prejudicial to the administration of justice by failing to cooperate in 10 attorney discipline investigations, engaged in conduct that adversely reflects on her fitness as a lawyer by exercising lack of candor with the Grievance Committee, failure to remit funds to clients or former clients & improper use of her escrow account
David Thomas Schlendorf 232 AD3D 139	Disbarment 9/11/2024	Reciprocal Discipline - New Jersey Disbarment
Kevin J. Fitzgerald, a suspended attorney	Reinstatement granted 9/25/2024	
Edward A. Flood, admitted as Edward Albert Flood 232 AD3D 198	Disbarment 9/25/2024	Engaged in conduct prejudicial to the administration of justice, failure to cooperate, neglect, engaged in conduct involving dishonesty, fraud, deceit or misrepresentation & engaged in conduct that adversely reflects on his fitness as a lawyer.
Stuart H. Finkelstein 233 AD3d 31	Disbarment 10/2/2024 effective 7/29/2022	Mail fraud, in violation of 18 USC §1341, federal felony
Krista F. Selig, admitted as Krista Frances Selig a suspended attorney	Reinstatement denied 10/4/2024	

Barry R. Gainsburg 233 AD3d 50	6 Month Suspension 10/9/2024 commencing 11/8/2024	Reciprocal Discipline - Florida Suspension
William D. Goodman, admitted as William Douglas Goodman, a suspended attorney	Reinstatement granted 10/16/2024	
Michael Gimenez Diaz 234 AD3d 21	Disbarment 11/6/2024	Failed to satisfy an arbitration award
Nancy E. O'Brien, a disbarred attorney	Reinstatement denied 11/15/2024	
Lester E. Ozimkowski, admitted as Lester Edward Ozimkowski, a suspended attorney	Reinstatement denied 11/18/2024	
John Richard Yetman 234 AD3d 63	Disbarment 12/11/2024	Misappropriation of client & third party funds held in two attorney trust accounts & engaged in conduct involving dishonesty, fraud, deceit or misrepresentation
Marco LaRocca 234 AD3d 77	2 Year Suspension 12/18/2024 comm. 1/17/2025	Misappropriation of funds entrusted to him as a fiduciary incident to his practice of law, engaged in conduct adversely reflecting on his fitness as a lawyer, failed to consistently make accurate & contemporaneous ledger entries of financial transactions occurring in the subject account & failed to title his attorney trust accounts.
Robert J. Feldman 234 AD3d 109	Disbarment 12/18/2024	Engaged in conduct that is prejudicial to the administration of justice, failure to cooperate, engaged in "obvious pattern of deceit" by failing to pay a judgment to a former client & engaged in undignified & discourteous conduct before a tribunal towards a judge.
Edward A. Ambrosino,	Reinstatement denied	

admitted as Edward Anthony 12/20/2024
Ambrosino, a suspended
attorney

Thomas Dixon Kelliher Jr., Reinstatement denied
a suspended attorney 12/20/2024

PERSONNEL OF THE GRIEVANCE COMMITTEE - 10th JUDICIAL DISTRICT
(At the End of December 2024)

CATHERINE A. SHERIDAN, Chief Counsel
SHARON GURSEN ADES, Deputy Chief Counsel
ELIZABETH A. GRABOWSKI, Staff Counsel
STACEY J. SHARPELLETTI, Staff Counsel
MICHELE FILOSA, Staff Counsel
IAN P. BARRY, Staff Counsel
RACHEL MERKER, Staff Counsel
ANN MARIE MODICA-SCHAFFER, Staff Counsel
RONA I. KUGLER, Staff Counsel
JOSEPH CHICVAK, Staff Counsel
DOUGLAS K. KRONENBERG, Senior Court Analyst
KERRY E. SMITH, Court Analyst
BRIAN WERSAN, Court Analyst
PATRICIA LUMLEY, Assistant Court Analyst
JANET MCQUEENEY, Law Stenographer
GIANA DIETRICH, Law Stenographer
ROSARIA MICHELS, Secretary
KELLY A. LYNCH, Secretary

GRIEVANCE COMMITTEE MEMBERS
(At the End of December 2024)

DORIAN R. GOVER, ESQ., Chair
JAMES A. PASCARELLA., Vice Chair
JUSTIN M. BLOCK, ESQ.
ANNE M. BRACKEN, ESQ.
CHRISTOPHER J. CLARKE, ESQ.
JEANMARIE P. COSTELLO, ESQ.
ALBERTO FIORINI
LARRY FLOWERS, ESQ.
LISA A. HARVEY, ESQ.
STEPHANIE JUDD, ESQ.
ANTHONY M. LA PINTA, ESQ.
MICHAEL S. LEVINE, ESQ.
DAVID J. MEJIAS, ESQ.
KENNETH A. NOVIKOFF, ESQ.
MICHAEL T. PILEVSKY
CANDICE B. RATNER, ESQ.
ANTHONY SANTUCCI, ESQ.
DANIEL E. SHAPIRO, ESQ.
ARTHUR E. SHULMAN, ESQ.
CYNTHIA S. VARGAS, ESQ.

Attorney Discipline - 1st Department

Title	Comp Rate	Category
Chief Atty Grievance Comm 1st	179,423	ATT
Deputy Chief Attorney	177,564	ATT
Deputy Chief Attorney	177,564	ATT
Deputy Chief Attorney	177,564	ATT
Principal Attorney	169,259	ATT
Principal Attorney	164,075	ATT
Principal Attorney	164,075	ATT
Principal Attorney	158,891	ATT
Principal Attorney	158,891	ATT
Principal Attorney	158,891	ATT
Special Projects Counsel	158,796	ATT
Principal Attorney	153,707	ATT
Principal Attorney	148,523	ATT
Principal Attorney	134,131	ATT
Principal Attorney	127,787	ATT
Associate LAN Administrator	126,596	ADM
Principal Attorney	122,603	ATT
Associate Attorney	113,838	ATT
Principal Court Analyst	110,685	ADM
Senior Court Analyst	103,689	ADM
Senior Court Analyst	103,689	ADM
Senior Attorney	98,138	ATT
Senior Court Analyst	96,591	ADM
Senior Court Analyst	96,591	ADM
Court Analyst	89,293	ADM
Court Analyst	86,177	ADM
Court Analyst	84,786	ADM
Court Analyst	83,061	ADM
Court Analyst	78,483	ADM
Court Analyst	76,829	ADM
Assistant Court Analyst	74,578	ADM
Assistant Court Analyst	72,493	ADM
Administrative Secretary	60,875	ADM
Assistant Court Analyst	56,682	ADM
Secretary	54,123	ADM
Secretary	48,943	ADM
Secretary	48,943	ADM
Secretary	48,943	ADM
Total FTE - 41		

Attorney Discipline - 1st Department

Personal Service		4,853,547		
Non-Personal Service		162,000		
Total		5,015,547		

Attorney Discipline - 2nd Department

Title	Comp Rate	Category
Chief Attorney	179,423	ATT
Deputy Chief Attorney	177,564	ATT
Deputy Chief Attorney	177,564	ATT
Chief Attorney	175,599	ATT
Chief Attorney	169,316	ATT
Principal Attorney	169,259	ATT
Deputy Chief Attorney	164,399	ATT
Principal Attorney	164,075	ATT
Principal Attorney	158,891	ATT
Principal Attorney	158,891	ATT
Principal Attorney	158,891	ATT
Principal Attorney	143,339	ATT
Principal Attorney	141,193	ATT
Principal Attorney	128,878	ATT
Principal Attorney	128,360	ATT
Principal Attorney	127,787	ATT
Principal Attorney	122,603	ATT
Associate Attorney	115,875	ATT
Asst Appellate Court Attorney	114,545	ATT
Principal Court Analyst	114,545	ADM
Senior Court Analyst	103,689	ADM
Senior Court Analyst	100,140	ADM
Senior Attorney	98,138	ATT
Senior Attorney	93,782	ATT
Senior Attorney	93,782	ATT
Court Analyst	89,293	ADM
Court Analyst	81,093	ADM
Court Analyst	79,945	ADM
Senior LAN Administrator	79,805	ADM
Court Analyst	79,008	ADM
Secretary	72,253	ADM
Secretary	69,663	ADM
Court Analyst	67,481	ADM
Court Analyst	64,365	ADM

Attorney Discipline - 2nd Department

Secretary		61,893		ADM
Court Analyst		61,249		ADM
Court Analyst		61,249		ADM
Secretary		56,764		ADM
Secretary		51,612		ADM
Secretary		48,943		ADM
Secretary		48,943		ADM
Secretary		48,943		ADM
Secretary		48,943		ADM
Secretary		48,943		ADM
Secretary		48,943		ADM
Total FTE - 54				
Personal Service		6,273,190		
Non-Personal Service		923,000		
Total		7,196,190		

Attorney Discipline - 3rd Department

Title	Comp Rate	Category
Chf Atty Grievance Commission	173,284	ATT
Principal Attorney	169,259	ATT
Deputy Chief Attorney	159,108	ATT
Principal Attorney	158,891	ATT
Principal Attorney	131,027	ATT
Senior Attorney	106,850	ATT
Senior Attorney	93,782	ATT
Senior Attorney	93,782	ATT
Senior Attorney	93,782	ATT
Senior Court Analyst	88,341	ADM
Court Analyst	83,061	ADM
Assistant Court Analyst	73,454	ADM
Secretary	51,533	ADM
Secretary	51,533	ADM
Total FTE - 14		
Personal Service	1,527,687	
Non-Personal Service	245,400	
Total	1,773,087	

Attorney Discipline - 4th Department

Title	Comp Rate	Category
Chf Atty Grievance Commission	171,458	ATT
Principal Attorney	169,259	ATT
Principal Attorney	164,075	ATT
Principal Attorney	158,891	ATT
Principal Attorney	158,891	ATT
Principal Attorney	143,339	ATT
Principal Attorney	138,155	ATT
Principal Attorney	127,787	ATT
Principal Court Analyst	107,547	ADM
Court Analyst	89,293	ADM
Court Analyst	86,177	ADM
Court Analyst	83,354	ADM
Assistant Court Analyst	80,238	ADM
Assistant Court Analyst	74,578	ADM
Assistant Court Analyst	66,088	ADM
Secretary	65,159	ADM
Total FTE - 16		
Personal Service	1,884,289	
Non-Personal Service	296,600	
Total	2,180,889	